



REVIEW THE STAFF STRENGTH
OF
NON-SAFETY CATEGORY STAFF
OF
CARRIAGE & WAGON DEPOT
AT
MUMBAI CENTRAL (MMCT) AND BANDRA TERMIUS (BDTS)
OF
MECHANICAL DEPARTMENT
OVER
MUMBAI DIVISION

(No. G.463/WR/WS-04/2019-20)

Led by:
Shri Rakesh Kumar
Dy. Secy.(PG)-CCG

Guided by:
Shri S. Sharma
SWSO-CCG

Study Conducted by:
Shri R. S. Warang
(CWSI-CCG)
Shri Sheenu Panicker
(CWSI/CCG)
Shri Ashish Dube
(CWSI/CCG)

Central Planning Organization
Headquarter Office
Churchgate
Mumbai – 20

...oOo...

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Sr. No. of Study	-	04
Case No.	-	G.463/WR/WS-04/2018-2019
Subject	-	Review the staff strength of Non-safety category of C&W depot at MMCT & BDTS of Mechanical dept. over Mumbai Division, due to outsourcing of Coach Amenity Activities.
Area	-	MMCT & BDTS
Division	-	Mumbai
Department	-	Mechanical
Authority	-	AGM/CCG
Terms of Reference	-	Assessment of Man power requirement – Corresponding to arising existing work load.
No. of Recommendations	-	Two
Projected Manpower	-	<u>C&W Depot - MMCT</u>

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Vacancy	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Gr. C	75	47	28	0	75	28	47
Gr. D	32	27	05	0	32	05	27
Total	107	74	33	0	107	33	74

Projected Manpower - **C&W Depot - BDTS**

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Vacancy	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Gr. C	50	29	21	0	50	21	29
Gr. D	25	24	01	0	25	01	24
Total	75	53	22	0	75	22	53

Financial Implication - **C&W Depot - MMCT** - Total recurring Savings of **Rs. 959.50 Lakhs** (approx.) per annum.
 - **C&W Depot - BDTS** - Total recurring Savings of **Rs. 663.35 Lakhs** (approx.) per annum.

...o0o...

INDEX

CHAPTER NO.	DESCRIPTION	PAGE NO.	
		FROM	TO
-	Acknowledgement & Terms of Reference	4	--
-	Methodology	5	--
-	Summary of Recommendations	6	--
I	Introduction	7	--
II	Existing & Proposed manpower of C&W Depot – Mumbai Central (MMCT).	8	10
III	Existing & Proposed manpower of C&W Depot – Bandra Termius (BDTS).	11	13
IV	Financial Implications	14	--

...o0o...

(i)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The work study team is grateful to Shri. Pralhad Kohade, Sr. DME/MMCT, Ms Punam Kumari, ADME-I/MMT, Shri Iftikar, SSE(Man Power Planning)/MMCT, Shri Ravindra Kumar, SSE(C&W)/MMCT, Shri Yadav, SSE(C&W)/BDTS, Ms Aparna, OS(Mech)/MMCT and all other SSEs/JEs and other staff of C&W Depot at MMCT & BDTS of Mechanical Department over Mumbai division for their whole hearted co-operation extended during the course of the study.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

As directed by Additional General Manager, Churchgate, a work study to review the staff strength of Non-safety category of C&W Staff at Mumbai Central (MMCT) & Bandra Termius (BDTS) of Mechanical department over Mumbai Division has been conducted with a view to assess the requirement of man power as a result of **Outsourcing of Coach Amenity Activities to private contractors** over Mumbai division.

...o0o...

(ii)

METHODOLOGY ADOPTED

- Visit to work place
- Collection of data – staff strength / activities / work load.
- Observation of working system
- Scrutiny of data collected (critical analysis)
- Discussion with nominated officials
- Assessment of man power
- Recommendation for acceptance and implementation
- Finalization of Work Study.

...o0o...

(iii)

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation

Refer Para

Recommendation No.1

2.10

The work study team proposed that the Coach Amenity Activities work of C&W Depot – MMCT is outsourced to Private Contractor, so 75 Gr. C (Technicians) & 32 Gr. D (Khalasi), 107 posts of Gr. C & Gr. D (Technicians/Khalasi) are recommended for surrendered. While taking action/surrendering of Technicians/Khalasi posts of outsourced activities should be done in phased manner looking in their avenue of promotion i.e. upon promotion/retirement the post should be filled up from lower grade employed and the resultant vacancy in lower or entry grade, whichever is feasible, may be surrendered.

Recommendation No.2

3.10

The work study team proposed that the Coach Amenity Activities work of C&W Depot – BDTs is outsourced to Private Contractor, so 50 Gr. C (Technicians) & 25 Gr. D (Khalasi), 75 posts of Gr. C & Gr. D (Technicians/Khalasi) are recommended for surrendered.

While taking action/surrendering of Technicians/Khalasi posts of outsourced activities should be done in phased manner looking in their avenue of promotion i.e. upon promotion/retirement the post should be filled up from lower grade employed and the resultant vacancy in lower or entry grade, whichever is feasible, may be surrendered.

...oOo...

CHAPTER- I

INTRODUCTION

1.0 Outsourcing the Coach Amenity Activities

Indian Railway is rapidly proceeding towards modernization in all fields. The need of the day is to devote basically on the core activities relating to the transportation part. The age old system of manual repairing has become obsolete. It not only requires a huge manpower but also is time consuming and not effective up to satisfactory levels. The present trend is to provide mechanized and modern equipment, which is cost effective with less involvement of manpower and also provide high satisfaction level to the user.

Presently, more than half of the total working expenses are expended towards staff costs in the Indian Railways. The administration should plan towards achieving a quantum reduction in man power costs, especially those relating to the non-core activities, for sustaining the financial viability of the Indian Railways taking into account the impact of VIth Pay Commission recommendations.

Railway Board vide letter No. E(MPP)2019/1/12 dated 30.09.2019 has issued a revision of yardsticks of Electrical & Mechanical department taking into account ***Technology Up gradation, Outsourcing experience and Benchmarking standards*** set by different Railways. Accordingly, the yardsticks of certain activities have been revised by Railway Board. Railway Board has intimate to Zonal Railways that the requirement of Manpower for the certain activities should be calculated based on the revised yardsticks. The Manpower strength for the existing assets should be reviewed, based on the revised Yardsticks and excess posts be surrendered.

Accordingly, AGM/CCG has directed to conduct the work study to review the staff strength of Non-safety category of C&W Staff at Mumbai Central (MMCT) & Bandra Terminus (BDTS) of Mechanical department over Mumbai Division.

Accordingly, the study has been undertaken with a view to analyse the feasibility of **Outsourcing of Coach Amenity Activities to private contractors** of Non-safety category of C&W Staff at Mumbai Central (MMCT) & Bandra Terminus (BDTS) of Mechanical department over Mumbai Division.

...oOo...

CHAPTER – II

2.0 Existing & Proposed manpower of C&W Depot – Mumbai Central :-

- 2.1 C&W Depot – Mumbai Central (MMCT) is situated in Coach Care Centre, Mumbai, which very closed to Mumbai Central Railway Station of Western Railway on main line of Mumbai – Delhi Truck Route.
- 2.2 C&W Depot – MMCT is mainly doing Primary maintenance, Secondary maintenance, STR maintenance, Sick line activities of Coaches. C&W Depot – MMCT Central is also doing Linen Management for all the trains running from Mumbai Central Main Line Railway Station.
- 2.3 The Sanctioned Cadre (**as on 01.04.2019**), Man on Roll, Vacancy/ Excess position of Non-safety - C&W Staff at C&W Depot – MMCT is as follows :-

2.3.1 Non- Safety Technician Staff

Sr. No.	Category	Sanctioned Cadre	Man on Roll	Vacancy
1	Carpenter	42	26	16
2	Trimmer	15	10	05
3	Painter/Polisher	14	10	04
4	Linen Supervisor / Keeper	04	01	03
	Total	75	47	28

- 2.3.2 **Non- Safety Khalasi Staff** :- In railway working, technician staff is assisted by Khalasi in 1:1 ratio. As per 2.3.1 the cadre of Non–Safety Technician staff strength is 75, whereas Man on roll is 47 staff. Hence, for this work study, 25 Khalasi staff i.e. 3:1 ratio is considered.

Sr. No.	Category	Sanctioned Cadre	Man on Roll	Vacancy
1	Helper Khalasi / Khalasi	25	25	0
2	Waterman	01	0	0
3	Massenger	01	0	0
4	Safaiwala	05	02	03
	Total	32	27	05

2.3.3 Total Staff :-

Sr. No.	Category	Sanctioned Cadre	Man on Roll	Vacancy
1	Gr. C (Technician)	75	47	28
2	Gr. D (Khalasi)	32	27	05
	Total	107	74	33

- 2.4 The Primary & Secondary Maintenance and other work doing at C&W Depot – MMCT is as follows :-

Sr. No.	Type of Works	Workload
1	Primary Maintenance	14 Trains + 1 primary Slip Coach
2	Secondary Maintenance	0
3	STR	6
4	Platform Return	6
5	Special Trains	0
	Total	27 Trains
6	Sick line activity out turn	Average 176 Coaches

- 2.5 Railway Board vide letter No. E(MPP)2019/1/12 dated 30.09.2019 has issued the revised Yard Stick of Coach Maintenance of Mechanical department. The extract of same is as follows :-

“Activities to be Outsourced

1. All coach cleaning and watering activities including en-route watering (Already identified for outsourcing).
2. ***Coach amenity attention including carpentry, welding, trimming, plumbing/pipe fitting and provision of items like window glass, mirror, bottle holder, snack table, taps and faucet etc.***
3. Attention to fire extinguishers (Already outsourced).
4. Linen washing and Distribution (Already outsourced on most of the depots).
5. New amenity/security activities like PA/PIS, CCTV & infotainment etc.

- 2.6 According to the Railway Board letter refer above, the Mechanical Department of Mumbai Central Division has outsourced the **Coach Amenity Activities (Upper Gear maintenance) of Coaches at C&W Depot - MMCT**, the details are as follows :-

1	Name of Contract	General Furnishing, Carpentry, Plumbing & Passenger amenity work round the clock in coaches at Coaching depot Mumbai Central during Primary, Secondary & STR Maintenance
2	Name of Firm	M/s General Security & Information Services Pvt. Ltd. - Kolkata
3	Contract Period	02 years (from 16.05.2018 to 15.05.2020)
4	Cost of Contract	Rs. 5,18,62,120/-
5	Scope of Work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supply & utilization of Skilled & Unskilled Manpower. • Supply & utilization of tools & equipments. • Upper gear maintenance of coaches.

- 2.7 From the above table, it is clear that Non – safety activities such as General Furnishing, Carpentry, Plumbing & Passenger amenity work round the clock in coaches at Coaching depot Mumbai Central during Primary, Secondary & STR Maintenance are outsourced to M/s General Security & Information Services Pvt. Ltd. – Kolkata for period of two years (from 16.05.2018 to 15.05.2020) for cost of Rs. 5,18,62,120/- for Supply & utilization of Skilled & Unskilled Manpower, Supply & utilization of tools & equipments, Upper gear maintenance of coaches.
- 2.8 In view of the Railway Board's guidelines in yardsticks for Coach Amenity maintenance activities, work study was conducted and staff of Non Technician & Khalasi staff, refer in para 2.3 are found idle and recommended.
- 2.9 Upon outsourcing of certain Coach Amenity Activities as explained in the work study report as per Railway Board's guidelines, the posts of existing staff thus rendered idle have to be dealt/surrender in phased manner looking in their avenue of promotion.

The non-safety category posts to outsourced activities such as Carpenter, Trimmer, Painter/Polisher, Linen Supervisor / Keeper, etc. are including entry grade and higher grade as well.

Thus, while taking action/surrendering of posts of outsourced activities should be done in phased manner looking in their avenue of promotion i.e. upon promotion/retirement the post should be filled up from lower grade employed and the resultant vacancy in lower or entry grade, whichever is feasible, may be surrendered.

2.10 **Recommendation No.1**

The work study team proposed that the Coach Amenity Activities work of C&W Depot – MMCT is outsourced to Private Contractor, so 75 Gr. C (Technicians) & 32 Gr. D (Khalasi), 107 posts of Gr. C & Gr. D (Technicians/Khalasi) are recommended for surrendered.

While taking action/surrendering of Technicians/Khalasi posts of outsourced activities should be done in phased manner looking in their avenue of promotion i.e. upon promotion/retirement the post should be filled up from lower grade employed and the resultant vacancy in lower or entry grade, whichever is feasible, may be surrendered.

...o0o...

CHAPTER – III

3.0 Existing & Proposed manpower of C&W Depot – Bandra Terminus:-

3.0 C&W Depot – Bandra Terminus (BDTS) is situated in Coach Care Centre, Bandra Terminus, which very closed to Bandra Railway Station of Western Railway on main line of Mumbai – Delhi Truck Route.

3.1 C&W Depot – BDTS is mainly doing Primary maintenance, Secondary maintenance, STR maintenance, Sick line activities of Coaches. C&W Coaching Depot – BDTS is also doing Linen Management for all the trains running from Bandra Terminus Railway Station (BDTS).

3.3 The Sanctioned Cadre (**as on 01.04.2019**),, Man on Roll, Vacancy/ Excess position of Non-safety -C&W Staff at C&W Depot – BDTS is as follows :-

3.3.1 Non- Safety Technician Staff :-

Sr. No.	Category	Sanctioned Cadre	Man on Roll	Vacancy
1	Carpenter	34	18	16
2	Trimmer	06	04	02
3	Painter/Polisher	10	07	03
4	Linen Supervisor / Keeper	0	0	0
	Total	50	29	21

3.3.2 **Non- Safety Khalasi Staff** :- In railway working, technician staff is assisted by Khalasi in 1:1 ratio. As per 3.3.1 the cadre of Non-Safety Technician staff strength is 50, whereas Man on roll is 29 staff. Hence, for this work study, 17 Khalasi staff i.e. 3:1 ratio is considered.

Sr. No.	Category	Sanctioned Cadre	Man on Roll	Vacancy
1	Helper Khalasi / Khalasi	17	17	0
2	Cleaner Mukadam	01	01	0
3	Massenger	01	0	01
4	Safaiwala	06	06	0
	Total	25	24	01

3.3.3 Total Staff :-

Sr. No.	Category	Sanctioned Cadre	Man on Roll	Vacancy
1	Gr. C (Technician)	50	29	21
2	Gr. D (Khalasi)	25	24	01
	Total	75	53	22

- 3.4 The Primary & Secondary Maintenance and other work doing at C&W Depot - BDTs is as follows :-

Sr. No.	Type of Works	workload
1	Primary Maintenance	30
2	Secondary Maintenance	01
3	STR	18
4	Platform Return	00
5	Special Trains	10
	Total	59
6	Sick line activity out turn	Average 183 Coaches

- 3.5 Railway Board vide letter No. E(MPP)2019/1/12 dated 30.09.2019 has issued the revised Yard Stick of Coach Maintenance of Mechanical department. The extract of same is as follows :-

“Activities to be Outsourced

1. All coach cleaning and watering activities including en-route watering (Already identified for outsourcing).
2. ***Coach amenity attention including carpentry, welding, trimming, plumbing/pipe fitting and provision of items like window glass, mirror, bottle holder, snack table, taps and faucet etc.***
3. Attention to fire extinguishers (Already outsourced).
4. Linen washing and Distribution (Already outsourced on most of the depots).
5. New amenity/security activities like PA/PIS, CCTV & infotainment etc.

- 3.6 According to the Railway Board letter refer above, the Mechanical Department of Mumbai Central Division has outsourced the **Coach Amenity Activities (Upper Gear maintenance) of Coaches at C&W Depot - BDTs**, the details are as follows :-

1	Name of Contract	General Furnishing, Carpentry, Plumbing & Passenger amenity work round the clock in coaches at Coaching depot Mumbai Central during Primary, Secondary & STR Maintenance
2	Name of Firm	M/s General Security & Information Services Pvt. Ltd. - Kolkata
3	Contract Period	02 years (from 23.02.2019 to 22.02.2021)
4	Cost of Contract	Rs. 5,60,55,070/-
5	Scope of Work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supply & utilization of Skilled & Unskilled Manpower. • Supply & utilization of tools & equipments. • Upper gear maintenance of coaches.

- 3.7 From the above table, it is clear that Non – safety activities such as General Furnishing, Carpentry, Plumbing & Passenger amenity work round the clock in coaches at Coaching depot Mumbai Central during Primary, Secondary & STR Maintenance are outsourced to M/s General Security & Information Services Pvt. Ltd. – Kolkata for period of two years (from 16.05.2018 to 15.05.2020) for cost of Rs. 5,18,62,120/- for Supply & utilization of Skilled & Unskilled Manpower, Supply & utilization of tools & equipments, Upper gear maintenance of coaches.
- 3.8 In view of the Railway Board's guidelines in yardsticks for Coach Amenity maintenance activities, work study was conducted and staff of Non Technician & Khalasi staff, refer in para 3.3 are found idle and recommended.
- 3.9 Upon outsourcing of certain Coach Amenity Activities as explained in the work study report as per Railway Board's guidelines, the posts of existing staff thus rendered idle have to be dealt/surrender in phased manner looking in their avenue of promotion.

The non-safety category posts to outsourced activities such as Carpenter, Trimmer, Painter/Polisher, Linen Supervisor / Keeper, etc. are including entry grade and higher grade as well.

Thus, while taking action/surrendering of posts of outsourced activities should be done in phased manner looking in their avenue of promotion i.e. upon promotion/retirement the post should be filled up from lower grade employed and the resultant vacancy in lower or entry grade, whichever is feasible, may be surrendered.

3.10 **Recommendation No.1**

The work study team proposed that the Coach Amenity Activities work of C&W Depot – BDTS is outsourced to Private Contractor, so 50 Gr. C (Technicians) & 25 Gr. D (Khalasi), 75 posts of Gr. C & Gr. D (Technicians/Khalasi) are recommended for surrendered.

While taking action/surrendering of Technicians/Khalasi posts of outsourced activities should be done in phased manner looking in their avenue of promotion i.e. upon promotion/retirement the post should be filled up from lower grade employed and the resultant vacancy in lower or entry grade, whichever is feasible, may be surrendered.

...o0o...

CHAPTER – IV

4.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

- 4.1. The work study team proposed that the Coach Amenity Activities work of C&W Depot – MMCT is outsourced to Private Contractor, so 75 Gr. C (Technicians) & 32 Gr. D (Khalasi), 107 posts of Gr. C & Gr. D (Technicians/Khalasi) are recommended for surrendered.
- 4.2 The work study team proposed that the Coach Amenity Activities work of C&W Depot – BDTS is outsourced to Private Contractor, so 50 Gr. C (Technicians) & 25 Gr. D (Khalasi), 75 posts of Gr. C & Gr. D (Technicians/Khalasi) are recommended for surrendered.
- 4.3 While taking action/surrendering of Technicians/Khalasi posts of outsourced activities should be done in phased manner looking in their avenue of promotion i.e. upon promotion/retirement the post should be filled up from lower grade employed and the resultant vacancy in lower or entry grade, whichever is feasible, may be surrendered.
- 4.4 On implication of the study report and surrendering the posts of C&W Depot - MMCT & BDTS of Mechanical Department over Mumbai Division, annual recurring saving will be achieved as tabulated below :-

C&W Depot – MMCT

<i>Category</i>	<i>No. of Surplus posts</i>	<i>Average cost per Employee</i>	<i>Annual saving inRs.</i>
Gr. C	75	Rs. 10,03,714	Rs.752,78,550
Gr. D	32	Rs. 06,45,968	Rs. 206,49,200
Total	107		Rs. 959,49,526

C&W Depot – BDTS

<i>Category</i>	<i>No. of Surplus posts</i>	<i>Average cost per Employee</i>	<i>Annual saving inRs.</i>
Gr. C	50	Rs. 10,03,714	Rs. 801,85,700
Gr. D	25	Rs. 06,45,968	Rs. 161,49,200
Total			Rs. 663,34,900

- 4.5 On implementation of the recommendations brought out in the work study report, annual recurring saving, per annum can be achieved as follows :-
C&W Depot - MMCT - Annual recurring saving of **Rs. 959.50 Lakhs** per annum can be achieved.

C&W Depot - BDTS - Annual recurring saving of **Rs. 663.35 Lakhs** per annum can be achieved.

...oOo...