

**STUDY REPORT ON**  
**REVIEW OF STAFF STRENGTH OF SAFAIWALA**  
**(HOUSE KEEPING ASST.)**  
**CADRE OF MECHANICAL DEPARTMENT**  
**OVER**  
**BHAVNAGAR DIVISION**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Study No.G.463/WR/WS-20/2019-20**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Led by:**  
**Shri Rakesh Kumar**  
**Dy. Secy.(PG)-CCG**

**Guided by:**  
**Shri S. Sharma**  
**SWSO-CCG**

**Study Conducted by:**  
**Shri Sheenu Panicker**  
**( CWSI-CCG)**

**Assisted By :**

**Shri Ashish Dube**  
**( CWSI-CCG)**  
**Shri Arun Sarfare**  
**( CWSI-CCG)**

---

**Central Planning  
Organization  
Headquarter  
At Churchgate  
Mumbai-400 020**

**..o0o..**

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

Serial No.	- 20
Study No.	- WR/WS-20/2019-2020
Case No.	- G.463/WR/WS-13/2019-2020
Subject	- Review of Staff Strength of <b>Safaiwala (House Keeping Assistant )</b> Cadre of Mechanical Dept. over Bhavnagar Division due to outsourcing of cleaning activities.
Area	- Bhavnagar Division
Department	- Mechanical
Authority	- AGM/CCG
Terms of Reference	- Assessment of Man power requirement – Corresponding to existing staff strength.
No. of Recommendations	- 2
Projected Manpower	- <b><u>Phase -1</u></b>

<b>Categor y</b>	<b>Existing Cadre</b>	<b>Man on roll</b>	<b>Vacancy</b>	<b>Proposed Cadre</b>	<b>Proposed for surrender</b>	<b>Vacant post</b>	<b>Live post</b>
<b>Safaiwala</b>	40	20	20	20	20	20	0

### Projected Manpower - **Phase -2**

<b>Categor y</b>	<b>Existing Cadre</b>	<b>Man on roll</b>	<b>Vacancy</b>	<b>Proposed Cadre</b>	<b>Proposed for surrender</b>	<b>Vacant post</b>	<b>Live post</b>
<b>Safaiwala</b>	20	20	0	0	20	0	20

Financial Implication - **Phase I** -Total recurring Savings of **Rs.129.19 Lakhs** (approx.) per annum.  
**Phase II** -Total recurring Savings of **Rs. 129.19 Lakhs** (approx.) per annum.

...o0o...

**INDEX**

Chapter	Content	Reference Para	
		From	To
-	Acknowledgement and Terms of reference	04	
-	Methodology	05	
-	Summary of Recommendations	06	
I	Introduction	07	
II	Existing work load and Critical Analysis	08 to 12	
III	Financial Implication	13	

### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

The work study team wishes to acknowledge its gratitude to the following officer for coordination and assistance given by him :

Shri Pankaj Vijay	ADME-BVC
-------------------	----------

The Work study team wishes to acknowledge its gratitude to all the staff of Mechanical and Personnel department of Bhavnagar Division for the assistance given by them during the course of the study.

### **TERMS OF REFERENCE**

As per AGM CCG's directives, Secy./PG has instructed to conduct a work study to review the staff strength of Safaiwala & Cleaner of Mechanical department over Bhavnagar division. Accordingly, a study has been conducted with a view to assess the requirement of man power as a result of outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractors over Bhavnagar division.

**...ooo...**

## **METHODOLOGY**

- |                |   |                                                                                                                                                           |
|----------------|---|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Collection     | - | of data required for conducting the Work Study.                                                                                                           |
| Observation    | - | of area wise and activity wise working system.                                                                                                            |
| Scrutiny       | - | of data collected, existing staff strength.                                                                                                               |
| Deployment     | - | Quantum of workload arising.                                                                                                                              |
| Discussion     | - | with Co-ordination Personnel & Mechanical officers & Staff in regard to workload arising and actual requirements of staff.                                |
| Consideration  | - | Of suggestions and guidelines given by Co-ordination Officer                                                                                              |
| Assessment     | - | Critical examination of existing mode of working and Comparison with cost of manpower provided by Railway vis-a-vis opting for out sourcing the activity. |
| Provision      | - | of Leave Reserve and Rest Givers on the bare proposed manpower                                                                                            |
| Identification | - | of surplus posts available over and above the need based requirement and discussion with ADME-BVC at the time of Study.                                   |
| Proposal       | - | for adoption of change in existing working system.                                                                                                        |
| Finalization   | - | of Work Study report with recommendations.                                                                                                                |

**...ooo...**

## **SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **Recommendations**

**Refer Para : 3.8.1**

#### **Recommendation No.1**

*The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on All Mechanical depots under BVC division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and 20 vacant posts of Safaiwala are to be surrendered immediately..*

#### **Recommendation No. 2**

**Refer Para : 3.8.2**

*Work Study Team suggested that all Mechanical depots under BVC division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors for providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.*

*Thus, after outsourcing the cleaning activities of all Mechanical depots under BVC division, the work study team recommends surrender of 40-20 = 20 posts of Safaiwala after the surrendering of vacant posts as specified in recommendation no. 1.*

**...o0o...**

## **CHAPTER – I**

### **INTRODUCTION**

- 1.0 Indian Railway is rapidly proceeding towards modernization in all fields. The need of the day is to devote basically on the core activities relating to the transportation part. The age old system of manual cleaning has become obsolete. It not only requires a huge man power but also is time consuming and not effective up to satisfactory levels. The present trend is to provide mechanized cleaning equipments, which provide hygienic environment instilling high satisfaction levels to the users. Moreover, it is also cost effective with less involvement of man power.
- 1.1 The Hon'ble Railway Minister announced during the Railway Budget 2014-2015 that a special drive is to be launched for improving passenger amenities and cleanliness with continued focus to enhance passenger comforts, facilities, ambience and aesthetics. A great emphasis has been given to improve the over-all status of sanitation/cleanliness of Railway Stations. Railway Board has issued guidelines for Mechanized cleaning of the different categories of Railway Stations for providing a greater importance to improve the overall levels of sanitation/cleanliness.
- 1.2 Presently, more than half of the total working expenses are expended towards staff costs in the Indian Railways. The administration should plan towards achieving a quantum reduction in man power costs, especially those relating to the non core activities, for sustaining the financial viability of the Indian Railways taking into account the impact of VIIth Pay Commission recommendations.
- 1.3 The study has been undertaken with a view to analyze the feasibility of outsourcing the cleanliness activity on all Units of Mechanical Departments over BVC Division over Western Railway and to re-deploy those Safaiwala's as per requirement. The study has been undertaken as per the order of AGM/CCG.

**...ooo...**

## **CHAPTER – II**

- 2.1 The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on all Mechanical depots under BVC division to be outsourced to Private Contractor
- 2.2 The existing system of cleaning activities are as under:
- Mechanized Exterior cleaning of Primary/Secondary Maintained coaches.
  - Mechanized internal cleaning & watering of Primary/Secondary Maintained Coaches.
  - Mechanized Cleaning of Platform Return Train Coaches
  - Depot Premises Cleaning
  - Intensive cleaning of primary Maintained coaches.
  - Yard & Depot premises cleaning including Sick Line and Pit Lines.
- 2.3 The Mechanized Cleaning Contract is on integrated turnkey basis which covers the following aspects.
- All fixed instalments.
  - Mechanised systems as per given specifications.
  - Hand implements, tools & tackles.
  - Consumables of machines
  - Cleaning, disinfecting agents.
  - Operators/Labour & Supervisors
    - (i) Complete maintenance of the machines employed for cleaning the rakes.
    - (ii) Cleaning of depot premises including repair of water hydrants.
- 2.4 The contractor has to ensure that the mechanised cleaning of coaches of primary & secondary trains is completed as per the schedule.
- 2.5 For mechanized & manual cleaning of depot premises contractor should deploy required numbers of staff as per specific requirements.



### **Proposed system of working :-**

2.6 The work study team made a detailed study into all the aspects of working of Safaiwala's and Cleaner & concluded that:-

- (i) The cleanliness activity on all the Coach & Depot Premises of Mechanical under BVC division to be outsourced to Private Contractor which will ensure greater discipline and accountability for higher standard of cleanliness as also to tackle the problem of high absenteeism amongst Safaiwala & Cleaner.
- (ii) It should be ensured that the contractors deploy the full sanctioned strength of employees at each depot in order to achieve higher standards of cleanliness.
- (iii) The posts of Safaiwala, who have been deployed at Coach & Depot Premises where cleaning activities are been outsourced to private contractors, may be surrendered.

:-

### 3.0 WorkLoad and Critical Analysis :

The details of safaiwala cadre of BVC Mechanical Dept. is as under.

Unit/Depo	Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy
<b>BVC</b>	10	6	4
<b>AE</b>	3	2	1
<b>JND</b>	2	0	2
<b>PBR</b>	13	3	10
<b>VRL</b>	11	8	3
<b>SMNH</b>	1	1	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>

### 3.1 Sanction Cadre and workload of safaiwala & Cleaning at BVC. (Bhavnagar Terminus)

	Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Work Carried out by existing staff
<b>Safaiwala</b> (House Keeping Asst.)	10	6	4	Terminating cleaning attention of 10 platform return train nos 59228/ 59268 / 59225 59202/ 59204/59296/59234/59270/59230/ 59207

### 3.2 Sanction Cadre and work load of safaiwala of AE(Amreli)

	Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Work Carried out by existing staff
<b>Safaiwala</b> (House Keeping Asst.)	3	2	1	Cleaning of 3 platform return trains and Guard-Driver Running Room

### 3.3 Sanction cadre and work load of Safaiwala of JND(Jungadh)

	Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Work Carried out by existing staff
<b>Safaiwala</b> (House Keeping Asst.)	2	0	2	No Safaiwala staff working in JND . He was working in JLR and post was paper transferred as the staff was due to retire in few months.

### **3.4 Sanction cadre and work load of Safaiwala of PBR (Porbandar)**

	<b>Sanction Cadre</b>	<b>Men on Roll</b>	<b>Vacancy</b>	<b>Work Carried out by existing staff</b>
<b>Safaiwala</b> (House Keeping Asst.)	13	3	10	Primary Maintenance of 9 Trains comprising 9 Rakes at PBH. Cleaning of 1 STR and 3 Platform return trains.

### **3.5 Sanction cadre and work load of Safaiwala of VRL (Veraval)**

	<b>Sanction Cadre</b>	<b>Men on Roll</b>	<b>Vacancy</b>	<b>Work Carried out by existing staff</b>
<b>Safaiwala</b> (House Keeping Asst.)	11	8	3	Primary Maintenance of 2 Trains comprising 6 Rakes at VRL ( 18 Coaches each) Cleaning of 1 Platform return train.

### **3.6 Sanction cadre and work load of Safaiwala of SMNH (Somnath)**

	<b>Sanction Cadre</b>	<b>Men on Roll</b>	<b>Vacancy</b>	<b>Work Carried out by existing staff</b>
<b>Safaiwala</b> (House Keeping Asst.)	1	1	0	Cleaning of 2 Platform return trains at SMNH

For improving passenger amenities and cleanliness with continued focus to enhance passenger comforts, facilities, ambience and aesthetics necessary steps to improve the over-all status of sanitation/cleanliness of Trains and Railway premises needs to be taken. Outsourcing of Non-Core activities like Cleaning is to be done for satisfactory results and simultaneously sustain the financial viability on Railway Revenue for these activities.

### **3.8 Recommendation**

#### **3.8.1 Recommendation No.1**

*The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on all Mechanical depots under BVC division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. Thus, 20 vacant posts of Safaiwala (House Keeping Assistant) are recommended for surrender immediately.*

#### **3.8.2 Recommendation No. 2**

*Work Study Team suggests that all Mechanical depots under BVC division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors for providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.*

*Thus, after outsourcing the sweeping activities of all Mechanical depots under BVC division, the remaining man on roll i.e.  $40-20 = 20$  posts of Safaiwala may be surrendered in the financial year 2019-20.*

*...o0o...*

#### **4.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATION**

- 4.1. The work study team proposes that the cleanliness activity on all Coaches & Depot Premises over BVC division to be outsourced and firstly the vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. It is seen from the Cadre position that there are 20 Safaiwala vacant posts available against the sanctioned cadre of 40 posts of Safaiwala's. Hence, 20 vacant posts of Safaiwala's are recommended for surrender immediately.
- 4.2 After outsourcing, the cleaning activities of all Coaches & Depot Premises over BVC division 20 posts of Safaiwala may be surrendered immediately.
- 4.3 On implication of the study report and surrendering the 20 posts of Safaiwala's in Phase-I and 20 posts of Safaiwala's in Phase II of Mechanical Department on BVC Division, annual recurring saving will be achieved as tabulated below :-

##### **Phase I**

<b><i>Category</i></b>	<b><i>No. of Surplus posts</i></b>	<b><i>Average cost per Employee</i></b>	<b><i>Annual saving in Rs.</i></b>
<b>Safaiwala (House Keeping Assistant)</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>Rs. 6,45,968</b>	<b>Rs1,29,19,360/-</b>

##### **Phase II**

<b><i>Category</i></b>	<b><i>No. of Surplus posts</i></b>	<b><i>Average cost per Employee</i></b>	<b><i>Annual saving in Rs.</i></b>
<b>Safaiwala (House Keeping Assistant)</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>Rs. 6,45,968</b>	<b>Rs. 1,29,19,360/-</b>

- 4.4 On implementation of the recommendations brought out in the work study report, annual recurring saving, per annum can be achieved as follows:-

**Phase I** - Annual recurring saving of **Rs. 129.19 Lakhs** per annum can be achieved.

**Phase II** - Annual recurring saving of **Rs. 129.19 Lakhs** per annum can be achieved.

**...ooo...**  
**...END...**