



REVIEW OF STAFF STRENGTH
OF
SAFAIWALA & CLEANER STAFF
OF
MECHANICAL DEPARTMENT
OVER
RAJKOT DIVISION

(No. G.463/WR/WS-17/2019-20)

Led by:
Shri Rakesh Kumar
Dy. Secy.(PG)-CCG

Guided by:
Shri S. Sharma
SWSO-CCG

Study Conducted by:
Shri Arun Sarfare
(CWSI-CCG)

Shri Sheenu Panicker
(CWSI/CCG)

Shri Ashish Dubey
(CWSI/CCG)

Central Planning Organization
Headquarter Office
Churchgate
Mumbai – 20

...o0o...

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Sr. No. of Study	-	17
Case No.	-	G.463/WR/WS-17/2019-20
Subject	-	Review of staff strength of Safaiwala & Cleaner Staff of Mechanical department over Rajkot Division, due to outsourcing of cleaning activities.
Area	-	C & W Cadre of Rajkot Division.
Division	-	Rajkot
Department	-	Mechanical
Authority	-	AGM/CCG
Terms of Reference	-	Assessment of Man power requirement – Corresponding to arising existing work load.
No. of Recommendations	-	Two
Projected Manpower	-	Phase I

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Vacancy	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Safaiwala	21	16	05	16	05	05	0
Cleaner	22	23	Surplus 1	22	01	00	01
Total	43	39	06	38	06	05	01

Projected Manpower - **Phase II**

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Vacancy	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Safaiwala	16	16	0	0	16	0	16
Cleaner	23	23	0	0	23	0	23
Total	39	39	0	0	39	0	39

Financial Implication - Phase I -Total recurring Savings of **Rs. 38.75 Lakhs** (approx.) per annum.

- Phase II - Total recurring Savings of **Rs. 251.92 Lakhs** (approx.) per annum.

...o0o...

INDEX

CHAPTER NO.	DESCRIPTION	PAGE NO.	
		FROM	TO
-	Acknowledgement & Terms of Reference	4	--
-	Methodology	5	--
-	Summary of Recommendations	6	--
I	Introduction	7	--
II		8	10
III	Critical Analysis of Existing manpower and Proposed manpower.	11	13
	Recommendation	14	
IV	Financial Implications	15	

(i)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The work study team is grateful to :

Shri. L M Dahama	Sr. DME-RJT
Shri V P Jhala	ADME-RJT
Shri Prakash Patni	SSE-SUNR
Shri Dharendra Prasad	SSE- RJT
Shri Ram Avatar	SSE- HAPA/JAM
Shri. Satyanarayan	SSE- OKHA

and Ch.OS & SSEs of Mechanical Depot over RJT division for their whole hearted co-operation extended during the course of the study.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

As directed by Additional General Manager, Churchgate, a work study to review the staff strength of Safaiwala & Cleaner Staff of Mechanical Department over Rajkot Division, has been conducted with a view to assess the requirement of man power as a result of outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractors over Rajkot division.

...o0o...

(ii)

METHODOLOGY ADOPTED

- Visit to work place
- Collection of data – staff strength / activities / work load.
- Observation of working system
- Scrutiny of data collected (critical analysis)
- Discussion with nominated officials
- Assessment of man power
- Recommendation for acceptance and implementation
- Finalization of Work Study.

...o0o...

(iii)

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Phase I

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Vacancy	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Safaiwala	21	16	05	16	05	05	0
Cleaner	22	23	Surplus 1	22	01	00	01
Total	43	39	06	38	06	05	01

Projected Manpower - **Phase II**

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Vacancy	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Safaiwala	16	16	0	0	16	0	16
Cleaner	23	23	0	0	23	0	23
Total	39	39	0	0	39	0	39

Recommendation

Refer Para

Recommendation No.1

The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on All Mechanical depots under RJT division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. Thus, 06 posts (05 Vacant + 01 Excess) of Safaiwala & Cleaner are recommended for surrendered immediately.	3.5.1
--	--------------

Recommendation No. 2

<i>Work Study Team suggested that all Mechanical depots under RJT division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors for providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.</i> <i>Thus, after outsourcing, the sweeping & cleaning activities of all Mechanical depots under RJT division, 16 + 23 = 39 live posts of Safaiwala & Cleaner are recommended to surrender within the financial year 2019-20.</i>	3.5.2
--	--------------

...o0o...

CHAPTER- I

INTRODUCTION

1.0 Outsourcing the cleanliness activity:-

Indian Railway is rapidly proceeding towards modernization in all fields. The need of the day is to devote basically on the core activities relating to the transportation part. The age old system of manual cleaning has become obsolete. It not only requires a huge manpower but also is time consuming and not effective up to satisfactory levels. The present trend is to provide mechanized cleaning equipments, which provide hygienic environment instilling high satisfaction levels to the users. Moreover it is also cost effective with less involvement of manpower.

The Hon'ble Railway Minister announced during the Railway Budget 2014-2015 that a special drive is to be launched for improving the over-all status of sanitation/cleanliness of Railway Stations, Railway Colonies and Railway Office premises. Railway Board has issued guidelines for Mechanized cleaning of the different categories of Railway Stations for providing a greater importance to improve the overall levels of sanitation/cleanliness.

Presently, more than half of the total working expenses are expended towards staff costs in the Indian Railways. The administration should plan towards achieving a quantum reduction in man power costs, especially those relating to the non core activities, for sustaining the financial viability of the Indian Railways taking into account the impact of VIIth Pay Commission recommendations.

Railway Board vide letter No. E(MPP)2018/21/1 dated 11.09.2018 has advised to review the cadre of safaiwala in the Railways.

Accordingly, Chief Personnel Officer (IR), Western Railway, Churchgate vide note No.CPO(IR)/misc/2018 dated has advised to conduct the work Study of Safaiwala & Cleaner over Western Railway.

The study has been undertaken with a view to analyze the feasibility of outsourcing the cleanliness activity on all the stations, Railway Colonies, Depots and Railway Office premises over Western Railway and to surrender the posts of safaiwala, when outsourcing is completed. This work study is limited to the review of Staff Strength of Safaiwala & Cleaner of Mechanical Department over Rajkot Division.

...oOo...

CHAPTER – II

- 2.1 Administration takes the Decision to change of Designation/Promotion of /Safaiwala's to the post of Khalasi in Mech. Dept. RJT Division.

Based on other Divisions have already exercised the procedure of change of designation. The change of Designation /Promotion of cleaners/Safaiwala's to the post of Khalasi in Mech. Dept. RJT Division it includes:

1. Promotion to Sr. Khalasi, Safaiwala, Bhisty & Cleaner will be considered at Par with khalasi.

2.Seniority of Group "C" Khalasi, Cleaner, Bhisty & Safaiwala is combined in Mechanical (C & W Dept.) for purpose of promotion in Group "C" accordingly seniority of Khalasi, Cleaner, Bhisty & Safaiwala may be merged .

3.Khalasi, Safaiwala, Bhisty & Cleaner are appointed direct recruitment by RRC and also compassionate ground, medically de categorised staff also redeployed in this categorised by screening committee. The promotion procedure may be adopted as per the norms/guidelines issued by HQ/Div.

2.2The details Cadre with vacancies of Safaiwala's & Cleaners of Mechanical Dept. are as under.

Sr. No.	Cadre of Safaiwala's with Vacancies.				
	Unit	Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Excess
		Safaiwala	Safaiwala	Safaiwala	Safaiwala
1	SUNR	06	03	03	00
2	RJT	08	07	01	00
3	WKR	00	00	00	00
4	HXP	02	01	01	00
5	JAM	02	02	00	00
6	OKHA	03	03	00	00
		21	16	05	00

2.3 Cadre of Cleaner with Vacancies.

Sr. No.	Unit	Cadre of Cleaner with Vacancies.			
		Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Excess
1	SUNR	02	02	00	00
2	RJT	12	11	01	00
3	WKR	00	00	00	00
4	HXP	04	06	00	02
5	JAM	03	03	00	00
6	OKHA	01	01	00	00
		22	23	01	02

2.4 The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on All Mechanical depots under RJT division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. It is seen from the Cadre position there are 16 Safaiwala & 23 Cleaner are available.

2.5 The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on All Mechanical depots under RJT division to be outsourced to Private Contractor

2.6 The existing system of cleaning activities are as under:

- Exterior cleaning of Primary/Secondary Maintained coaches.
- Intensive internal cleaning (A Schedule) & watering of Primary/Secondary Maintained Coaches.
- Internal cleaning (Trip Schedule) & Watering of primary/Secondary Maintained coaches.
- Yard & Depot premises cleaning.

2.6.(a) The Mechanized Cleaning Contract is on turnkey basis which covering the following aspects.

- (i) All fixed instalments.
- (ii) Mechanised systems as per given specifications.
- (iii) Hand implements, tools & tackles.
- (iv) Consumables of machines
- (v) Cleaning, disinfecting agents.
- (vi) Operators/Labour & Supervisors
- (vii) Complete maintenance of the machines employed for cleaning the rates.
- (viii) Cleaning of depot premises including repair of water hydrants.

2.6.(b) The contractor has to ensure the mechanised cleaning of coaches of primary & secondary trains is completed in three hours maximum or as per the occupied time of rake in the washing /pit line whichever is less.

2.6.(c) For mechanized & Manual cleaning of depot premises, administration should start the process of tendering for outsourcing the cleanliness activities within the all C & W Depots comes under Mechanical Dept of Rajkot Division.

2.6.(d) While initiating the outsourcing the all cleanliness activities club together and float the tender, no separate contract should be awarded for every activity.

2.7 This work study is limited to the C & W Units – SUNR, RJT, WKR, HXP & Okha.

2.8 The yard stick of Safaiwala & Cleaner is very old and there are vast changes in working pattern. ***Hence, this work study is conducted on the basis of need base requirement and outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractor.***

2.9 **Proposed system of working :-**

The work study team made a detailed study into all the aspects of working of Safaiwala's and Cleaner & concluded that :-

- (i) The cleanliness activity on all the Coach & Depot Premises of Mechanical under RJT division to be outsourced to Private Contractor which will ensure greater discipline and accountability for higher standard of cleanliness as also to tackle the problem of high absenteeism amongst Safaiwala & Cleaner.
- (ii) It should be ensured that the contractors deploy the full sanctioned strength of employees at each depot in order to achieve higher standards of cleanliness.
- (iii) The posts of Safaiwala's & Cleaner who have been deployed at Coach & Depot Premises where cleaning activities have been outsourced to private contractors, may be surrendered.

2.10 Work Study Team suggested that all Mechanical depots under RJT division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.

Chapter III

3. Critical Analysis

3.1 Cadre of SUNR & Work-load

	Unit	Cadre of Safaiwala's & Cleaners with Vacancies.			
		Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Excess
Safaiwala's	SUNR	06	03	03	00
Cleaners		02	02	00	00
Re-engagement		00	01	00	
		08	06	03	00

3.1.1 Safaiwala's & Cleaning staff have been utilised for dry cleaning of trains which are terminated at SUNR and en-route trains those passing through SUNR. The total 06 staff i.e. 03 Safaiwala's', 02 Cleaners & one engaged under Re-engagement working in two shifts and attending all complaints of cleaning.

3.1.2 During the period (01.06.2018 to 31.05.2019) 111 complaints had received for cleanliness & 26 complaints of Rodent Control from travelling passengers and same were attended by SSE- SUNR.

3.1.3 The complaints were repeated to CCR by SSE however, no data of fine recovered is available at station by OBHS contractor for not attended the complaints, for which Railway staff are utilised,

3.1.4 During the study it has been noticed that Safaiwala's & cleaners have been utilised for cleaning activity in trains even though OBHS contract is available.

3.2 Cadre of RJT & Work-load

	Unit	Cadre of Safaiwala's & Cleaners with Vacancies.			
		Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Excess
Safaiwala's	RJT	08	07	01	00
Cleaners		12	11	01	00
Re-engagement		00	01	00	00
		20	19	02	00

3.2.1 Safaiwala's & Cleaning staff have been utilised for dry cleaning of trains which are terminated at RJT and en-route trains those passing through RJT. The total 08 Safaiwala's utilised for cleaning purpose and 11 Cleaners & one staff working under Re- engagement utilising as khalasi at Depot.

- 3.2.2** No data of complaints is available with SSE- RJT however; complaints received & attended were repeated to CCR as a regular practice.
- 3.2.3** During the study it has been noticed that the tender for Integrated Comprehensive turnkey contract for Mechanised Cleaning of Coaches at Coaching Depot **RJT** & Hapa including manual cleaning of coaching depot premises for period of three years was awarded to M/s. General Security & Information Services PVT. Ltd for Rs. 3,79,50,615.36 by Division which is
- 3.2.4** The complaints were repeated to CCR by SSE however, no data of fine recovered is available at station by OBHS contractor for not attended the complaints, for which Railway staff are utilised,
- 3.2.5** During the study it has been noticed that Safaiwala's & cleaners have been utilised for cleaning activity in trains even though OBHS contract is available, as & when required.

3.3 Cadre of HAPA & Work-load

	Unit	Cadre of Safaiwala's & Cleaners with Vacancies.			Excess
		Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	
Safaiwala's	Hapa	02	01	01	00
Cleaners		04	06	00	02
Re-engagement		00	00	00	00
		06	07	01	02

- 3.3.1** Safaiwala's & Cleaning staff have been utilised for dry cleaning of trains which are terminated at HAPA and en-route trains those passing through HAPA. The total 07 staff i.e. one Safaiwala & six cleaners utilised for cleaning purpose
- 3.3.2** No data of complaints is available with SSE- RJT however, complaints received & attended were repeated to CCR as a regular practice.
- 3.3.3** During the study it has been noticed that the tender for Integrated Comprehensive turnkey contract for Mechanised Cleaning of Coaches at Coaching Depot RJT & **Hapa** including manual cleaning of coaching depot premises for period of three years was awarded to M/s. General Security & Information Services PVT. Ltd for Rs. 3,79,50,615.36 by Division.
- 3.3.4** The complaints were repeated to CCR by SSE however, no data of fine recovered from OBHS contractor is available at station by SSE for not attended the complaints, for which Railway staff are utilised,
- 3.3.5** During the study it has been noticed that Safaiwala's & cleaners have been utilised for cleaning activity in trains even though OBHS contract is available, as & when required..

3.4 Cadre of JAM & Work-load

	Unit	Cadre of Safaiwala's & Cleaners with Vacancies.			Excess
		Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	
Safaiwala's	JAM	02	02	00	00
Cleaners		03	03	00	00
Re-engagement		00	00	00	00
		05	05	00	00

- 3.4.1** & Cleaning staff have been utilised for dry cleaning of trains which are terminated at HAPA and en-route trains those passing through HAPA. The total 05 staff i.e. 02 Safaiwala's & 03 cleaners utilised for cleaning purpose.
- 3.4.2** No data of complaints is available with SSE- JAM, however, complaints received & attended were repeated to CCR as a regular practice.
- 3.4.3** During the study it has been noticed that the proposal of tender for Integrated Comprehensive turnkey contract have been initiate by SSE JAM and forwarded to Division for outsourcing the cleanliness activities.
- 3.4.4** The complaints were repeated to CCR by SSE however, no data of fine recovered from OBHS contractor is available at station by SSE for not attended the complaints, for which Railway staff are utilised,
- 3.4.5** During the study it has been noticed that Safaiwala's & cleaners have been utilised for cleaning activity in trains even though OBHS contract is available, as & when required. .
- 3.4.6** As on date, No Safaiwala & Cleaner cadre is available at WKR, ESSAR & RPL.depot.

3.5 Recommendation

3.5.1 *Recommendation No.1*

The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on All Mechanical depots under RJT division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. Thus, 06 posts (05 Vacant post of Safaiwala + 01 Excess post of Cleaner) of Safaiwala & Cleaner are recommended for surrendered immediately.

3.5.2 Recommendation No. 2.

Work Study Team suggested that all Mechanical depots under RJT division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors for providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.

Thus, after outsourcing, the sweeping & cleaning activities of all Mechanical depots under RJT division, 16 safaiwala + 23Cleaner = 39 live posts are recommended to surrender within the financial year 2019-20.

CHAPTER – IV

4.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

- 4.1.** The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on all the Coaches & Depot Premises over RJT division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. It is seen from the Cadre position that there are 05 vacant posts of Safaiwala & 01 excess post of Cleaner are available against the sanctioned cadre of 21 posts of Safaiwala's and 22 posts of Cleaner. Hence, 05 vacant posts of Safaiwala's & 01 post of Cleaner are recommended for surrendered immediately.
- 4.2** After outsourcing, the cleaning activities of all Coaches & Depot Premises over RJT division 16 posts of Safaiwala & 23 posts of Cleaner may be surrender after outsourcing the cleanliness activity.
- 4.3** On implication of the study report and surrendering the 06 posts i.e. 05 Safaiwala's & 01 Cleaner at Phase I And 39 posts i.e. 16 Safaiwala's & 23 Cleaners at Phase II of Mechanical Department on RJT Division, annual recurring saving will be achieved as tabulated below :-

Phase I

<i>Category</i>	<i>No. of Surplus posts</i>	<i>Average cost per Employee</i>	<i>Annual saving in Rs.</i>
Safaiwala & Cleaner	06	Rs. 6,45,968	Rs. 38,75,808/-

Phase II

<i>Category</i>	<i>No. of Surplus posts</i>	<i>Average cost per Employee</i>	<i>Annual saving in Rs.</i>
Safaiwala & Cleaner	39	Rs. 6,45,968	Rs. 2,51,92,752/-

- 4.4** On implementation of the recommendations brought out in the work study report, annual recurring saving, per annum can be achieved as follows :-
Phase I - Annual recurring saving of **Rs. 35.75 Lakhs** per annum can be achieved.

Phase II - Annual recurring saving of **Rs. 251.92 Lakhs** per annum can be achieved.

...oOo...