

STUDY REPORT ON
REVIEW OF STAFF STRENGTH OF
COMMERCIAL DEPARTMENT
SAFAIWALA(HOUSE KEEPING ASSISTANT)
OVER

BHAVNAGAR DIVISION
DUE TO OUTSOURCING OF CLEANING ACTIVITIES

Study No.G.463/WR/WS-28/2019-20

<u>Led by:</u>	<u>Study Conducted by:</u>	<u>Assistance from Division</u>
Shri. Rakesh Kumar	Shri. Arun Sarfare	Shri. V K Tailor
(Secy./PG-CCG)	CWSI/ CCG	Sr. DCM-BVP
	Shri Sheenu Panicker	
<u>Guided By:</u>	CWSI/ CCG	Kum. Niladevi Zala
Shri. Sudhindra Sharma	Shri Ashish Dube	ACM - BVP
SWSO-CCG	CWSI/ CCG	

Central Planning Organization
Headquarter Office
Churchgate
Mumbai – 400 020

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Serial No.	-	28
Study No.	-	WR/WS-28/2018-2019
Case No.	-	G.463/WR/WS-28/2018-2019
Subject	-	Review of staff strength – Commercial Dept. Safaiwala(House Keeping assistant) over Bhavnagar Division due to outsourcing of cleaning activities.
Area	-	Bhavnagar Division
Department	-	Commercial
Authority	-	AGM/CCG
Terms of Reference	-	Assessment of Man power requirement – Corresponding to existing staff strength.
No. of Recommendations	-	01 (ONE)
Summary of Recommendations	-	Placed on Page No. 6
Projected Manpower		

Category	Existing Cadre	Men on roll	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Safaiwala (House Keeping Assistant) Level-I	115	83	00	115	32	83

Financial Implication	-	Recurring Savings of Rs. 7,42,86,320/- (approx) per annum.
-----------------------	---	---

...o0o...

INDEX

Chapter	Content	Reference Para	
		From	To
-	Acknowledgement and Terms of reference	04	
-	Methodology	05	
-	Summary of Recommendations	06	
I	Introduction	07	
II	Existing work load and Deployment	08 to 14	
	Critical Analysis & Recommendation.	15	
III	Financial Implication	16	

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The work study team wishes to acknowledge its gratitude to

Shri. V K Tailor	Sr. DCM- BVP
Kum. Niladevi Zala	ACM - BVP

And Shri Arun Gaud DCMI- (HQ)- Bhavnagar & staff of Commercial and Personnel department of Bhavnagar Division for the assistance given by them during the course of the study.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

As per Additional General Manager's directives, Secy./PG has instructed to conduct a work study to review the staff strength of Safaiwala's over Commercial department of Bhavnagar division. Accordingly, a study has been conducted with a view to assess the requirement of man power as a result of outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractors over Bhavnagar division.

...ooo...

METHODOLOGY

Collection	- of data required for conducting the Work Study.
Observation	- of area wise and activity wise working system.
Scrutiny	- of data collected, existing staff strength, deployment, Quantum of workload arising.
Discussion	- with Co-ordination Personnel & Commercial officers & Staff in regard to workload arising and actual requirements of staff.
Consideration	-of suggestions and guidelines given by Co-ordination Officer .
Assessment	- Critical examination of existing of working and Comparison with cost of manpower provided by Railway vis-a-vis opting for out sourcing the activity.
Provision	- of Leave Reserve and Rest Givers on the bare proposed manpower.
Identification	- of surplus posts available over and above the need based requirement and discussion with ACM - BVP at the time of Study.
Proposal	- for adoption of change in existing working system.
Finalization	- of Work Study report with recommendations.

...ooo...

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation No.

Refer Para

Recommendation No.1

2.13

As per Para 2.3, Safaiwala's have been deployed by Railway at 54 stations over Bhavnagar division. During the works –Study it has been noticed that the cleanliness activities have been completely outsourced to private contractors vide Para 2.4 over 70 stations and 228 manpower deployed at 70 stations vide Para 2.4, therefore 115 safaiwala's posts (32Vacant + 83 Live) may be surrendered immediately.

Summary of Recommendation:

Category	Existing Cadre	Men on roll	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Safaiwala (House Keeping Assistant) Level-I	115	83	00	115	32	83

...ooo...

CHAPTER – I

INTRODUCTION

- 1.0 Indian Railway is rapidly proceeding towards modernization in all fields. The need of the day is to devote basically on the core activities relating to the transportation part. The age old system of manual cleaning has become obsolete. It not only requires a huge man power but also is time consuming and not effective up to satisfactory levels. The present trend is to provide mechanized cleaning equipments, which provide hygienic environment instilling high satisfaction levels to the users. Moreover it is also cost effective with less involvement of man power.
- 1.1 The Hon'ble Railway Minister announced during the Railway Budget 2014-2015 that a special drive is to be launched for improving passenger amenities and cleanliness with continued focus to enhance passenger comforts, facilities, ambience and aesthetics. A great emphasis has been given to improve the over-all status of sanitation/cleanliness of Railway Stations. Railway Board has issued guidelines for Mechanized cleaning of the different categories of Railway Stations for providing a greater importance to improve the overall levels of sanitation/cleanliness.
- 1.2 Presently, more than half of the total working expenses are expended towards staff costs in the Indian Railways. The administration should plan towards achieving a quantum reduction in man power costs, especially those relating to the non core activities, for sustaining the financial viability of the Indian Railways taking into account the impact of VII th Pay Commission recommendations.
- 1.3 As per Board Guidelines vide letter No. E(MPP)2018/21/1 dated 12.01.2018 & 08.09.2018, Board has decided to review the Cadre of Safaiwala in the Railways where the work has been outsourced.
- 1.4 The study has been undertaken with a view to analyze the feasibility of outsourcing the cleanliness activity on all the stations over Western Railway and to re-deploy those Safaiwala's as per requirement.

...o0o...

CHAPTER – II

2.0 EXISTING SYSTM OF WORKING

2.1 CADRE:

2.2 Sanctioned cadre as on 01.04.2019.

Category	Scale of Pay	Cadre	Men on roll	Vacancy
Safaiwala (House Keeping Assistant)	5200-20200 + 1800 Level-I	115	83	32

2.3 Station wise deployment of Safaiwala cadre provided by Division is as under:

Sr. No.	Station	Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Excess	REMARKS
1	AE	01	01	00	00	-
2	BHY	10	01	00	01	-
3	BNH	01	00	01	00	-
4	BTB	9+5=14	08	06	00	(05 posts transferred from other stations on temporary basis, i.e. 1-SRGT, 1 WC, 1 LM, 1 CDA, 1 RUR)
5	BVC	12+4=16	14	02	00	(4 Posts transferred from other stations temporary basis i.e. 1-SGD, 2-SOJN, 1-VTJ)
6	BVP	2+1	03	00	00	1 Post transferred from PIT station on temporary basis.
7	CDA	00	01	00	01	
8	CLC	01	01	00	00	
9	CVR	0	01	00	01	
10	DARI	01	01	00	00	
11	DAS	3+6	04	05	00	06 posts transferred from other stations on temporary basis i.e. 1-RLA, 1-SVKD, 1-LMO, 3-DLJ.
12	DCK	02	0	02	00	
13	DJI	01	01	00	00	
14	DLJ	00	01	00	01	
15	DOK	01	00	01	00	
16	DVA	01	00	01	00	
17	GG	04	02	02	00	
18	GOP	01	00	01	00	
19	JDH	0	01	00	01	
20	JLR	5+5	07	03	00	05 Posts transferred from other stations on temporary basis i.e. 2-GDL, 1-DJI, 1-NUD & 1- VRR)
21	JND	9+4	09	04	00	04 POSTS TRANSFERRED FROM OTHER STATIONS ON TEMPORRARY BASIS i.e. 2-KSD, 1-SHH, 1-CVR)
22	JVN	01	00	01	00	(05 posts transferred from other stations on temporary basis, i.e. 1-SRGT, 1 WC, 1 LM, 1 CDA, 1 RUR)

23	KJV	01	00	01	00	(4 Posts transferred from other stations temporary basis i.e. 1-SGD, 2-SOJN, 1-VTJ)
24	KODR	01	01	00	00	1 Post transferred from PIT station on temporary basis.
25	KTGD	01	00	01	00	
26	LPJ	00	01	00	01	
27	LMO	00	01	00	01	
28	MLHA	01	00	01	00	
29	MORA	01	00	01	00	
30	NGA	01	01	00	00	
31	NUD	0	01	00	01	
32	PBR	9 +6=15	07	08	00	
33	PCC	01	00	01	00	
34	PLM	01	00	01	00	
35	PPSP	01	01	00	00	
36	RJU	01	0	01	00	
37	RLA	00	01	00	01	
38	RUR	00	01	00	01	
39	RWO	00	01	00	01	
40	SASG	1+2=3	03	00	00	02 transferred from other stations on temporary basis i.e. 2-VSW
41	SEJ	01	00	01	00	
42	SHH	00	01	00	01	
43	SRGT	00	01	00	01	
44	STDR	01	01	00	00	
45	TAV	01	01	00	00	
46	UA	01	00	01	00	
47	UNA	01	01	00	00	
48	VLA	01	00	01	00	
49	VRR	00	00	00	00	
50	VSW	00	00	00	00	
51	VTJ	00	01	00	01	
52	VTP	01	00	01	00	
53	WC	01	01	00	01	
54	WSJ	00	01	00	01	
	Total	115	83	48	16	

Note: Actual Cadre of safaiwala =115 wherein 83 nos. of manpower shown Man on Roll and 32 vacant which has been adjusted by the commercial department as per above chart.

2.3.1 Details of Work-Load provided by Division is as under.

Sr. No.	Station	Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Excess	Man power provided by Contractor	Actual Workload Worlold provided by Division.	Overall workload in Sq. Mtr.
1	AE	01	01	00	00	2	Nil	7283
2	BHY	10	01	00	01	2	Nil	9600
3	BNH	01	00	01	00	Sec. Closed	Nil	-
4	BTD	9+5=14	08	06	00	-	51091	715275
5	BVC	12+4=16	14	02	00	-	24515	392250
6	BVP	2+1	03	00	00	-	75269	225807
7	CDA	00	01	00	01	2	Nil	5150
8	CLC	01	01	00	00	2	Nil	3481
9	CVR	0	01	00	01	3	Nil	18478
10	DARI	01	01	00	00	2	Nil	5492
11	DAS	3+6	04	05	00	-	2222	20000
12	DCK	02	0	02	00	Sec. Closed	Nil	-
13	DJI	01	01	00	00	2	Nil	9200
14	DLJ	00	01	00	01	11	Nil	1093450
15	DOK	01	00	01	00	Sec. Closed	Nil	-
16	DVA	01	00	01	00	2	Nil	5220
17	GG	04	02	02	00	Sec. Closed	Nil	-
18	GOP	01	00	01	00	2	Nil	6750
19	JDH	0	01	00	01	2	Nil	11000
20	JLR	5+5	07	03	00	-	21500	215000
21	JND	9+4	09	04	00	-	190136	248773
22	JVN	01	00	01	00	3	Nil	9900
23	KJV	01	00	01	00	Sec Closed	Nil	-
24	KODR	01	01	00	00	-	6000	6000
25	KTGD	01	00	01	00	Sec Closed	Nil	-
26	LPJ	00	01	00	01	2	Nil	9750
27	LMO	00	01	00	01	2	Nil	7230
28	MLHA	01	00	01	00	4	Nil	21758
29	MORA	01	00	01	00	Sec Closed	Nil	-
30	NGA	01	01	00	00	2	Nil	8210
31	NUD	0	01	00	01	3	Nil	13860
32	PBR	9 +6=15	07	08	00	-	36945	554176
33	PCC	01	00	01	00	3	Nil	11320
34	PLM	01	00	01	00	2	Nil	9600

35	PPSP	01	01	00	00	-	10000	10000
36	RJU	01	0	01	00	2	Nil	5240
37	RLA	00	01	00	01	2	Nil	6355
38	RUR	00	01	00	01	3	Nil	8100
39	RWO	00	01	00	01	3	Nil	13000
40	SASG	1+2=3	03	00	00	2	3087	9262
41	SEJ	01	00	01	00		Nil	-
42	SHH	00	01	00	01	2	Nil	19316
43	SRGT	00	01	00	01	3	Nil	10350
44	STDR	01	01	00	00	2	Nil	10553
45	TAV	01	01	00	00	2	Nil	12755
46	UA	01	00	01	00	2	Nil	9200
47	UNA	01	01	00	00	2	Nil	3184
48	VLA	01	00	01	00		Nil	-
49	VRR	00	00	00	00	5	Nil	76123
50	VSW	00	00	00	00	2	Nil	12448
51	VTJ	00	01	00	01	2	Nil	11690
52	VTP	01	00	01	00		Nil	-
53	WC	01	01	00	01	4	Nil	15055
54	WSJ	00	01	00	01	4	Nil	22900
	Total	115	83	48	16	95 Manpower		

2.3.2 Details of Manpower provided by Contractors.

Sr No	Name of Contractor	Man power deployed	Nos of Stations
1	M/s. Oriental Agencies-Vadodara	78	33
2	M/s. Anushree Outsources-Gandhinagar	51	22
3	M/s. D. G. Nakrani	24	03
4	M/s. Hardik Construction Co.	35	07
5	M/s. Orient Agencies	26	01
6	M/s. Welcare Facility Management Pvt. Ltd.	03	03
7	M/s. D G Nakrani	01	01
		218	70 Stations.

Remarks provided by Division: Only Machine Operator provided by the contractor at BVP,JND,PBR,BTD TO BVC Stations. Hence, at these station except mechanised cleaning all other work is done by the Railway staff.

2.4 CLEANING CONTRACTOR POSITION OF BVP DIVN.

On Bhavnagar Division cleaning activities have been outsourced The details of Tenders awarded & manpower deployments are as under.

Sr. No	Type of Contract	Station	Name of Party	Date of Starting	Date of Completion	Man powers	Remarks
1	Mechanised and Manual cleaning, Housekeeping, Sweeping, Rag Picking, up keep and Rodent Control of Railway Station	ADE	Oriental Agencies-Vadodara	01.04.19	31.03.23	2	Nil
		SHH		01.04.19	31.03.23	2	
		LAL		01.04.19	31.03.23	2	
		PLM		20.03.19	19.03.23	2	
		JDH		20.03.19	19.03.23	2	
		WAB		20.03.19	19.03.23	2	
		SASG		15.03.19	14.03.23	2	
		TAV		15.03.19	14.03.23	2	
		SVB		15.03.19	14.03.23	2	
		MLHA		01.04.19	31.03.23	4	
		CVR		01.04.19	31.03.23	3	
		UNA		15.03.19	14.03.23	2	
		DVA		15.03.19	14.03.23	2	
		PCC		15.03.19	14.03.23	2	
		VTJ		15.03.19	14.03.23	2	
		SOA		15.03.19	14.03.23	2	
		KDMR		15.03.19	14.03.23	2	
		VSW		01.04.19	31.03.23	2	
		BILK		01.04.19	31.03.23	2	
		STDR		01.04.19	31.03.23	2	
		KANS		01.04.19	31.03.23	2	
		UJ		20.02.19	19.02.23	2	
		ALMR		20.02.19	19.02.23	2	
		NGA		20.02.19	19.02.23	2	
		LTD		20.02.19	19.02.23	2	
		RWO		20.03.19	19.03.23	3	
		BNVD		20.03.19	19.03.23	4	
		WSJ		20.03.19	19.03.23	4	
		WC		10.03.19	09.03.23	4	
		JVN		10.03.19	09.03.23	3	
		SRGT		10.03.19	09.03.23	3	
		GOP		20.03.19	19.03.23	2	
		LPJ		20.03.19	19.03.23	2	
		Total 33 Stations.				78	

2	Mechanised and Manual cleaning, Housekeeping, Sweeping, Rag Picking, up keep and Rodent Control of Railway Station	SMNH	M/s. D. G. Nakrani.	03.03.19	02.03.23	12	Nil
		GDL		03.03.19	02.03.23	7	
		KSD		03.03.19	02.03.23	5	
		BVP	M/s. Hardik Constructions Co.	03.03.19	02.03.23	1	
		SOJN		06.03.19	05.03.23	6	
		SGD		06.03.19	05.03.19	4	
		DLI		06.03.19	05.03.19	11	
		PIT		12.02.19	11.02.23	4	
		SVKD		12.02.19	11.02.23	5	
		MHV		12.02.19	11.02.23	4	
		VRL	M/s. Orient Agencies	12.02.19	11.02.23	26	
		JND	Welcare Facility Management Pvt. Ltd.	04.03.19	03.03.23	3	
		PBR		04.03.19	03.03.23	2	
		BTD		04.03.19	03.03.23	4	
		BVC	M/s. D. G. Nakrani	04.03.19	03.03.23	5	
		Total 15 Stations				99	

Sr. No	Type of Contract	Station	Name of Party	Date of Starting	Date of Completion	Man powers	Remarks
1	Mechanised and Manual cleaning, Housekeeping, Sweeping, Rag Picking, up keep and Rodent Control of Railway Station	GKD	M/s. Anushree Outsources - Gandhinagar	03.03.19	02.03.19	2	Nil
		VID		03.03.19	02.03.19	2	
		RLA		03.03.19	02.03.19	2	
		RJU		03.03.19	02.03.19	2	
		JA		06.03.19	05.03.23	2	
		DME		06.03.19	05.03.23	2	
		LMO		06.03.19	05.03.23	2	
		KDI		12.02.19	11.02.23	2	
		RUR		12.02.19	11.02.23	3	
		CDA		12.02.19	11.02.23	2	
		LM		12.02.19	11.02.23	4	
		AE		04.03.19	03.03.23	2	
		DARI		04.03.19	03.03.23	2	
		CLC		04.03.19	03.03.23	2	
		BADR		04.03.19	03.03.23	2	
		DJI		04.03.19	03.03.23	2	
		UA		04.03.19	03.03.23	2	
		BHY		04.03.19	03.03.23	2	
		RBR		01.05.19	30.04.23	2	
		VRR		01.04.19	31.03.23	5	
		NUD		01.04.19	31.03.23	3	
		VAL		20.02.19	19.02.23	2	
		Total 22 Stations					51

2.5 From the above table, it has been noticed that cleaning activities have been completely out sourced over 70 Stations at Bhavnagar Division & handed over to various contractors vide Para 2.4 above.

2.6 As per the above Para 2.3 above, total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's of Commercial Dept at Bhavnagar station is 115 out of which there are 83 men on roll working at various station as per summary provided by the Division which includes additional deployments of 16 nos. of manpower within jurisdiction & 32 vacant posts .

a) The cleanliness activity at 70 stations over Bhavnagar station has been outsourced. The details manpower & contractor has been shown vide Para No. 2.4 Therefore, these 115 posts (83Live + 32 Vacant) of Safaiwala's may be surrendered immediately.

b) During the work-study it has been also noticed that manpower of safaiwala has been utilised for cleaning activities even those the safaiwala activities have been outsourced.

2.7 **Existing system of working**

2.8 **Sweeping of Platforms** : The major work of Safaiwala's comprises of sweeping of platforms and collection of refuse from tracks up to platform limits of stations, apart from cleanliness of service buildings, offices, retiring room, waiting rooms, platforms, toilets and circulation area in the station complex. They are also engaged in sweeping of FOBs, waiting halls, water vats, spittoons, retiring rooms and seating arrangements.

2.9 **Proposed system of working**

The work study team made a detailed study into all the aspects of working of Safaiwala's and have concluded that:

(i) The cleanliness activity on all the stations under Bhavnagar division to be outsourced to Private Contractor which will ensure greater discipline and accountability for higher standard of cleanliness as also to tackle the problem of high absenteeism amongst Safaiwala's.

(ii) It should be ensured that the contractors deploy the full sanctioned strength of employees at each station in order to achieve higher standards of cleanliness.

(iii) The posts of Safaiwala's, which have been deployed at stations where cleaning activities have been outsourced to private contractors, may be surrendered immediately.

2.10 CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF WORKLOAD:

- (i) During the study it has been noticed that 218 out of 228 nos. of safaiwala's deployed at various stations through outsourced.
- (ii) The present cadre of safaiwala 115 nos. of safaiwala's deployed at 54 stations for cleanliness activities.
- (iii) After outsourcing of cleanliness activities the manpower available with commercial department needs to re-deployed in other departments as per the requirements by the Divisions.
- (iv) It is observed that even when the cleanliness activities has already been outsourced, the manpower of Railway safaiwala is again utilised for the same activities.
- (v) The re-deployments of manpower of safaiwala was to be done immediately after award of safaiwala contracts, which has been not duly followed.
- (vi) Division may take immediate steps to redeploy the surplus safaiwala's due to outsourcing, as per policy guidelines.
- (vii) During the study it has been observed that Division has submitted details of deployments of safaiwala's at **54** stations vide **Para 2.3.1** and whereas the contractor has deployed **95** numbers of safaiwala also at the same station which is not where justified.

As per **Para 2.3.1 & 2.3.2** above, Contractor has already deployed 218 nos. of manpower at various stations out of 228 manpower, as per the terms & conditions of contracts awarded to private contractors. Therefore, Railway staff currently utilised for cleaning activities is found surplus.

- (viii) Administration may take immediate action for surrender of 115 safaiwala's posts to avoid double payment for same activities which has already been outsourced.

2.11 Recommendations:

2.12 Recommendation No.1

As per Para 2.3, Safaiwala's have been deployed by Railway at **54** stations over Bhavnagar division. During the works –Study it has been noticed that the cleanliness activities have been completely outsourced to private contractors vide **Para 2.4** over **70** stations and **218** out of **228** manpower deployed over **70** stations vide **Para 2.4**, therefore **115** safaiwala posts (**32 Vacant + 83 Live**) may be surrendered immediately.

2.13 Summary of Recommendation:

Category	Existing Cadre	Men on roll	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Safaiwala (House Keeping Assistant) Level-I	115	83	00	115	32	83

CHAPTER – III

FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

**Safaiwala
(House Keeping Assistant)
Level-I**

- 3.1 After carefully scrutinizing the current working scenario of Safaiwala's, the work study team has identified **a total of 115 posts as surplus.**
- 3.2 The work study team has identified **115 *Safaiwala's posts*** as surplus for surrender, 32 vacant and 83 live posts. On implication of the study report & surrendering the 115 posts of Safaiwala(House Keeping assistant) of commercial department-BVC Division found surplus to the requirement, annual recurring saving will be achieved as tabulated as under:

Category	No. of Surplus Posts	Average cost per employee	Annual Savings
Safaiwala (House Keeping Assistant) Level-I	115	Rs 6,45,968	Rs7,42,86,320/-

- 3.3 On implementation of the recommendations brought out in the work study report annual recurring saving of **Rs. 7,42,86,320/-** per annum can be achieved.

...END...