

a

EASTERN RAILWAY

WORK STUDY REPORT

ON

REVIEW OF WORKLOAD OF SAFAIWALA AT RAILWAY HOSPITAL JAMALPUR UNDER MATRON OF MEDICAL DEPARTMENT

(STUDY NO.WSER - 19 / 18-19)

Submitted on 29.11.2018

Study conducted by:- Sri P.K. Mondal, CPLI

Study guided by:- Sri S.Chandra, Asstt. Efficiency Officer, E.Rly

BY
CENTRAL PLANNING ORGANISATION
GM'S EFFICIENCY CELL
EASTERN RAILWAY
KOLKATA

CONTENTS

Sl. No.	Particulars	Page No.
1	<i>Acknowledgement</i>	1
	<i>Terms of Reference</i>	
	<i>Summary of Recommendation</i>	
2	<i>Executive Summary</i>	2
3	<u>CHAPTER-I</u> <i>Introduction</i>	3
4	<u>CHAPTER-II</u> <i>Existing Scenario</i>	4 - 7
5	<u>CHAPTER-III</u> <i>Critical Analysis</i>	8 - 14
6	<u>CHAPTER-IV</u> <i>Financial Appraisal</i>	15
7	<i>ANNEXURES</i>	<i>Annexure I, II & II</i>

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The study team is very much thankful to Dr. M. Chakraborty, CMS/ JMP. Study team is also very thankful to Chief Matron for the appropriate opinion and co-operation for conducting the subject work study.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

The subject workstudy has been undertaken by the GM's Efficiency Cell of Eastern Railway in financial year 2018-19 under the following terms of reference:-

- (i) Evaluate the quantum of work.
- (ii) Examine the deployment of Safaiwala against workload.
- (iii) Scrutinize the benefit of participation of foreign agency in cleaning work.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATION

<i>Sl. No.</i>	<i>Recommendation</i>	<i>Para reference</i>
1	Keeping in view of the financial benefits of Railway due to outsourcing, it is recommended that the Revised requirement of departmental safaiwala at Jamalpur hospital will be 44 as against the existing Sanctioned Strength of 63 posts which will result in surrender of <u>19 posts of safaiwala</u> inclusive of 7 vacant posts.	3.13.1

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

<i>Study Name & No.:</i>	REVIEW OF WORKLOAD OF SAFAIWALA AT RAILWAY HOSPITAL JAMALPUR UNDER MATRON OF MEDICAL DEPARTMENT (Study No.WSER -- 19/ 18-19)
<i>Year of conducting the study:</i>	2018 - 19
<i>Terms of reference:</i>	(i) Evaluate the quantum of existing workload. (ii) Examine the deployment of Safaiwalas against workload. (iii) Analyze the benefit of participation of private agency in cleaning work.
<i>Methodology:</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Collection of data. • Discussion with officers and Chief Matron/ JMP Hospital. • Study of existing workload and manpower. • Critical analysis of existing workload. • Scrutinize the financial benefits achieved due to outsourcing of cleaning activities to private agencies.
<i>Existing Sanctioned Strength</i>	63
<i>Existing Men on Roll</i>	56
Proposed Surrender	19

Justification
Assessment is based on the analysis of financial savings achieved due to outsourcing of the cleaning activities at Jamalpur Railway Hospital.

CHAPTER-I

1.0 INTRODUCTION:

1.1 Railways are the most preferred mode of transport for the masses in India, running 11,000 trains every day in which 7000 are passenger trains and handling approximately 1.4 crore passengers per day. One of the commitments of the Railways in its 'Citizen Charter on Passenger Services on Indian Railways' is to provide safe and dependable train services to the passengers and ensure adequate passenger amenities in trains and at Railway station, which includes provision of clean and hygienic surroundings both at Railway stations and in trains.

1.2 Sanitation means maintaining a clean environment so that the beneficiaries stay in neat and hygienic environment. Railway Stations, hospitals, colonies and all work places are to be maintained in a hygienic and clean manner and adequate steps is to be taken at the planning stage itself. Keeping this objective in view, special emphasis is laid on the collection and disposal of refuse, sewage and sullage in a scientific manner. Sanitation services are provided in all the Railway premises including the Railway hospitals, colonies, Railway stations, circulating areas, Railway Yards, offices, coaches and tracks. Cleanliness of these areas is multidisciplinary approach by various departments of the Railways viz. Medical, Engineering, Operating and Mechanical Department.

Among the above mentioned areas, maintaining proper hygiene in hospital is most vital. The Medical department performs the maintenance of sanitation at Railway hospitals under the supervision of Chief Matron.

1.3 Cleanliness in Railway Hospital includes maintaining cleanliness in wards, OPD, Pathology, testing laboratories, latrines/ urinals and sewer inside the hospital premises in addition to a proper waste management system. Railway Hospitals are maintained departmentally through Safaiwalas.

Though, it is keen essential to maintain high level hygiene at hospitals and due to this reason Railway is maintaining this workload wholly through deployment of department staff. However, the cost of maintaining the cleanliness is escalating day by day. So, it is very essential to think over and explore better cost effective alternatives. Effective manpower management and contract management are among the solutions which can be applied. Apart from this, the Railways should have an effective monitoring mechanism in place to ensure quality in cleanliness in related activities.

1.4 Indian Railway is facing tremendous financial crunch after implementation of 6th Pay Commission. Operating ratio is gradually increasing. Though Indian Railway is not a business organization but to survive, it is always essential to make the organization in profit i.e. operating ratio should be less than 1. Performance Efficiency Index shown in the corporate plan published by the Eastern Railway is given below.

2013-14	:	173.32%
2014-15	:	177.27%
2015-16	:	180.75%
2016-17	:	165.25%
2017-18	:	181.15%

1.5 Keeping in view of the present financial condition of Railways and the increasing trend of operating ratio of Eastern Railway, the subject study is conducted with the objective to explore the ways to attain financial savings as much as possible along with the motive to improve the quality of cleanliness.

CHAPTER-II

2.0 EXISTING SCENARIO:

2.1 Jamalpur Main Hospital is situated in the East Colony approximately 2 Kms away from Jamalpur Railway Station in Munger District of Bihar State. There are 211 beds in this hospital including 4 Cabins (*two for male and two for female*). The wards and the administrative wing containing all the OPDs, Dental Clinic, dispensary, medical stores, dressing room, and pathology department are functioning in six separate buildings scattered quite apart within the hospital campus.

2.2 Jamalpur Railway Hospital is housed in 4 blocks. The OPD block is situated adjacent to the entry gate and CMS office is also situated in the same block.

The block in the north direction adjacent to the Main Entry Gate has Male Medical Ward (MMWD), Female Medical Ward (FMWD), Child Ward (CH WD), ICU Ward for male and female. CB and Emergency ward is also situated in this block. Adjacent to this block there is Isolation Ward with 15 beds, which is an extension to Male medical Ward and Female medical ward.

The block at the south direction of OPD block has Operation Theater (OT), Male Surgical ward, UST room, X-Ray room, Physiotherapy room, Endoscopy room, Matron office, etc.

At the farthest end on north side, Female Block is situated. Maternity ward, Female surgical ward and Gynecologic ward are also situated in this block. The Kitchen of the Hospital is also housed in this block.

2.3 All together five Health Units are there under Jamalpur Hospital and situated within 3 KM radius. They are –

- i) Workshop Health Unit (WHU),
- ii) Gate No.6 Health Unit,
- iii) Traffic Health Unit (THU),
- iv) Rampur Health Unit (RHU), and
- v) Daulatpur Health Unit (DHU).

2.4 Chief Medical Superintendent (CMS) / JMP is the overall In-charge of Jamalpur Hospital and Health Units. Along with Doctors, Nurses, Pharmacists, there are various other categories of staff working in the Hospital and Health units. However, as the subject of the study reveals, only safaiwala category staff is under the purview of the study. In present scenario, the whole workload of cleaning activities at Hospital premises and Health Units are catered by departmental safaiwala under supervision of Chief Matron.

2.5 The existing Sanctioned Strength (*Annexure I*) and On-roll position (*collected from Hospital unit*) of Safaiwala as on 12.04.2018 are given in table below:

Designation	Pay Scale & Pay Level	Staff Strength		
		Sanctioned Strength	On-Roll	Vacancy
Safaiwala	Rs. 18000 – 56900/- Level -1	63	56	7

2.6 At Hospital premises, departmental safaiwala are deployed for sweeping, moping and washing with disinfectants in the different wards, Operation theater, pathology, OPD, laboratories and other places. Cleaning of Toilets, Bathrooms, Urinals and Wash Basins are also done by the Safaiwalas. Cleaning at outer area of the Hospital buildings and Garbage disposal from hospital campus are done by the safaiwalas under CHI.

2.7 In present system of working, on-roll 56 nos. of Safaiwala are deployed at Main Hospital and Health Units in three shifts i.e. **Shift 1** (7am – 3 pm), **Shift 2** (3 pm – 10 pm) and **Shift 3** (10 pm – 7 am). At the wards, safaiwalas are deployed in all 3 shifts for maintaining cleanliness round the clock. Whereas in rest of the places like OPD, Pathology, CMS office, testing laboratories, etc which is functional at day shift only; safaiwalas are deployed for day shift. At Health units, safaiwalas are deployed for morning shift and night shift. However, at Traffic Health unit, safaiwalas are deployed for all 3 shifts.

The work point – wise present deployment of Safaiwalas along with the activity is shown in table below:

Sl. No	Area	Shift	Activity	Frequency	Deployment	
					Activity-wise	Total
1.	OPD	7am to 3 pm & 4pm to 6 pm	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	1
			Washing	Once in a week		
2.	CMS Office	7am to 3 pm 4pm to 6 pm	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	1
3.	Pathology	7am to 3 pm 4pm to 6 pm	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	1
4.	<u>Male Medical Ward</u> (MMWD) No. of Beds – 42 & <u>Male ICU Ward</u> No. of Beds - 3	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	3	5
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)		2 times	1	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)		2 times	1	
5.	<u>Female Medical Ward</u> (FMWD) No. of Beds - 28 & <u>Female ICU Ward</u> No. of Beds - 3	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	3	5
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)		2 times	1	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)		2 times	1	
6.	<u>Child Ward</u> (CH WD) No. of Beds - 14	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	2	4
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)		2 times	1	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)		2 times	1	
7.	CB & Emergency Ward	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	3
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)		2 times	1	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)		2 times	1	
8.	Isolation Ward (ISO WD) No. of Beds - 15, Homeopathic Clinic & TB Ward (TB WD)	(7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	1 time	1	1
9.	<u>Maternity Ward</u> (MAT WD) No. of Beds - 26 & <u>Gynecologic Ward</u> (GYN WD) No. of Beds - 10	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	2	4
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)		2 times	1	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)		2 times	1	
10.	Female Surgical Ward No. of Beds - 22	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	3
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)		2 times	1	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)		2 times	1	
11.	Special Ward (SPL WD) [Male Surgical Ward] No. of Beds - 48	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	3	5
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)		2 times	1	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)		2 times	1	

Sl. No	Area	Shift	Activity	Frequency	Deployment	
					Activity-wise	Total
12.	Operation Theater (OT) , Endoscopy Room, TMT Room	(7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	2	2
13.	UST Room, X-Ray Room, Physiotherapy, etc	(7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	1
14.	Workshop Health Unit (WHU)	Shift 1 (7am – 4 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	2
		Shift 2 (4 pm – 7 am)		2 times	1	
15.	Gate No. 6 Health Unit	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	2
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	--	2 times	--	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	
16.	Traffic Health Unit (THU)	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	3
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)		2 times	1	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)		2 times	1	
17.	Rampur Health Unit (RHU)	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	2
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	--	2 times	--	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	
18.	Daulatpur Health Unit (DHU)	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	2
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	--	2 times	--	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	Sweeping and Moping	2 times	1	
TOTAL					47	

2.7.1 The nos. of Safaiwala deployed at different shifts is tabulated as under:

Shifts		Nos. of Safaiwala deployed
Shift 1	(7am – 3 pm) / (7am – 3 pm & 4 pm – 6 pm)	27
Shift 2	(3 pm – 10 pm)	8
Shift 3	(10 pm – 7 am)	12
Rest Giver (RG) and Leave Reserve (LR)		9
Total		56

2.8 The total workload of Safaiwala under Chief Matron is tabulated as under:

Sl. No.	Description of work	Total Volume of Workload in Sqft/ Rft	
1.	Manual Sweeping	<i>All Service buildings of Main Hospital and All Health Units</i>	<u>1176129 Sqft</u>
	Collection of Garbage from sweeping of area of and deposited in dustbins		
2.	Washing and mopping	<i>All Service buildings of Main Hospital and All Health Units</i>	<u>122541 Sqft</u>
3.	Washing with hydrants and mopping		
4.	Swabbing		
5.	Drain cleaning	<i>Drains</i>	<u>10883 Rft</u>
	Removal and disposal of accumulated slit		
6.	Cleaning of Latrine	<i>Total nos. of Latrines</i>	48 Nos.
	Cleaning of Bathrooms	<i>Total nos. of Bathrooms</i>	27 Nos.
	Cleaning of Urinals	<i>Total nos. of Urinals</i>	12 Nos.
	Cleaning of Wash Basins	<i>Total nos. of Wash Basins</i>	40 Nos.

CHAPTER-III

3.0 CRITICAL ANALYSIS

- 3.1 Cleanliness plays a vital role to maintain a hygienic condition in the hospital. But, after implementation of 7th Pay Commission, the expenditure due to cleanliness in various areas including hospital wing has become costlier to Railways. In this regard, Railway has thought over the curtailment of expenditure for different activities. Likewise, an active step has also been taken by the Medical department to bring down the expenditure due to sanitation activities in the different areas of the hospital premises.

In order to implement this concept, Eastern Railway's zonal hospital i.e B.R Singh Hospital (BRSH), Sealdah has already taken initiative and outsourced the cleaning activities of some areas of the Hospital premises (*Annexure II*).

- 3.2 In the similar way, the possibility of outsourcing of cleaning activities at Jamalpur Hospital has been explored in the subject study.

The contractual rate of cleaning at B.R Singh Hospital, Sealdah has been taken into consideration by the study team to scrutinize its financial viability before adaption of the concept of outsourcing of cleaning activities at Jamalpur Hospital.

- 3.3 It is observed from the contractual document of B.R Singh Hospital/ Sealdah, that the cleaning activities of some areas of BRSH are catered by the labours of contractual agency in day time only and departmental safaiwala are deployed to cater the cleaning workload in evening and night shift as a regular measure.

- 3.4 While exploring the feasibility of outsourcing of cleaning activities at Jamalpur Hospital, the study team has considered the following points incorporating the present system of working on contractual measure at B.R Singh Hospital, Sealdah.

- 3.4.1 As per outsourcing model of the cleaning activities done in day shift at BRSH, an analysis has been done in a similar manner in case of cleaning workload of Jamalpur Hospital.

So far cleaning workload of evening and night shift are concerned, departmental safaiwalas of Jamalpur Hospital have been proposed to be deployed as per existing pattern.

- 3.4.2 It is very essential to maintain high level of hygienic atmosphere at Operation Theater (OT), pathology, testing labs, X-Ray rooms, etc. Hence, it is proposed by the study team that the workload of maintaining cleanliness at these areas should be done departmentally as per present practice.

Though the entire cleaning workload of the wards in day shift is proposed to be tackled by the labour of contractual agency, yet a skeleton structure of departmental safaiwala is also suggested to be retained in day shift in order to meet up the needs of the patients in case of exigencies.

- 3.5 In order to explore the feasibility of outsourcing, the manpower needed to cater the cleaning workload of day shift at JMP Hospital & Health Units has been assessed in the following table as per Medical Department's Yardstick on Sanitary Staff (*Annexure-III*):

3.5.1 REQUIREMENT OF SAFAIWALA/SAFAIWALI TO CATER EXISTING DAY SHIFT WORKLOAD OF CLEANING ACTIVITIES AS PER YARD STICK AND ASSESSMENT BASED ON PHYSICAL OBSERVATION

Sl. No.	Areas of Working (approx)	Activities	Frequency of cleaning	Total Volume of Work in Sqft	Present Yard Stick	Requirement of Manpower
1	All Service buildings of Main Hospital and All Health Units - <u>1176129 Sqft</u>	Manual Sweeping	Once daily	<u>1176129 Sqft</u>	60000 sqft/8 hrs/Safaiwala	$\frac{1176129}{60000} = 19.6$
		Collection of Garbage from sweeping of area of and deposited in dustbins			160000 Sqft /8 hrs /Safaiwala	$\frac{1176129}{160000} = 7.35$
2	All Service buildings of Main Hospital and All Health Units - <u>122541 Sqft</u>	Washing and mopping	Once daily	<u>122541 Sqft</u>	1000 Sqft/6 minutes/Safaiwala (80000 Sqft /8 hrs /Safaiwala)	$\frac{122541}{80000} = 1.53$
3	All Service buildings of Main Hospital and All Health Units - <u>122541 Sqft</u>	Washing with hydrants and mopping	Once daily	<u>122541 Sqft</u>	1000 Sqft/6 minutes/Safaiwala (80000 Sqft /8 hrs /Safaiwala)	$\frac{122541}{80000} = 1.53$
4	All Service buildings of Main Hospital and All Health Units - <u>122541 Sqft</u>	Swabing	Once daily	<u>122541 Sqft</u>	1000 Sqft/3.75 minutes/Safaiwala (128000 Sqft /8 hrs /Safaiwala)	$\frac{122541}{128000} = 0.96$
5	Drains - <u>10883 Rft</u>	Drain cleaning	Once daily	<u>10883 Rft</u>	100 Rft/ 7 min. / Safaiwala (6857 Rft /8 hr /Safaiwala)	$\frac{10883}{6857} = 1.59$
		Removal and disposal of accumulated slit			100 Rft / 12.5 min / Safaiwala (3840 Rft / 8 hr/Safaiwala)	$\frac{10883}{3840} = 2.83$
6	a) Latrines	Cleaning of Latrine	Once daily	<u>48 nos.</u>	48 latrines/ 8 hr/ Safaiwala	$\frac{48}{48} = 1$
	b) Bathrooms	Cleaning of Bathrooms	Once daily	<u>27 nos.</u>	As per physical Observation	5
	c) Urinals	Cleaning of Urinals	Once daily	<u>12 nos.</u>	48 latrines/Urinals / 8 hr/ Safaiwala	$\frac{12}{48} = 0.25$
	d)Wash Basins	Cleaning of Wash Basins	Once daily	<u>40 nos.</u>	As per physical Observation	2
7	For miscellaneous and other workloads					2
TOTAL						45.64 ≈ 46

3.5.2 As per Yardstick, the revised requirement of safaiwala has been worked out to 46 in total based on the existing cleaning workload of Jamalpur Hospital in day shift.

3.6 At present, cleaning activities of some of the areas have been outsourced in B.R Singh Hospital which is shown in *Annexure II*. The details of contractual agreement based on which the outsourcing of cleaning activities in BRSH are done in day shift, may be seen from the following table:

Name of work	Daily mechanized dry & wet cleaning of indoor & outdoor of B.R. Singh Hospital along with pest, worm, vector & rodent control of indoor & outdoor at B.R. Singh Hospital complex including residential area of B.R. Singh Hospital for 1095 days except Sundays i.e 939 working days
Agreement No.	H/San/Agt/MC/BRSH/16 dtd. 21/11/16
Agreement Value	Rs. 78,36,894/- (Rupees seventy eight lakh thirty six thousand eight hundred ninety four only)
Duration of Contract	03/10/16 to 02/10/19
Name of the firm	M/s Young Bengal Cooperative Labour contract Society Ltd 14/1, Nirode Bihari Millick Road, Kolkata-06

As per schedule of work shown in *Annexure II*, the cleaning activities being outsourced in BRSH are as under:

DESCRIPTION OF WORK	
S. No	<i>Name of work with its location:</i>
1.	Daily thorough mechanized cleaning (dry & wet) of all rooms, OPD Doctor rooms, Corridor, Verrandah, Emergency Ward, Dispensary, along with all toilets, wash basin, urinals, dusting and cleaning of cobwebs, signage etc at Ground floor and collection, removal of all accumulated litter, garbage, dust from said area to scheduled dustbin by covered poly bucket during 07 to 15 hrs for 1095 days except Sundays i.e 939 working days Frequency of work – To keep all time clean & tidy during working hour.
2.	Daily thorough mechanized cleaning (dry & wet) of all rooms, OPD Doctor rooms, Corridor, Verrandah along with all toilets, wash basin, urinals, dusting and cleaning of cobwebs, signage etc at 1 st floor and collection, removal of all accumulated litter, garbage, dust from said area to scheduled dustbin by covered poly bucket during 07 to 15 hrs for 1095 days except Sundays i.e 939 working days Frequency of work – To keep all time clean & tidy during working hour.
3.	Daily thorough mechanized cleaning (dry & wet) of all rooms, OPD Doctor rooms, Corridor, Verrandah, offices, Auditorium along with all toilets, wash basin, urinals, dusting and cleaning of cobwebs, signage etc at 2 nd & 3 rd floor and collection, removal of all accumulated litter, garbage, dust from said area to scheduled dustbin by covered poly bucket during 07 to 15 hrs for 1095 days except Sundays i.e 939 working days Frequency of work – To keep all time clean & tidy during working hour.
4.	Daily thorough mechanized cleaning (dry & wet) of all rooms with officer's chamber and all offices at administrative block & outside offices, Corridor, Verrandah, Record room, Central Medical Store, Dormitory along with stairs, Meeting room and all toilets, wash basin, urinals, dusting and cleaning of cobwebs, signage and collection, removal of all accumulated litter, garbage, dust from said area to scheduled dustbin by covered poly bucket during 07 to 15 hrs for 1095 days except Sundays i.e 939 working days Frequency of work – To keep all time clean & tidy during working hour.
5.	Daily thorough mechanized cleaning (dry & wet), scrubbing, washing, moping of 03 Nos of wards per day out of 18 Nos of wards including 05 nos of stair cases of 5 th & 2 nd storied building including all lifts, concourse, corridor, urinal Lavatory, wash basin, toilets, removal of stains including wall base, de-cobwebing during 10 to 18 hrs for 1095 days except Sundays i.e 939 working days Frequency of work – 01 time in a shift and as when required to keep all time clean & tidy.

6.	Pest, worm, vector & rodent control at Indoor, Outdoor & residential complex of B.R. Singh Hospital/ Sealdah (a) Larvicide's treatment at all drains, backyard, all corners with Baytex 1000/Temphos and hand operated pressure pumps, (b) Adult mosquito control at Indoor ward, lobbies, Stair lobbies, outdoor & residential area with Propoxur 20% (EC), (c) Flies control at total hospital area & residential complex with Manik Powder (Sugar Coated) and powder sprayer or manual distribution, (d) Cockroach control at Hospital wards, beside table, rack, bed, Kitchen area, office area and food serving trolley with Propoxur 20% (EC), Koifeal Powder & Maxforce Gel, and hand operated pressure pump, Gel Injection provider, (e) Anti termite spray at all offices, wards etc with Premises and hand operated sprayer, (f) Rodent control at total hospital complex with Glue board, Bromadiline baits and rat cages by manual process. All works to be catered out for 1095 days except Sundays i.e 939 working days
----	--

- 3.7 It is noticed during the study period that the magnitude of workload of cleaning activities being outsourced during the day period in BRSH is not same as the magnitude of cleaning workload at JMP Hospital, though the nature of activities of both the hospitals is of similar kind. Hence, the rate of contractual labour in BRSH per shift has here been considered, while the assessment due to outsourcing is done in case of JMP hospital.

The total contractual rate for catering cleaning activities at B.R Singh hospital/ Sealdah is Rs. 78,36,894/- for 3 years (*excluding Sundays*) i.e 939 working days. It is evident from *Annexure II* that 15 contractual labours are usually deployed by the private agency for catering the workload at BRSH which is mentioned in table under para 3.6.

So, the expenditure incurred per day for each contractual labour is assessed as under

$$\frac{78,36,894}{15 \times 939} = \text{Rs. } 556.4 \text{ /-}$$

- 3.8 Quoting the para reference 3.4.2, it is proposed that the cleaning activities of OT, pathology, etc should be catered by departmental staff as per existing practice. It is also proposed to deploy a few departmental staff in day shift to tackle the workload arisen out in case of exigencies.

Consequent upon the analysis done based on existing pattern of deployment of Safaiwala as well as discussion with Chief Matron, the revised bare requirement of departmental safaiwalas for day, evening & night shift has been assessed in consideration with the above mentioned para which is as follows.

Sl. No.	Area	Shift	Existing Deployment (table under para 2.7)	Assessed bare requirement based on Physical observation and present deployment	Remarks
1.	OPD, CMS Office, Pathology	7am to 3 pm 4pm to 6 pm	3	2	OPD & CMS office proposed for outsourcing at day shift
2.	Male Medical Ward (MMWD) & Male ICU Ward	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	3	1	Day shift workload proposed for outsourcing
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	1	1	Proposed to be catered
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	1	1	Departmentally
3.	Female Medical Ward (FMWD) & Female ICU Ward	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	3	1	Day shift workload proposed for outsourcing
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	1	1	Proposed to be catered
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	1	1	Departmentally
4.	Child Ward (CH WD)	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	2	1	Day shift workload proposed for outsourcing
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	1	1	Proposed to be catered
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	1	1	Departmentally

5.	Homeopathic Clinic, TB Ward, Isolation Ward, CB and Emergency Ward	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	2	1	Day shift workload proposed for outsourcing
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	1 (ISO WD, CB and Emergency Ward)	1	Proposed to be catered Departmentally
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	1 (ISO WD, CB and Emergency Ward)	1	
6.	Maternity Ward (MAT WD) and Gynecologic Ward (GYN WD)	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	2	1	Day shift workload proposed for outsourcing
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	1	1	Proposed to be catered Departmentally
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	1	1	
7.	Female Surgical Ward	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	1	1	Day shift workload proposed for outsourcing
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	1	1	Proposed to be catered Departmentally
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	1	1	
8.	Special Ward (SPL WD) [Male Surgical Ward]	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	3	1	Day shift workload proposed for outsourcing
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	1	1	Proposed to be catered Departmentally
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	1	1	
9.	Operation Theater (OT) , Endoscopy Room, TMT Room	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	2	2	Proposed to be catered Departmentally
10.	UST Room, X-Ray Room, Physiotherapy, etc	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	1	2	Proposed to be catered Departmentally
11.	Workshop Health Unit (WHU)	Shift 1 (7 pm – 4 am)	1	--	Day shift workload proposed for outsourcing
		Shift 2 (4 pm – 7 am)	1	1	Proposed to be catered Departmentally
12.	Gate No. 6 Health Unit	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	1	--	Day shift workload proposed for outsourcing
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	--	--	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	1	1	Proposed to be catered Departmentally
13.	Traffic Health Unit (THU)	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	1	--	Day shift workload proposed for outsourcing
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	1	1	Proposed to be catered Departmentally
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	1	1	Proposed to be catered Departmentally
14.	Rampur Health Unit (RHU)	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	1	--	Day shift workload proposed for outsourcing
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	--	--	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	1	1	Proposed to be catered Departmentally
15.	Daulatpur Health Unit (DHU)	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	1	--	Day shift workload proposed for outsourcing
		Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	--	--	
		Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	1	1	Proposed to be catered Departmentally
16.	For other miscellaneous and non-schedule workload not covered in the contractual agreement	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm)	--	2	Proposed to be catered Departmentally
TOTAL			47	35	

- 3.8.1 It is to mention here that the Hospital wards & the Traffic Health Unit are kept open for all the 7 days in a week and the rest of the places are closed on Sundays and holidays. Out of total 35 safaiwalas, 23 safaiwalas are assessed as bare requirement for Hospital wards and Traffic Health Unit and therefore, Rest Giver (RG) @ 16.66% is provided for these 23 staff.

REVISED BARE REQUIREMENT (from above table under para 3.8)	35
Rest Giver (RG) @ 16.66%	16.66 % of 23 = 3.82 ≈ 4 (Say)
Leave Reserve (LR) @ 12.5%	12.5% of (35 + 4) = 4.85 ≈ 5 (Say)
REVISED REQUIREMENT (including RG & LR)	44

- 3.9 Quoting the para reference 2.7.1 and 3.8, the summarized position regarding revised requirement of departmental safaiwala on introduction of outsourcing in day shift is as under:

Existing Deployment (shown in para 2.7.1)					Revised Deployment (as per paras 3.8 & 3.8.1)				
Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm) / (7am – 3 pm & 4 pm – 6 pm)	Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	RG & LR	Total	Shift 1 (7am – 3 pm) / (7am – 3 pm & 4 pm – 6 pm)	Shift 2 (3 pm – 10 pm)	Shift 3 (10 pm – 7 am)	RG & LR	Total
27	8	12	9	56	15	8	12	9	44

- 3.9.1 Consequent upon the introduction of outsourcing concept for day shift at Jamalpur Hospital & Health units like BRSH (para 3.6), the revised requirement as assessed will be 44 in total (including RG & LR) against the existing deployment of 56 safaiwalas.

Hence, it is concluded as per para reference 3.9 that the revised requirement of Safaiwala will be 15 in day shift (excluding RG & LR) due to introduction of outsourcing instead of deployment of 46 safaiwala in day shift as assessed in para 3.5.1 as per Yardstick. While assessing the revised requirement of safaiwala, the study team does not feel any necessity to follow the formula of Yardstick in day shift due to adaption of the concept of outsourcing in day shift. Consequent upon the introduction of the concept of outsourcing, the departmental manpower in day shift is not required to be retained except in few cases (mentioned in para 3.4.2) during assessment of the revised requirement of safaiwala. It is essential to mention here that the staff deployed in evening and night shifts have been proposed to be kept as it is. The RG & LR have been considered on the total revised requirement of safaiwala which is shown in para 3.8.1.

- 3.10 As per assessment done in the above paragraphs, the total requirement of departmental staff duly revised would be 44 due to introduction of outsourcing concept in day shift cleaning activities which would result in surplus of (63 – 44) = 19 posts.

Average annual expenditure on departmental Safaiwala is calculated as under.

Category	Pay Level	Pay Scale	Mean Pay	DA @ 9%	Total per Month	Total per Annual
Safaiwala	Level I (GP –Rs. 1800/-)	Rs. 18000 – 56900/-	Rs. 37450/-	Rs. 3371/-	Rs. 40821/-	Rs. 4,89,852/-

The total annual expenditure for 19 posts of Safaiwala is assessed as Rs. 93,07,188/- i.e.

Rs. 4,89,852/- X 19 = Rs. 93,07,188/-

- 3.10 The annual expenditure to be incurred due to outsourcing of the cleaning activities in day shift considering contractual rate of B.R Singh hospital is calculated as under.

Rs. 556.4 /- (para 3.7) X **46** (para 3.5.1) X **313** (working days in a year excluding Sunday)
= Rs 80,11,047/-

- 3.11 From para 3.9 and 3.10, the financial saving is calculated as under.

Rs. 93,07,188/- - Rs 80,11,047/- = Rs. 12,96,141/-.

The above calculation reflects an annual savings of Rs. 12,96,141/- due to outsourcing of cleaning activities at Jamalpur Hospital as per contractual rate of B.R Singh Hospital, Sealdah.

It may also be highlighted that, the medical department of Jamalpur hospital will get much more manpower for the cleaning activities in lieu of 19 posts of existing departmental staff which would certainly lead to enhance the quality of sanitation.

- 3.12 Hence, it can be concluded that outsourcing of cleaning activities results in reasonable financial savings along with improvement in quality of cleaning.

So, it is recommended that the cleaning activities of Jamalpur Hospital may be outsourced on the basis of analysis and discussions done in the above paragraphs,.

Therefore, the proposed requirement of departmental safaiwala will be 44 as assessed by the study team (*mentioned in para 3.10.1*) for the emergency workload and manning of evening and night shifts.

Hence, 19 posts i.e. (63 – 44 = 19) have been proposed to be made surplus due to introduction of outsourcing of the cleaning activities at Jamalpur Hospital.

- 3.13 Quoting the para reference 2.5 and 3.12, the summarized position regarding daily revised requirement of departmental safaiwala due to introduction of outsourcing in day shift at JMP Hospital is as under:

<i>Existing Sanctioned Strength</i>	<i>Existing Men-on-roll</i>	<i>Existing Vacancy</i>	<i>Revised requirement</i>	<i>Proposed Surplus</i>
63	56	7	44	19

3.13.1 **Recommendation:** -

Keeping in view of the financial benefits of Railway due to outsourcing, it is recommended that the Revised requirement of departmental safaiwala will be 44 as against the existing Sanctioned Strength of 63 posts which will result in surrender of 19 posts of safaiwala inclusive of 7 vacant posts.

CHAPTER-IV**4.0 FINANCIAL APPRAISAL:**

- 4.1 As per recommendation made in Para 3.13.1, the total surplus posts works out to **19 posts** after introduction of outsourcing of cleaning activities at Jamalpur hospital & Health units.

A statement showing the total annual financial savings on account of surrender of **19** posts is furnished below.

<i>Category</i>	<i>Pay Level</i>	<i>Pay Scale</i>	<i>Mean Pay (in Rs)</i>	<i>DA @ 9% (in Rs)</i>	<i>Total per Month (in Rs)</i>	<i>No. of posts Recommended for Surrender</i>	<i>Monthly savings of total staff (in Rs)</i>	<i>Annual savings. (in lakhs Rs)</i>
Safaiwala	Level I (GP –Rs. 1800/-)	Rs. 18000 – 56900/-	37450/-	3371/-	40821/-	19	7,75,599/-	93.07

Thus, the annual financial savings works out to **Rs. 93.07 lakhs.**