

EASTERN RAILWAY

**WORKSTUDY REPORT
ON**

**REVIEW OF SAFAIWALA DEPLOYED IN THE SANITARY WING
VIS-À-VIS SHOP WING AT LILUAH WORKSHOP UNDER CWM/LLH**

(STUDY NO.WSER- 04 /18-19)

(Submitted on 29.06.2018)

Study conducted by: Sri A. K. Chatterjee, WSI

Study guided by: Sri S. Chandra, AEO

BY
CENTRAL PLANNING ORGANISATION
GM'S EFFICIENCY CELL
KOLKATA

CONTENTS

Sl.No.	Subject	Page No.
1.	Acknowledgement, Authority & Terms of Reference, Methodology adopted & Summary of Recommendation	III
2	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	IV
3.	CHAPTER-I Introduction	1-2
4	CHAPTER-II Present scenario and Critical Analysis	3-10
5	CHAPTER-III Financial Appraisal	11
6	ANNEXURE	A to F

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The study team hereby acknowledges its deep gratitude to CWM/LLH Workshop for his valuable suggestions and guidelines to the study team for conducting the subject study in a right path. The study team is thankful to Dy.CME(M), Dy.CME(P), PE, AME/M& AME(C) for their heartiest cooperation by supplying all necessary information and related data to complete this study in time.

METHODOLOGY ADOPTED

The following methodology has been adopted in carrying out the study:

1. Basically, this study has been conducted on the basis of the available data obtained during physical observation..Therefore, the Utilization factor of Safaiwala along with quality of cleaning has been judged. Lastly feasibility of outsourcing has neatly been explored in order to improve the productivity of this wing.

AUTHORITY & TERMS OF REFERENCE

The subject study has been undertaken as desired by the competent authority.

- a) To assess the present involvement of staff in their working field.
- b) To study the present pattern of working..
- c) To evaluate the actual requirement of manpower due to introduction of outsourcing.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATION

Sl. No.	Recommendation	Para Ref.
1.	It is recommended that the revised Sanctioned strength of safaiwala will be 14 as against the existing Sanctioned strength of 94 posts which will result in surrender of 80 posts of safaiwala from LLH workshop due to outsourcing of the entire cleaning activities at LLH workshop.	2.2.3.1

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Study Name & No.	REVIEW OF SAFAIWALA DEPLOYED IN THE SANITARY WING VIS-À-VIS SHOP WING AT LILUAH WORKSHOP UNDER CWM/LLH (STUDY NO.WSER- 04 /18-19)
Year of conducting the study:	2017-18
Terms of reference:	<p>To assess the present involvement of staff in their working field.</p> <p>To study the present pattern of working..</p> <p>To evaluate the actual requirement of manpower due to introduction of outsourcing</p>
Methodology:	Basically, this study has been conducted on the basis of the available data obtained during physical observation..Therefore, the Utilization factor of Safaiwala along with quality of cleaning has been judged. Lastly feasibility of outsourcing has neatly been explored in order to improve the productivity of this wing.
Total Sanctioned Strength	94
Existing Men on Roll	54
Proposed Manpower i.e. REVISED S/S	14
Vacant post	40
Proposed Surrender	80
Justification	
ASSESSMENT OF REVISED SANCTIONED STRENGTH AND PROPOSED SURRENDER BASED ON INTRODUCTION OF OUTSOURCING OF ENTIRE CLEANING ACTIVITIES OF LLH WORKSHOP.	

CHAPTER-I

1.0 INTRODUCTION:

1.1 **Indian Railways** is an Indian state owned enterprise, owned and operated by the Government of India through the Ministry of Railways. It is one of the world's largest railway networks. Indian Railways is the world's ninth largest commercial or utility employer, by number of employees, with over 1.4 million employees. Indian Railway is not a mere operation. It is an institution. It is an industry. It is a prime mover of India's infrastructure. As of December 2017, it transported over 27 million passengers daily.

1.2 Indian Railway is facing tremendous financial crunch after implementation of 7th Pay Commission. Operating ratio is gradually increasing. Though Indian Railway is not a business organization but to survive, it is always essential to make the organization in profit i.e. operating ratio should be less than 100. Performance Efficiency Index shown in the corporate plan published by the Eastern Railway, the "operating ratios" from 2013-14 to 2017-18 are given below.

2013-14	:	173.32%
2014-15	:	177.27%
2015-16	:	180.75%
2016-17	:	165.25%
2017-18	:	178.76% (Proposed)

1.3 The subject work study has been undertaken to review the quality of sanitary services vis-à-vis utilization of safaiwala for such services at CWM / LLH'S Administrative building and all kinds of cleaning activities in & around the LLH workshop vis-à-vis utilization of safaiwala deployed for such activities working under the overall control of CWM/LLH. Keeping in view the financial achievement of railway, the feasibility of outsourcing of the said activities has been explored by the study team.

1.4 With the introduction of Mechanized process of cleaning, it will be easier to make the qualitative surroundings clean and hygienic in less manpower with better quality. As the subject work study is undertaken to review the existing deployment of Safaiwalas vis-à-vis their workload as a regular manner, it is essential to assess the optimum utilization of Safaiwalas to cater the daily workload with qualitative cleaning. The subject study is mainly undertaken to review the improvement of quality of cleaning drastically along with remarkable financial savings due to outsourcing.

1.5 One of the commitments of the Railways in its 'Citizen Charter on Passenger Services on Indian Railways' is to provide safe and dependable train services to the passengers and ensure adequate passenger amenities in trains and at Railway station, which includes provision of clean and hygienic surroundings both at Railway stations and inside the train compartments, Latrine & Lavatories, Kitchens, etc

- 1.6 The term 'Sanitation' means maintaining a clean environment so that the beneficiaries are able to stay in neat and hygienic environment. Railway Stations, Rly. Colonies and all work places are to be maintained in a hygienic and uncontaminated manner. However, adequate measures needs to be thought about at the planning stage itself.
- 1.7 Keeping the objective in view, special emphasis is laid on the Waste Management i.e. collection and disposal of refuse, sewage and garbage in a scientific manner. Sanitation services are provided in all the Railway premises including the Railway colonies, Railway stations, circulating areas, Railway Yards, offices, coaches and tracks. Cleanliness of these areas is multidisciplinary approach by various departments of the Railways viz. Medical, Engineering, Operating and Mechanical Department. The Medical Department performs the Sanitation job at Railway colonies and major stations under the supervision of Health Inspectors.
- 1.8 For providing a clean and hygienic environment to the passengers in Railway premises, the Railways need adequate infrastructure as well as amenities commensurate with the quantum of passenger traffic handled at stations.
- 1.9 Railway Board laid down guidelines prescribing a quantitative scale of minimum essential amenities for each category of station. These amenities were to be augmented at a higher scale based on actual passenger traffic handled and were called 'recommended amenities'. Some of these amenities have a direct bearing on cleanliness of stations such as drinking water, seating arrangements, waiting halls, toilets and urinals.
- 1.10 Railway stations are maintained either departmentally through departmental 'Safaiwala' or through 'Outsourcing by Contractual Agencies'. Effective manpower management and contracts are therefore, essential. Keeping the above ideas into consideration, the study team has concentrated on the existing pattern of working and existing deployment of Safaiwalas according to their work point.
- 1.11 The subject study has been undertaken by the GM's Efficiency Cell consequent upon the directives of Railway Board. The main theme of the study is to Review the effective utilization of Safaiwala keeping in view the financial achievements of Railway. The feasibility of outsourcing has also been kept in view, while studying.

CHAPTER-II

2.0 Existing Scenario & Critical Analysis

2.1 During study period, all the sections at LLH WORKSHOP have been visited at random to observe the present process of workings of safaiwala as well as the effective utilization of cleaning staff to cater the daily out-turn. During pilot study, it is felt justified by the study team that a work study on review of safaiwala vis-à-vis its workload in LLH workshop may be conducted immediately which may give a scope of surrender of posts of safaiwala. Keeping the above stated concept in view, a thorough study has been conducted on the various cleaning activities done by the safaiwala in the sanitary wing and also in the different shops at LLH Work shop.

While studying the workings of safaiwala under CWM/LLH, it is noticed that the entire safaiwala staff for cleaning activities of various nature are group-wise deployed in two wings, one group in SHOP wing and other group in SANITARY wing at LLH Workshop.

2.1.1 **The workings of safaiwala in & around the different shops at LLH workshop are as under.**

- 1) The cleaning & de-silting work related to all drains located in & around the shops of LLH workshop as per **Annexure – ‘A’**.
- 2) The sweeping workload of entire road area at LLH workshop as furnished in **Annexure- ‘B’**.
- 3) The cleaning of service building located either inside the different shops or nearby the shops at LLH workshop.
- 4) Accumulation of garbage & silts from each & every shop floors, roads & drains. Thereafter, the accumulated garbage & silts are disposed off to the schedule dustbin located near by the shops. Afterwards, these accumulated garbage are finally disposed of by truck with the help of contractor's labour.
- 5) Accumulation of scrap materials from each & every shop floors and the accumulated scrap materials are segregated in Ferrous & non-ferrous groups for onward disposal of the same to the Belur scrap yard by truck with the help of contractor's labour.

2.1.1.1 Besides it, the cleaning, scrubbing & sweeping activities of inside portion of the shop floors along with its pit cleaning & scrubbing works are presently done by the contractor's labour on contractual measure. A statement reflecting the status of outsourcing of the pit cleaning and shop floor cleaning (inside portion only) is enclosed as **Annexure –‘C’**.

2.1.1.2 The existing staff position under ‘shop wing’ indicating Sanctioned Strength & Men-on-Roll of Safaiwala in the different shops at LLH Work shop, is as under.

Sl. No.	Designation	Pay Scale & Pay Band	Staff Strength (As per BOS of June 2018)		
			Sanctioned Strength	Men-On-Roll	Vacancy
1.	Safaiwala (Different Shops)	GP-1800/-	39	25	14
2.	Safaiwala (Hindi School)	GP-1800/-	01	00	01
	TOTAL		40	25	15

2.1.1.3 The breakup of shop-wise present deployment of 25 no of safaiwala under shop wing is as follows.

SL.NO	SHOP	S/S	MOR
1	A	1	1
2	B	1	-
3	C	1	-
4	E	2	-
5	F	1	-
6	G	2	-
7	H	2	-
8	J	2	2
9	K	4	4
10	L	3	3
11	M	3	3
12	MR	7	7
13	N	4	2
14	T	1	1
15	TR	1	1
16	W	1	-
17	CR	0	-
18	PCO	0	-
19	BTC	0	-
20	Repair	1	-
21	P/Car	1	-
22	Dy.Elect	1	-
23	PH	0	1
24	Hindi School	1	-
TOTAL		40	25

2.1.2 A group of safaiwala comprising 29 staff is presently utilized for the different activities connected to sanitary wing at LLH Workshop which may be seen from the following points.

1) Cleaning of all urinals, Toilets & Water booths located in different places of workshop especially in Administrative Building as shown in **Annexure-'D'**.

2) Sweeping & cleaning of floors & stair cases of administrative building.

During study period, it is noticed that the above stated workload is not satisfactorily carried out as per norms by the safaiwala deployed over there. As a result, the quality vis-à-vis schedule of cleaning is compromised by the department. It is noticed that the level of cleaning is very poor.

- 2.1.2.1 The existing position stating Sanctioned Strength & Men-on-Roll of Safaiwala in the Sanitary Wing at LLH Work shop is as under.

Sl. No.	Designation	Pay Scale & Pay Band	Staff Strength (As per BOS of June 2018)		
			Sanctioned Strength	Men-On-Roll	Vacancy
1.	Safaiwala (Sanitary Wing)	GP-1800/-	54	29	25
	TOTAL		54	29	25

- 2.1.3 A summarized statement regarding wing-wise sanctioned strength vis-à-vis Men-On Roll position of Safaiwala at LLH Workshop is tabulated below.

Sl.No	Wing	Designation	sanctioned strength	Men-On Roll	Vacancy
1	Different Shops	Safaiwala	39	25	14
2	Hindi School	Safaiwala	01	00	01
3	Sanitary work	Safaiwala	54	29	25
TOTAL			94	54	40

- 2.1.3.1 The above table indicates that 40 posts are vacant as against a total S/S of 94 posts of safaiwala and the existing workload of entire cleaning activities at LLH Workshop is catered by deploying 54 posts of safaiwala after outsourcing the shop floor cleaning activities inclusive of scrubbing of oily floor & pit cleaning in the different shops. The disposal of garbage & scraps are also included in the contractual agreement, while outsourcing of the above jobs was finalized.

- 2.1.4 During study period, it has come to the notice of the study team that the entire workload connected to shop wing & sanitary wing as described in para 2.1.1 & 2.1.2, is borne by the departmental safaiwala comprising a total present deployment of 54 staff (as per MOR).

The shop floor cleaning activities inclusive of scrubbing of oily floor & pit cleaning in the different shops have already been outsourced against which no manpower has been deployed and these activities have fully been excluded from the entire workload catered by the staff under Shop Wing The disposal of garbage & scraps are also included in the contractual agreement for which no manpower have been deployed from shop wing.

Therefore, the cleaning activities in the shop floor that are carried out by the private agency on contractual measure, does not come under the purview of the subject study.

- 2.1.5 The activity-wise magnitude of workload presently borne by the departmental staff under **Shop wing** is as follows.

(1) Total Road Area swept in LLH Workshop = 15295.45 Sq. Meter

The location wise break-up of swept area of road is shown in **ANNEXURE- 'B'**

The summarized position of net area of roads in & around LLH Workshop is stated below.

Net Area of Roads for Mechanized Sweeping

Total area of Road	Mastic Road	4567.71 Sq. Mt.
	Concrete Road-	10727.74 Sq. Mt.
	<u>Total</u>	15295.45 Sq. Mt.

(2) Total Length of Drains cleaned & de-silted in LLH Workshop = 9470 Meter

The location wise break-up of Drains along with its length is shown in **ANNEXURE- 'A'**. The summarized position of net Running Length of drains in & around LLH Workshop is stated below.

Sl No.	Description	Length (in Meter)
1	Cleaning & De-silting of drains in & around LLH Workshop	9470 Meter.

- 2.1.6 The activity-wise magnitude of workload presently borne by the departmental staff under **sanitary wing** is as follows.

Cleaning of toilets/bathrooms/drinking water booths at LLH workshop are done on daily basis. The no of urinals, toilets and water booths are 175,194 & 27 respectively. The location wise break-up of urinals, toilets and water booths along with its no, is shown in **ANNEXURE- 'D'**. In addition, sweeping of floors & stair cases of administrative building is done on regular measure.

- 2.1.7 During physical observation, it is noticed that the Cleaning activities of inside portion of shop floor of different shops as well as pit cleaning, scrubbing of oily surface & disposal of garbage & scrap materials at LLH Workshop have already been outsourced and a satisfactory level of cleaning of the said activities has been found visible during field study. The entire workload already outsourced is shown in **Annexure-'C'**.

Previously this workload was tackled by the safaiwala of shop wing. Presently no safaiwala is deployed for the said activities (**As per Annexure-'C'**), as the entire workload as mentioned in Annexure-'C' has been outsourced which needs to be renewed for further outsourcing following the tender procedure as per existing norms.

- 2.1.7.1 On being considered all aspects, it is pertinent to mention here that the rest workload under "shop wing" (as evident from Para 2.1.5) except the workload mentioned in Para 2.1.7, is not satisfactorily done as per schedule. Hence the thoughts of outsourcing of such activities written in Para 2.1.5 have been grown in to the mind of the study team in order to up keep the quality of cleaning at lower cost like the workload of shop floor cleaning which has already been outsourced.

2.1.8 CRITICAL ANALYSIS

- 2.1.8.1 It is noticed during field study that the shop floor cleaning & pit cleaning activities are successfully carried out by the labours of private agency as per schedule framed during contractual agreement. As such, the quality of cleaning done by the contractor's labour is found far better compared to the cleaning activities borne by the departmental staff in the shop wing & sanitary wing.

Consequent upon the satisfactory results found due to outsourcing of the cleaning activities of the shop floors, it is thought of by the study team to include the other cleaning activities presently done by the departmental staff as evident from Para 2.1.5 & 2.1.6 . Ultimately, the question of outsourcing of cleaning activities of LLH workshop as mentioned in the foregoing paragraphs, has been knocked in the mind of the study team for the financial benefit of the Railway as well as to achieve a better degree of cleaning. In this regard, the necessity of outsourcing has been explored by the study team before adoption of the revised system of working.

As the Railway Board authority has phase wise encouraged all the zonal Railways to explore the feasibility of outsourcing of cleaning activities for all departments, the study team has given special attention to scrutinize the scope of outsourcing of the subject activities as a whole.

Consequent upon the financial benefits of the Railways, the matter regarding outsourcing of cleaning activities in every field of work in LLH workshop has been explored as to come to a conclusion regarding feasibility of introduction of the concept of tackling such workload on contractual measure.

The Study team has considered the maximum participation of foreign agencies during mechanized cleaning and washing process to upkeep the environment of surroundings of LLH workshop in order to make it world class.

- 2.1.8.2 On being scrutinized all pros & cons, it is convinced by the study team that the entire cleaning activities at LLH Workshop may be outsourced like the present system of outsourcing as in exist for the shop floor cleaning activities. Keeping this aspect in view, the financial benefits due to outsourcing has been explored by the study team. As a result, a comparative analysis between departmental cost & outsourcing cost for the type wise entire cleaning activities has been drawn by the study team which may be seen in the forth coming paragraph.

The estimated contractual cost due to outsourcing of the activities shown in Annexure-A,B & D has been drawn in a tabular form which may be seen as **table-'P'** of Para 2.1.8.4.

In this regard, it may be mentioned that the item wise individual rate of cleaning workload due to outsourcing (as per workload chart framed in Annexure- A, B & D) has been collected by the study team during study period which has been taken in to consideration while comparative cost analysis is made mathematically. The item wise rate chart for outsourcing is shown in **Annexure-'E'**. While the cost for the departmental staff is calculated, the Railway expenditure due to salary payment of 40 staff as per MOR has been taken in to consideration instead of a total MOR of 54 staff. **The point-wise explanation regarding scope of work to be outsourced as per Annexure-A, B & D in addition to scope of work for Re-outsourcing as per Annexure-'C', has neatly been mentioned in details in Annexure-'F'.**

- 2.1.8.3 Before drawing departmental cost due to payment of salary of safaiwala, it is felt justified that a skeleton structure of safaiwala comprising 14 staff inclusive of LR, may be retained for the following activities.

1) Various non-schedule activities which cannot be estimated, while outsourcing of schedule activities will be finalized. The magnitude of non-schedule activities cannot be quantified and that is why this portion of non-schedule activities is not proposed to be outsourced. As a result, the departmental staff will bear this workload for which a set of staff has been proposed to be kept aside as a skeleton structure.

2) Miscellaneous cleaning activities and special drive on cleaning, if any.

3) Activities related to cleaning & sweeping of railway service building like Hindi school.

4) Cleaning work to be arisen out due to climatic disaster or due to any untoward situation.

5) Cleaning activities in case of exigency and that is required to be done on urgent measure.

During study period, it is felt justified by the study team that a skeleton structure of 14 safaiwala staff is required to be deployed at LLH workshop to cater to the above stated workload after outsourcing the entire schedule activities mentioned in **Annexure 'A' to 'D'**. Hence it is proposed that a skeleton structure comprising 14 posts of safaiwala may be retained at LLH workshop to tackle the activities written above (from serial number 1 to 5).

As a result the departmental cost due to salary payment and other schedule payment is to be calculated based on 40 staff out of total MOR of 54 staff (i.e. $54 - 14 = 40$ staff) to assess the net financial savings of railway due to outsourcing..

- 2.1.8.4 The estimated contractual cost due to outsourcing of the activities shown in Annexure-A, B & D has been drawn in the following table-'P' based on the data collected during field study. The existing rates of other railway units / Workshops where same kind of activities have already been outsourced, have been considered during calculation of total outsourcing cost for the activities mentioned in the Annexure A ,B & D.

TABLE-'P'

Sl. no	Scope of work	Area of work in Sq. Meter. Or length in Meter	Rate in Rs.	Unit	No of days per year	Total Cost per Year (inclusive of escalation charges)
1	Mechanized cleaning & De-silting of Drains in workshop area	9470 Meter	Rs.1.48 per Meter	Meter per day	Assuming 295 working days in a year except holidays	$9470 \times 1.48 \times 295 =$ Rs.4134602-00 i.e. Rs 41.35 Lacs per year
2	Sweeping of workshop's entire road area	15295 Sq.Meter	Rs.1.41 per Sq. Meter	Sq. Meter per day	Assuming 295 working days in a year except holidays	$15295 \times 1.41 \times 295 =$ Rs.63.62 lacs per year
3	Cleaning & disinfection of Latrines, Urinals & Water booths. (Use of disinfected chemicals is mandatory.)	Latrines-175 Urinals-194 Water <u>Booths-27</u> Total=396 numbers	Rs1687.40 per month per latrine/ per urinal/ per water booth	Number	Monthly basis except holidays	$396 \times 1688 \times 12 =$ Rs. 79.76 Lacs per year
					Total	Rs.184.73 Lacs per year

- 2.1.8.5 It is noticed that the activities related to scrubbing of oily area of shop floor along with disposal of accumulated garbage and ferrous and non-ferrous scraps from different shops, have already been outsourced for which the period of agreement of outsourcing is temporarily renewed for a period of 3 months till finalization of 2 years further agreement for doing such jobs on contractual measure by following the procedure of tender.

This portion of activities has not been included under the preview of the subject study as because this workload has already been outsourced against which no manpower is presently deployed (on introduction of such outsourcing the manpower has already been surrendered). However it is calculated by the study team that the outsourcing cost for the above stated activities will be Rs.55.54 Lacs per year which is derived below as per rate chart shown in **Annexure-‘E’**.

The contractual cost against the following works as per available rate of private agency, is as follows. The below mentioned cleaning activities are required to be re-outsourced immediately as per estimated rate shown in Annexure-‘E’.

a) Mechanized Cleaning of shop floor area (A) =	32.93 Lacs/Year
b) Mechanized Pit cleaning of shop floor area (B) =	01.10Lacs/Year
c) Mechanized scrubbing of oily surface of shop floor(C) =	08.63Lacs/Year
d) Accumulation and disposal of garbage collected from shops (D) =	03.37 Lacs/Year
e) Accumulation and disposal of ferrous & non-ferrous scraps (E) =	06.28 Lacs/Year
	<hr/>
Total =	52.31Lacs/Year
Escalation charge @ 6% per year =	03.14 Lacs/year
Grand Total =	Rs.55.45 Lacs/Year

- 2.1.9 A comparative analysis between contractual cost due to outsourcing and the existing departmental cost is enumerated below. While assessing the departmental cost, the salary payment of 40 staff has been considered instead of present MOR of 54 staff due to retention of 14 safaiwala staff (inclusive of LR) for the activities mentioned in Para- 2.1.8.3. Therefore, the expenditure due to salary payment of this 14 staff has not been considered, while calculating the total departmental cost in Para 2.1.9.2.

- 2.1.9.1 The contractual cost due to introduction of outsourcing against the following works as per available estimated rate of private agency is as follows. The below mentioned cleaning activities are required to be outsourced immediately based on estimated rate collected during study period which is shown in Annexure-‘E’. The calculation of total annual outsourcing cost against the present departmental workload is derived on the basis of rate chart shown in Annexure-‘E’.

Contractual cost due to outsourcing (Inclusive of escalation charge)

a) Mechanized Cleaning & de-silting of drains in workshop area (A) =	41.35 Lacs/Year
b) Mechanized sweeping of work shop’s road area (B)	= 63.62 Lacs/Year.
c) Mechanized & Manual cleaning of Toilets, Urinals & Water Booths =	79.76 Lacs/Year
	<hr/>
Total =	184.73 Lacs/Year

Yearly Contractual cost due to outsourcing= Rs. 184.73 Lacs/Year

- 2.1.9.2 While assessing the departmental cost, the salary payment, PLB and other schedule payment of 40 staff have been considered as per extent rule. Therefore, the expenditure due to salary payment of 40 staff considering the average basic pay of safaiwala is assessed as under.

Yearly departmental cost due to staff payment = Rs. 240 Lacs/Year (Approx).

- 2.2** Based on the calculation drawn in Para 2.1.9.1 & 2.1.9.2, the yearly financial savings of Railway due to outsourcing has been worked out to Rs. 55.27 Lacs/Year (i.e. $240-184.73 = 55.27$ Lacs).

Based on comparative analysis between contractual cost due to outsourcing and the existing departmental cost as enumerated in Para 2.1.9.1 & 2.1.9.2, it is revealed that the concept of outsourcing is financially more beneficial in comparison to departmental cost. Based on the above calculation, the yearly financial savings of Railway due to outsourcing written in Para 2.2 will be Rs. 55.27 Lacs/Year (i.e. $Rs.240-184.73 = Rs. 55.27$ Lacs per year).

Based on the above calculation, it is made clear that the concept of the outsourcing of entire activities of LLH workshop can be introduced instead of doing the same by departmental staff.

While outsourcing, it is to be mentioned in the agreement that cleaning should be done using high presser water jet. Intensive cleaning work should be done to remove scale etc. once in every 15 days. Cleaning work should be done with Harpic, Taskey Diversey, Atlantic Care, or equivalent. After cleaning work, disinfection should be done using lizol, Phenyl or equivalent Toilets/bathrooms should be cleaned properly and no stain marks could be seen in Taps, Tiles, washbasin, mirrors etc.

- 2.2.1 Reviewed result:-** It is inferred that 14 posts of Safaiwala should be retained for the activities mentioned in Para 2.1.8.3 and the rest 80 posts of safaiwala as against a total sanctioned strength of 94 posts should be surrendered from LLH Workshop.

- 2.2.2 Conclusion :-** It is concluded that the entire cleaning activities written in Para 2.1.9.1 should be outsourced immediately in addition to re-outsourcing of the shop floor cleaning activities written in Para 2.1.8.5.

Consequent upon the huge Railway financial savings, it is proposed by the study team that the revised MOR will be 14 for the activities written in Para 2.1.8.3 and as a result of which 80 posts of safaiwala (40 staff from MOR and 40 vacant posts) as against the existing sanctioned strength of 94 posts should be declared as surplus due to introduction of outsourcing. It is also proposed that 40 vacant posts should be surrendered immediately and the rest 40 posts are proposed to be surrendered while the outsourcing activities will fully be introduced in the coming days.

- 2.2.3 The existing staff position of safaiwala mentioned in Para 2.1.3. has been revised on the basis of reviewed result which is tabulated as under.**

Total S/S	Present MOR (while work is departmentally done)	Revised MOR due to outsourcing i.e. Revised S/S	Proposed surrender	Vacancy
94	54	14	80	40

The above table reveals that the existing MOR has been revised as 14 due to urgent & emergency work to be done departmentally whenever & wherever required. Hence, 40 posts from MOR may be surrendered on implementation of outsourcing. Therefore, the revised S/S will be 14 instead of present S/S of 94 posts and 80 posts comprising 40 vacant posts & 40 posts from MOR should be surrendered on introduction of outsourcing at LLH workshop.

- 2.2.3.1 Recommendation:** It is recommended that the revised Sanctioned strength of safaiwala will be 14 as against the existing Sanctioned strength of 94 posts which will result in surrender of 80 posts of safaiwala from LLH workshop due to outsourcing of the entire cleaning activities at LLH workshop.

CHAPTER -III

3.0 **FINANCIAL APPRAISAL:**

3.1 According to recommendation made in Para 2.2.3.1, the annual financial savings to be achieved due to surrender of 80 posts of Safaiwala at LLH Workshop under Mechanical department is calculated as Rs.480 Lacs (approx.) per year considering the average pay scale of safaiwala category of post .

Thus, the net annual financial savings of recurring nature would be Rs.4.8 Crores (approx.), consequent upon implementation of the recommendation made in the subject study report.