



REVIEW OF STAFF STRENGTH
OF
SANITATION STAFF
OF
MEDICAL DEPARTMENT
OVER
VADODARA DIVISION

(No. G.463/WR/WS-34/2018-19)

Led by:
Shri Rakesh Kumar
Dy. Secy.(PG)-CCG

Guided by:
Shri S. Sharma
SWSO-CCG

Study Conducted by:
Shri R. S. Warang
CWSI-CCG
Shri Seenu Panicker
CWSI/CCG
Shri Ashish Dube
CWSI/CCG

Study discussed with Co-ordinating Officer : Shri S. K. Paira, AHO-BRC

Central Planning Organization
Headquarter Office
Churchgate
Mumbai – 20

...oOo...

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Sr. No. of Study	-	34
Case No.	-	G.463/WR/WS-34/2018-2019
Subject	-	Review of staff strength of Sanitation Staff of Medical department over Vadodara Division, due to outsourcing of cleaning activities.
Area	-	Vadodara Division
Division	-	Vadodara
Department	-	Medical
Authority	-	AGM/CCG
Terms of Reference	-	Assessment of Man power requirement – Corresponding to arising existing work load.
No. of Recommendations	-	Three
Projected Manpower	-	Phase I

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Vacancy	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Gr. D	168	147	21	144	24	21	3
Total	168	147	21	144	24	21	3

Projected Manpower - Phase II

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Vacancy	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Gr. D	144	144	--	--	144	--	144
Total	144	144	--	--	144		144

Financial Implication

- Phase I -Total recurring Savings of ***Rs. 155.03 Lakh*** (approx.) per annum.
- Phase II - Total recurring Savings of ***Rs. 930.19 Lakh*** (approx.) per annum.

...o0o...

I N D E X

CHAPTER NO.	DESCRIPTION	PAGE NO.	
		FROM	TO
-	Acknowledgement & Terms of Reference	4	--
-	Methodology	5	--
-	Summary of Recommendations	6	--
I	Introduction	7	--
II	Critical Analysis of Existing manpower and Proposed manpower.	8	11
III	Financial Implications	12	--

(i)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The work study team is grateful to Shri S. K. Paira - AHO- BRC and all CHIs over BRC division for their whole hearted co-operation extended during the course of the study.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

As directed by Additional General Manager, Churchgate, a work study to review the staff strength of Sanitation Staff of Medical Department over Vadodara Division, has been conducted with a view to assess the requirement of man power as a result of outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractors over Vadodara division.

...oOo...

(ii)

METHODOLOGY ADOPTED

- Visit to work place
- Collection of data – staff strength / activities / work load.
- Observation of working system
- Scrutiny of data collected (critical analysis)
- Discussion with nominated officials
- Assessment of man power
- Recommendation for acceptance and implementation
- Finalization of Work Study.

...o0o...

(iii)

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation

Refer Para

Recommendation No.1

2.9.2

The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on all the Colonies under Vadodara division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. Thus, 21 vacant posts of Safaiwala are recommended for surrendered immediately.

Recommendation No.2

2.10.5

Daboi Railway Colony & Health Unit is outsourced to private contractor and 8 labour per day were deployed by Private contractor at DB station. 3 Safaiwala are still working at DB station. Thus, 3 posts of Safaiwala are found surplus to the requirement, due to outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractor at Daboi Railway Colony & Health Unit. Hence, 3 posts of Safaiwala still working at DB station are also recommended for surrendered immediately.

Recommendation No. 3

2.12

Work Study Team suggested that all the cleaning activities of railway colonies under the jurisdiction of CHIs over Vadodara division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors for providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.

Thus, after outsourcing, the sweeping & cleaning activities of all railway colonies, $168 - 24 (21+3) = 147$ posts of Safaiwala remaining after the surrendering of 24 posts of Safaiwalas as specified in recommendation

...o0o...

CHAPTER- I

INTRODUCTION

1.0 Outsourcing the cleanliness activity:-

Indian Railway is rapidly proceeding towards modernization in all fields. The need of the day is to devote basically on the core activities relating to the transportation part. The age old system of manual cleaning has become obsolete. It not only requires a huge manpower but also is time consuming and not effective upto satisfactory levels. The present trend is to provide mechanized cleaning equipments, which provide hygienic environment instilling high satisfaction levels to the users. Moreover it is also cost effective with less involvement of manpower.

The Hon'ble Railway Minister announced during the Railway Budget 2014-2015 that a special drive is to be launched for improving the over-all status of sanitation/cleanliness of Railway Stations, Railway Colonies and Railway Office premises. Railway Board has issued guidelines for Mechanized cleaning of the different categories of Railway Stations for providing a greater importance to improve the overall levels of sanitation/cleanliness.

Presently, more than half of the total working expenses are expended towards staff costs in the Indian Railways. The administration should plan towards achieving a quantum reduction in man power costs, especially those relating to the non core activities, for sustaining the financial viability of the Indian Railways taking into account the impact of VIIth Pay Commission recommendations.

Railway Board vide letter No. E(MPP)2018/21/1 dated 11.09.2018 has advised to review the cadre of safaiwala in the Railways, especially where the work has been outsourced.

Accordingly, the study has been undertaken with a view to analyze the feasibility of outsourcing the cleanliness activity on all the stations, Railway Colonies and Railway Office premises over Western Railway and to surrender the posts of safaiwala, when outsourcing is completed. This work study is limited to the review of Staff Strength of Sanitation Staff of Medical department over Vadodara Division.

...oOo...

CHAPTER- II

2.0 INTRODUCTION OF SANITATION STAFF

- 2.1 The Medical Department of the Indian Railway manages hospital and dispensary services in house for their employees. In addition, general sanitation of Railway Colonies and other Railway premises is also managed by the Medical Department.
- 2.2 Health Units and Sanitation staff of BRC Division is under the direct control of CMS/BRC, who is assisted by AHO/BRC & CHI/HIs at field units for smooth working of Sanitation Work. On BRC Division, there are Health Units at BRCP, BRCY, DB, BH, AKY, ANND, ND & GDA, along with the main Divisional Hospital at PRTN.
- 2.3 The work of sanitation is carried out with the help of Health Inspectors and the cleanliness staff/safaiwalas in the Railway Residential Colonies and its surroundings.
- 2.3.1 The sanitation work can be basically divided into :
1. General Sweeping
 2. Cleaning
 3. Anti Malaria operation
 4. Health Welfare Activities :- Monitoring of drinking water quality, food hygiene in catering Establishment on Railway Premises.
- 2.4 This work study is limited to the Chief Health Inspectors (CHI)'s Units – PRTN, BRCP, BRCY, DB, BH, ANND & GDA of BRC division.
- 2.5 **Yardstick for Safaiwala** issued by CMD/CCG vide letter No. E 261/10 dated 06.11.1963 is as follows:-

1.	Sweeping of quarters & surrounding area upto the extent of 20 ft for class-IV employees i.e. Type-I	50 qtrs/safaiwala (single storey bldg.) 75 qtrs/safaiwala (double storey bldg.)
2.	Sweeping of quarters & surrounding area upto the extent of 20 ft for class-III employees i.e. Type-II & III	30 qtrs/safaiwala (single storey bldg.) 45 qtrs/safaiwala (double storey bldg.)
3.	Sweeping of quarters & surrounding area upto the extent of 20 ft for Officer Quarters i.e. Type-IV & V	15 qtrs/safaiwala
4.	General sweeping, inclusive of all.	50,000 sq.ft(Pucca) 25,000 sq.ft(Kutcha)
5	Latrine cleanings	30 seats/safaiwala

2.6 The available yard stick is very old and there are vast changes in working pattern. **Hence, this work study is conducted on the basis of need base requirement and outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractor.**

2.7 **Existing system of working :-** Presently, Sanitation staff of Vadodara division is performing following works :-
(i) All safaiwala go to work at their nominated work place.
(ii) Sweep Surface, collect waste and put in Dustbins(provided at different locations).
(iii) Waste collection from house to house & dispose to dustbin
(iv) Cleaning of Open drains and cleaning of rank vegetation from edges of drains and dispose to dustbin.
(v) Work in Cleanliness complains, whenever carry out by division, etc.

2.8 **Proposed system of working :-**

The work study team made a detailed study into all the aspects of working of Safaiwalas and have concluded that :-

- (i) The cleanliness activity on all the Colonies under Vadodara division to be outsourced to Private Contractor which will ensure greater discipline and accountability for higher standard of cleanliness as also to tackle the problem of high absenteeism amongst Safaiwalas.
- (ii) It should be ensured that the contractors deploy the full sanctioned strength of employees at each station in order to achieve higher standards of cleanliness.
- (iii) The posts of Safaiwalas, who have been deployed at Colonies where cleaning activities have been outsourced to private contractors, may be surrendered immediately.

2.9 The Unit wise **Sanctioned Cadre, Man on Roll and Vacancy** position of Sanitation staff (i.e. Sr. Safaiwala Jamadar, Safaiwala Jamadar, Sr. Safaiwala, Sr. Khalasi, Sr. Hamal & Safaiwala) working under Chief Health Inspectors (CHI) of Vadodara division are as follows :-

Sr. No.	CHI Unit	Safaiwala		
		Sanctioned Cadre	Man on Roll	Vacancy
1	PRTN	31	30	1
2	BRCP	15	13	2
3	BRCY	43	40	3
4	DB	10	3	7
5	BH	15	14	1
6	GDA	30	28	2
7	ANND	24	19	5
	Total	168	147	21

2.9.1 The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on all the Colonies under Vadodara division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. It is seen from the Cadre position that there are 147 Safaiwalas are available against the sanctioned cadre of 168 posts and 21 posts of Safaiwala are vacant on Vadodara division. Thus, these posts are recommended for surrendered immediately.

2.9.2 **Recommendation No.1**

The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on all the Colonies under Vadodara division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. Thus, 21 vacant posts of Safaiwala are recommended for surrendered immediately.

2.10 **CLEANING CONTRACTOR POSITION OF VADODARA DIVISION:-**

2.10.1 On Vadodara Division, Cleaning activities have been outsourced on Daboi Rly Colony & Health unit, the details of which are elaborated as under:-

Sr.	Station	Description of work	Name of Contractor	Period	Contractor's labour per day
1	DB	Removal of Garbage from DB Rly. Colony & Health Unit	M/s D. G. Nadkarni	3 years (31.07.2018 to 30.07.2021)	8
		Total		3 years	8

2.10.2 It is seen from the above table that, only DB Rly Colony & Health unit was outsourced to private contractors and 8 labours per day were deployed by Private contractor.

2.10.3 On Vadodara Division, Cleaning activities of PRTN, BRCP, BRCY, BH, GDA & ANND Railway Colonies/Health Units are done by Railway itself. No outsourcing is done, till date.

2.10.4 As mentioned in para 2.10.1 & 10.2.2, only Daboi Railway Colony & Health Unit is outsourced to private contractors and 8 labour per day were deployed by Private contractor at DB station. 3 Safaiwala are still working at DB station. Thus, these 3 Safaiwala of DB station are proposed for surrender as 8 private labour are available for cleaning work at Daboi Railway Colony & Health Unit. The 3 posts of Safaiwala are found surplus to the requirement, due to outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractor at Daboi Railway Colony & Health Unit.

2.10.5 **Recommendation No.2**

Daboi Railway Colony & Health Unit is outsourced to private contractor and 8 labour per day were deployed by Private contractor at DB station. 3 Safaiwala are still working at DB station. Thus, 3 posts of Safaiwala are found surplus to the requirement, due to outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractor at Daboi Railway Colony & Health Unit. Hence, 3 posts of Safaiwala still working at DB station are also recommended for surrendered immediately.

- 2.11 Work Study Team suggested that all the cleaning activities of railway colonies under the jurisdiction of CHIs over Vadodara division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors for providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.

Thus, after outsourcing the sweeping & cleaning activities of all railway colonies to private Contractor, $168 - 24 (21+3) = 144$ posts of Safaiwalas remaining after the surrendering of 24 posts of Safaiwalas as specified in recommendation No. 1 & 2 above, may also be surrendered

2.12 **Recommendation No. 3**

Work Study Team suggested that all the cleaning activities of railway colonies under the jurisdiction of CHIs over Vadodara division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors for providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.

Thus, after outsourcing, the sweeping & cleaning activities of all railway colonies, $168 - 24 (21+3) = 147$ posts of Safaiwala remaining after the surrendering of 24 posts of Safaiwalas as specified in recommendation No. 1 & 2 above, may also be surrendered.

...o0o...

CHAPTER – III

3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

- 3.1. The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on all the Colonies under Vadodara division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. It is seen from the Cadre position that there are 147 Safaiwala are available against the sanctioned cadre of 168 posts and 21 posts of Safaiwala are vacant on Vadodara division. Hence, 21 vacant posts of Safaiwala are recommended for surrendered immediately.
- 3.2 Daboi Railway Colony & Health Unit is outsourced to private contractor and 8 labour per day were deployed by Private contractor at DB station. 3 Safaiwala are still working at DB station. Thus, 3 posts of Safaiwala are found surplus to the requirement, due to outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractor at Daboi Railway Colony & Health Unit. Hence, 3 posts of Safaiwala still working at DB station are also recommended for surrendered immediately.
- 3.3 After outsourcing, the sweeping & cleaning activities of all railway colonies, $168 - 24 (21+3) = 147$ posts of Safaiwala remaining after the surrendering of 24 posts of Safaiwalas as specified in recommendation No. 1 & 2 above, may also be surrendered.
- 3.4 On implication of the study report and surrendering the 24 posts at Phase I And 144 posts at Phase II of Sanitation staff of Medical Department on Vadodara Division, annual recurring saving will be achieved as tabulated below :-

Phase I

<i>Category</i>	<i>No. of Surplus posts</i>	<i>Average cost per Employee</i>	<i>Annual saving in Rs.</i>
Group - D	24	Rs. 6,45,968	Rs. 1,55,03,232
Total	24		Rs. 1,55,03,232

Phase II

<i>Category</i>	<i>No. of Surplus posts</i>	<i>Average cost per Employee</i>	<i>Annual saving in Rs.</i>
Group - D	144	Rs. 6,45,968	Rs. 9,30,19,392
Total	144		Rs. 9,30,19,392

- 3.3 On implementation of the recommendations brought out in the work study report, annual recurring saving, per annum can be achieved as follows :-
- Phase I** - Annual recurring saving of Rs. 155.03 Lakhs per annum can be achieved.
- Phase II** - Annual recurring saving of Rs. 930.19 Lakhs per annum can be achieved.

...oOo...