



REVIEW OF STAFF STRENGTH
OF
SANITATION STAFF
OF
MEDICAL DEPARTMENT
OVER
RATLAM DIVISION

(No. G.463/WR/WS-28/2018-19)

Led by:
Shri Rakesh Kumar
Dy. Secy.(PG)-CCG

Guided by:
Shri S. Sharma
SWSO-CCG

Study Conducted by:
Shri R. S. Warang
CWSI-CCG
Shri P. S. Sengupta
CWSI/CCG
Shri P.K. Bhowmick
E.I-CCG

Study discussed with Co-ordinating Officer : Shri A.C.Patel, AHO-RTM

Central Planning Organization
Headquarter Office
Churchgate
Mumbai – 20

...oOo...

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Sr. No. of Study	-	28
Case No.	-	G.463/WR/WS-28/2018-2019
Subject	-	Review of staff strength of Sanitation Staff of Medical department over Ratlam Division, due to outsourcing of cleaning activities.
Area	-	Ratlam Division
Division	-	Ratlam
Department	-	Medical
Authority	-	AGM/CCG
Terms of Reference	-	Assessment of Man power requirement – Corresponding to arising existing work load.
No. of Recommendations	-	Three
Projected Manpower	-	Phase I

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Vacancy	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Gr. C	--	--	--	--	--	--	--
Gr. D	156	135	21	--	59	21	38
Total	156	135	21	--	59	21	38

Projected Manpower - Phase II

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Vacancy	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Gr. C	--	--	--	--	--	--	--
Gr. D	97	97	--	--	97	--	97
Total	97	97	21	--	97		97

Financial Implication

- Phase I -Total recurring Savings of **Rs. 381.12 Lakh** (approx.) per annum.
- Phase II - Total recurring Savings of **Rs. 626.59 Lakh** (approx.) per annum.

...o0o...

I N D E X

CHAPTER NO.	DESCRIPTION	PAGE NO.	
		FROM	TO
-	Acknowledgement & Terms of Reference	4	--
-	Methodology	5	--
-	Summary of Recommendations	6	--
I	Introduction	7	--
II	Critical Analysis of Existing manpower and Proposed manpower.	8	12
III	Financial Implications	13	--

(i)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The work study team is grateful to Shri A.C. Patel - AHO-RTM and all CHIs over RTM division for their whole hearted co-operation extended during the course of the study.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

As directed by Additional General Manager, Churchgate, a work study to review the staff strength of Sanitation Staff of Medical Department over Ratlam Division, has been conducted with a view to assess the requirement of man power as a result of outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractors over Ratlam division.

...oOo...

(ii)

METHODOLOGY ADOPTED

- Visit to work place
- Collection of data – staff strength / activities / work load.
- Observation of working system
- Scrutiny of data collected (critical analysis)
- Discussion with nominated officials
- Assessment of man power
- Recommendation for acceptance and implementation
- Finalization of Work Study.

...o0o...

(iii)

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation

Refer Para

Recommendation No.1

2.9.2

The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on all the Colonies under Ratlam division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. Thus, 21 posts of Safaiwala/AMK/Chowkidar are vacant since long. Hence, these 21 posts are recommended for surrendered immediately.

Recommendation No.2

2.12

On 7 colonies at RTM, UDN, DADN & NAD 38 private labour are deployed for cleaning work. Thus, equivalent to private labour, 38 posts of Safaiwalas / AMK / Chowkidar deployed at these colonies, where cleanliness activities have been outsourced to private contractors may be surrendered.

Recommendation No. 3

2.14

Work Study Team suggested that all the cleaning activities of railway colonies under the jurisdiction of CHIs over Ratlam division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors for providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.

Thus, after outsourcing, the sweeping & cleaning activities of all railway colonies, 97 posts of Safaiwalas/AMK/Chowkidar remaining after the surrendering of 59 posts of Safaiwalas/AMK/Chowkidar as specified in Recommendation No. 1 & 2 above, may also be surrendered.

...o0o...

CHAPTER- I

INTRODUCTION

1.0 Outsourcing the cleanliness activity:-

Indian Railway is rapidly proceeding towards modernization in all fields. The need of the day is to devote basically on the core activities relating to the transportation part. The age old system of manual cleaning has become obsolete. It not only requires a huge manpower but also is time consuming and not effective upto satisfactory levels. The present trend is to provide mechanized cleaning equipments, which provide hygienic environment instilling high satisfaction levels to the users. Moreover it is also cost effective with less involvement of manpower.

The Hon'ble Railway Minister announced during the Railway Budget 2014-2015 that a special drive is to be launched for improving the over-all status of sanitation/cleanliness of Railway Stations, Railway Colonies and Railway Office premises. Railway Board has issued guidelines for Mechanized cleaning of the different categories of Railway Stations for providing a greater importance to improve the overall levels of sanitation/cleanliness.

Presently, more than half of the total working expenses are expended towards staff costs in the Indian Railways. The administration should plan towards achieving a quantum reduction in man power costs, especially those relating to the non core activities, for sustaining the financial viability of the Indian Railways taking into account the impact of VIIth Pay Commission recommendations.

The study has been undertaken with a view to analyze the feasibility of outsourcing the cleanliness activity on all the stations, Railway Colonies and Railway Office premises over Western Railway and to surrender Safaiwalas , when outsourcing is completed. This work study is limited to the review of Staff Strength of Sanitation Staff of Medical department over Ratlam Division.

...oOo...

CHAPTER- II

2.0 INTRODUCTION OF SANITATION STAFF

- 2.1 The Medical Department of the Indian Railway manages hospital and dispensary services in house for their employees. In addition, general sanitation of Railway Colonies and other Railway premises is also managed by the Medical Department.
- 2.2 Health Units and Sanitation staff of RTM Division is under the direct control of CMS/RTM, who is assisted by AHO/RTM & CHI/HIs at field units for smooth working of Sanitation Work. On RTM Division, there are Health Units at RTM, NAD, UJN, NMH, COR, DADN, IND & LMNR along with RTM and DHD Hospital
- 2.3 The work of sanitation is carried out with the help of Health Inspectors and the cleanliness staff/safaiwalas in the Railway Residential Colonies and its surroundings.
- 2.3.1 The sanitation work can be basically divided into :
1. General Sweeping
 2. Cleaning
 3. Anti Malaria operation
 4. Health Welfare Activities :- Monitoring of drinking water quality, food hygiene in catering Establishment on Railway Premises.
- 2.4 This work study is limited to the Chief Health Inspectors (CHI)'s Units – RTM, NAD, UJN, NMH, COR, DADN (MHOW) & IND+LMNR of RTM division.
- 2.5 **Yardstick for Safaiwala** issued by CMD/CCG vide letter No. E 261/10 dated **06.11.1963** is as follows:-

1.	Sweeping of quarters & surrounding area upto the extent of 20 ft for class-IV employees i.e. Type-I	50 qtrs/safaiwala (single storey bldg.) 75 qtrs/safaiwala (double storey bldg.)
2.	Sweeping of quarters & surrounding area upto the extent of 20 ft for class-III employees i.e. Type-II & III	30 qtrs/safaiwala (single storey bldg.) 45 qtrs/safaiwala (double storey bldg.)
3.	Sweeping of quarters & surrounding area upto the extent of 20 ft for Officer Quarters i.e. Type-IV & V	15 qtrs/safaiwala
4.	General sweeping, inclusive of all.	50,000 sq.ft(Pucca) 25,000 sq.ft(Kutcha)
5	Latrine cleanings	30 seats/safaiwala

2.6 The available yard stick is very old and there are vast changes in working pattern. ***Hence, this work study is conducted on the basis of need base requirement and outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractor.***

2.7 **Existing system of working** :- Presently, Sanitation staff of Ratlam division is performing following works :-

- (i) All safaiwala go to work at their nominated work place.
- (ii) Sweep Surface, collect waste and put in Dustbins(provided at different locations).
- (iii) Waste collection from house to house & dispose to dustbin
- (iv) Cleaning of Open drains and cleaning of rank vegetation from edges of drains and dispose to dustbin.
- (v) Work in Cleanliness complains, whenever carry out by division, etc.

2.8 **Proposed system of working** :-

The work study team made a detailed study into all the aspects of working of Safaiwalas and have concluded that :

- (i) The cleanliness activity on all the Colonies under Ratlam division to be outsourced to Private Contractor which will ensure greater discipline and accountability for higher standard of cleanliness as also to tackle the problem of high absenteeism amongst Safaiwalas.
- (ii) It should be ensured that the contractors deploy the full sanctioned strength of employees at each station in order to achieve higher standards of cleanliness.
- (iii) The posts of Safaiwalas, who have been deployed at Colonies where cleaning activities have been outsourced to private contractors, may be surrendered immediately.

2.9 The Unit wise **Sanctioned Cadre, Man on Roll and Vacancy** position of Sanitation staff (i.e. Safaiwala, Anti-malaria Staff & Chowkidar) working under Chief Health Inspectors (CHI) of RTM division are as follows :-

Sr No	CHI - Unit	Safaiwala			AMK			Chowkidar			Total		
		SC	OR	Vac	SC	OR	Vac	SC	OR	Vac	SC	OR	Vac
1	RTM	62	57	05	12	10	02	01	0	01	75	67	08
2	NAD	08	08	0	-	-	-	-	-	-	08	08	0
3	UJN	14	13	01	06	06	0	-	-	-	20	19	01
4	NMH	13	09	04	04	02	02	-	-	-	17	11	06
5	COR	09	07	02	01	01	0	-	-	-	10	08	02
6	DADN	15	12	03	05	04	01	-	-	-	20	16	04
7	IND & LMNR	06	06	0	-	-	-	-	-	-	06	06	0
	Total	127	112	15	28	23	05	01	0	01	156	135	21

2.9.1 The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on all the Colonies under Ratlam division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. It is seen from the Cadre position that there are 135 Safaiwalas/AMK/Chowkidar are available against the sanctioned cadre of 156 posts and 21 posts of Safaiwala/AMK/Chowkidar are vacant on Ratlam division. Thus, these posts are recommended for surrendered immediately.

2.9.2 **Recommendation No.1**

The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on all the Colonies under Ratlam division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. Thus, 21 posts of Safaiwala/AMK/Chowkidar are vacant since long. Hence, these 21 posts are recommended for surrendered immediately.

2.10 **CLEANING CONTRACTOR POSITION OF RATLAM DIVISION:-**

2.10.1 On Ratlam Division, Cleaning activities have been partially outsourced on following Colonies to private contractors, the details of which are elaborated as under:-

Sr.	Station	Description of work	Name of Contractor.	Period	Labour per day
1	RTM(A)	Removal of Garbage from from all the Rly. colonies & Rly areas of RTM East-side.	M/s D.N. Enterprises 95, Malwa Nagar,P&T colony Ratlam(MP)	2 Years	3
2	RTM(B)	Removal of Garbage from from all the Rly. colonies & Rly areas of RTM west-side.	M/s D.N. Enterprises 95, Malwa Nagar,P&T colony Ratlam(MP)	2 Years	3
3	UJN Madhav Nagar	Cleaning work of Madhavnagar Rly. colonies of Ujjain (10 number of S/wala)	Shri Santosh Khare 34, Sheranipura Ratlam	2 Years	10
4	DADN (MHW)	Removal of Garbage from from all the Rly. colonies & Rly areas of MHW	Shri Mohit Pandit MHW	2 Years	3
5	NAD	Removal of Garbage from from all the Rly. colonies & Rly areas of NAD	M/s Shah Associate Baroda.	2 Years	3
		Total			22

2.10.2 It is seen from the above table that, 5 Colonies were partially outsourced to private contractors and 22 labours per day were deployed by Private contractor.

2.10.3 On Ratlam Division, Cleaning activities for which works to be outsourced/ Contract in progress for RTM & UJN Colonies to private contractors, are as follows:-

Sr.	Station	Description of work	Name of Contractor.	Period	Labour per day
1	RTM Shimla	Cleaning work of Shimla/RPF/Nurse Rly colonies of RTM (10 nos of safaiwala)	Contract in process	2 Years	10
2	UJN - Gaughat Colony	Cleaning work of Gaughat Rly colonies of Ujjain(06 Number of S/wala)	Contract in process	2 Years	6
		Total			16

2.10.4 It is seen from the above table that, 2 Colonies will be outsourced to private contractors shortly and 16 labours per day will be deployed by Private contractor.

2.10.5 On Ratlam Division, Cleaning activities which have been done by Railway as well as Local Govt. Authorities i.e. Nagar Nigam / Nagar Palika / Nagar Parishad are as follows :-

Sr.	Station	Description of work	Name of Contractor.	Period	Labour per day
1	UJN	Removal of Garbage from from all the Rly. colonies & Rly areas of UJN	Commissioner Nagar Nigam Ujjain.	--	--
2	IND	Removal of Garbage from from all the Rly. colonies & Rly areas of IND & LMNR	Commissioner Nagar Nigam Indore.	--	--
3	NMH	Removal of Garbage from from all the Rly. colonies & Rly areas of NMH	By Nagar Palika Neemuch.	--	--
4	COR	Removal of Garbage from from all the Rly. colonies & Rly areas of COR	By Nagar Parisad Chhitourgarh.	--	--
		Total			

2.10.6 It is seen from the above table that 4 Colonies Cleaning activities are done by Railway as well as Local Govt. Authorities i.e. Nagar Nigam / Nagar Palika / Nagar Parishad. For which Railway paid certain amount to Local Authorities.

- 2.11 As mentioned in para 2.10.2, 10.2.4 & 10.2.6, most of the colonies are outsourced to private contractors and $22 + 16 = 38$ labour per day were deployed by Private contractor. Thus, 38 Safaiwala of RTM Division equivalent to private labour are to be proposed for surrender as 38 private labour are available for cleaning work at 7 colonies. Thus, 38 posts of Safaiwalas/AMK/Chowkidar are found surplus to the requirement, due to outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractor.

2.12 **Recommendation No.2**

On 7 colonies at RTM, UDN, DADN & NAD 38 private labour are deployed for cleaning work. Thus, equivalent to private labour, 38 posts of Safaiwalas / AMK / Chowkidar deployed at these colonies, where cleanliness activities have been outsourced to private contractors may be surrendered.

- 2.13 Work Study Team suggested that all the cleaning activities of railway colonies under the jurisdiction of CHIs over Ratlam division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors for providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.

Thus, after outsourcing the sweeping & cleaning activities of all railway colonies to private Contractor, $156 - 59 = 97$ posts of Safaiwalas / AMK / Chowkidar remaining after the surrendering of 59 posts of Safaiwalas / AMK / Chowkidar as specified in Recommendation No. 1 above, may also be surrendered

2.14 **Recommendation No. 3**

Work Study Team suggested that all the cleaning activities of railway colonies under the jurisdiction of CHIs over Ratlam division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors for providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.

Thus, after outsourcing, the sweeping & cleaning activities of all railway colonies, $156 - 59 = 97$ posts of Safaiwalas/AMK/Chowkidar remaining after the surrendering of 59 posts of Safaiwalas/AMK/Chowkidar as specified in Recommendation No. 1 & 2 above, may also be surrendered.

...oOo...

CHAPTER – III

3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

- 3.1. The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on all the Colonies under Ratlam division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. It is seen from the Cadre position that there are 135 Safaiwalas/AMK/Chowkidar are available against the sanctioned cadre of 156 posts and 21 posts of Safaiwala/AMK/Chowkidar are vacant on Ratlam division. 21 posts of Safaiwala / AMK/ Chowkidar are vacant since long. Hence, these 21 posts are recommended for surrendered immediately.
- 3.2 On 7 colonies at RTM, UDN, DADN & NAD 38 private labour are deployed for cleaning work. Thus, equivalent to private labour, 38 posts of Safaiwalas / AMK / Chowkidar deployed at these colonies, where cleanliness activities have been outsourced to private contractors may be surrendered.
- 3.3 After outsourcing the sweeping & cleaning activities of all railway colonies to private Contractor, $156 - 59 = 97$ posts of Safaiwalas / AMK / Chowkidar remaining after the surrendering of 59 posts of Safaiwalas / AMK / Chowkidar, may also be surrendered
- 3.4 On implication of the study report and surrendering the 59 posts at Phase I And 97 posts at Phase II of Sanitation staff of Medical Department on Ratlam Division, annual recurring saving will be achieved as tabulated below :-

Phase I

<i>Category</i>	<i>No. of Surplus posts</i>	<i>Average cost per Employee</i>	<i>Annual saving in Rs.</i>
Group - C	--	--	--
Group - D	59	Rs. 6,45,968	Rs. 3,81,12,112
Total	59		Rs. 3,81,12,112

Phase II

<i>Category</i>	<i>No. of Surplus posts</i>	<i>Average cost per Employee</i>	<i>Annual saving in Rs.</i>
Group - C	--	--	--
Group - D	97	Rs. 6,45,968	Rs.6,26,58,896
Total			Rs.6,26,58,896

- 3.3 On implementation of the recommendations brought out in the work study report, annual recurring saving, per annum can be achieved as follows :-
Phase I - Annual recurring saving of Rs. 381.12 Lakhs per annum can be achieved.
Phase II - Annual recurring saving of Rs. 626.59 Lakhs per annum can be achieved.

...oOo...