



REVIEW OF STAFF STRENGTH
OF
SAFAIWALA & CLEANER STAFF
OF
MECHANICAL DEPARTMENT
OVER
AHEMDABAD DIVISION

(No. G.463/WR/WS-25/2018-19)

Led by:
Shri Rakesh Kumar
Dy. Secy.(PG)-CCG

Guided by:
Shri S. Sharma
SWSO-CCG

Study Conducted by:
Shri Arun
(CWSI-CCG)
Shri R. S. Warang
(CWSI/CCG)
Shri Sheenu Panicker
(CWSI/CCG)

Study discussed with Co-ordinating Officer : Shri R S Gupta (CDO- ADI)

Central Planning Organization
Headquarter Office
Churchgate
Mumbai – 20

...oOo...

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Sr. No. of Study	-	25
Case No.	-	G.463/WR/WS-25/2018-2019
Subject	-	Review of staff strength of Safaiwala & Cleaner Staff of Mechanical department over Ahmedabad Division, due to outsourcing of cleaning activities.
Area	-	Ahmedabad Division
Division	-	Ahmedabad
Department	-	Mechanical
Authority	-	AGM/CCG
Terms of Reference	-	Assessment of Man power requirement – Corresponding to arising existing work load.
No. of Recommendations	-	Two
Projected Manpower	-	Phase I

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Vacancy	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Safaiwala	147	74	73	74	73	73	0
Cleaner	173	80	93	80	93	93	0
Total	320	154	166	154	166	166	0

Projected Manpower - **Phase II**

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Vacancy	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Safaiwala	74	74	0	0	74	0	74
Cleaner	80	80	0	0	80	0	80
Total	154	154	0	0	154	0	154

Financial Implication - Phase I -Total recurring Savings of **Rs. 1072.30Lakh** (approx.) per annum.

- Phase II - Total recurring Savings of **Rs. 994.79 Lakh** (approx.) per annum.

...o0o...

I N D E X

CHAPTER NO.	DESCRIPTION	PAGE NO.	
		FROM	TO
-	Acknowledgement & Terms of Reference	4	--
-	Methodology	5	--
-	Summary of Recommendations	6	--
I	Introduction	7	--
II	Critical Analysis of Existing manpower and Proposed manpower.	8	15
III	Financial Implications	16	--

(i)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The work study team is grateful to Shri C D Gupta – CDO- ADI and all SSEs of Mechanical Depot over ADI division for their whole hearted co-operation extended during the course of the study.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

As directed by Additional General Manager, Churchgate, a work study to review the staff strength of Safaiwala & Cleaner Staff of Mechanical Department over Ahmedabad Division, has been conducted with a view to assess the requirement of man power as a result of outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractors over Ahmedabad division.

...oOo...

(ii)

METHODOLOGY ADOPTED

- Visit to work place
- Collection of data – staff strength / activities / work load.
- Observation of working system
- Scrutiny of data collected (critical analysis)
- Discussion with nominated officials
- Assessment of man power
- Recommendation for acceptance and implementation
- Finalization of Work Study.

...o0o...

(iii)

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation

Refer Para

Recommendation No.1

2.5

The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on All Mechanical depots under ADI division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. Thus, 166 vacant posts of Safaiwala & Cleaner are recommended for surrendered immediately.

Recommendation No. 2

2.12.1

Work Study Team suggested that all Mechanical depots under ADI division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors for providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.

Thus, after outsourcing, the sweeping & cleaning activities of all Mechanical depots under ADI division, $320 - 166 = 154$ posts of Safaiwala & Cleaner remaining after the surrendering of 166 posts as specified in recommendation no. 1.

...o0o...

CHAPTER- I

INTRODUCTION

1.0 Outsourcing the cleanliness activity:-

Indian Railway is rapidly proceeding towards modernization in all fields. The need of the day is to devote basically on the core activities relating to the transportation part. The age old system of manual cleaning has become obsolete. It not only requires a huge manpower but also is time consuming and not effective up to satisfactory levels. The present trend is to provide mechanized cleaning equipments, which provide hygienic environment instilling high satisfaction levels to the users. Moreover it is also cost effective with less involvement of manpower.

The Hon'ble Railway Minister announced during the Railway Budget 2014-2015 that a special drive is to be launched for improving the over-all status of sanitation/cleanliness of Railway Stations, Railway Colonies and Railway Office premises. Railway Board has issued guidelines for Mechanized cleaning of the different categories of Railway Stations for providing a greater importance to improve the overall levels of sanitation/cleanliness.

Presently, more than half of the total working expenses are expended towards staff costs in the Indian Railways. The administration should plan towards achieving a quantum reduction in man power costs, especially those relating to the non core activities, for sustaining the financial viability of the Indian Railways taking into account the impact of VIIth Pay Commission recommendations.

Chief Personnel Officer (IR), Western Railway, Churchgate vide note No. CPO(IR)/misc/2018 dated has advised to conduct the work Study of Safaiwala & Cleaner of Mechanical department over Ahmedabad division, due to outsourced.

Railway Board vide letter No. E(MPP)2018/21/1 dated 11.09.2018 has advised to review the cadre of safaiwala in the Railways, especially where the work has been outsourced.

Accordingly, the study has been undertaken with a view to analyze the feasibility of outsourcing the cleanliness activity on all the stations, Railway Colonies and Railway Office premises over Western Railway and to surrender the posts of safaiwala, when outsourcing is completed. This work study is limited to the review of Staff Strength of Safaiwala & Cleaner of Mechanical Department over Ahmedabad Division.

...oOo...

CHAPTER – II

- 2.1 Administrative Decision: Change of Designation/Promotion of /Safaiwala's to the post of Khalasi in Mech. Dept. ADI Division.

Divisional letter No. EM/840/1/C & W/Vol. II dated 06.02.2017 issued by APO (Mech.) addressed to GM- (E)- CCG. The change of Designation Change of Designation/Promotion of cleaners/Safaiwala's to the post of Khalasi in Mech. Dept. ADI Division.

- 2.2 The following decision had been taken in the meeting on 09.02.2017.

1. Promotion to Sr. Khalasi, Safaiwala, Bhisty & Cleaner will be considered at Par with khalasi.
2. Seniority of Group "C' Khalasi, Cleaner, Bhisty & Safaiwala is combined in Mechanical (C & W Dept.) for purpose of promotion in Group "C" accordingly seniority of Khalasi, Cleaner, Bhisty & Safaiwala had been merged .
3. Khalasi, Safaiwala, Bhisty & Cleaner are appointed direct recruitment by RRC and also compassionate ground, medically de categorised staff also redeployed in this categorised by screening committee.

- 2.3 The details Cadre with vacancies of Safaiwala's & Cleaners of Mechanical Dept. are as under.

Sr. No	Unit	Cadre of Safaiwala's & Cleaner with Vacancies.							
		Sanction Cadre		Men on Roll		Vacancy		Excess	
		Safai wala	Clea ner	Safai wala	Cle aner	Safai wala	Clean er	Safai wala	Cleane r
1	ADI BG	54	61	29	28	25	33	00	00
2	ADI-MG	44	44	25	25	19	19	00	00
3	GIM	14	31	08	10	10	21	00	00
4	NBV J	13	26	01	06	12	20	00	00
5	SBI BG	05	02	04	04	01	00	00	02
6	VTA	03	00	02	00	01	00	00	00
7	VG	03	03	02	02	01	01	00	00
8	MSH	04	04	04	04	00	00	00	00
9	PNU	04	02	02	01	02	01	00	00
10	GNC	03	00	01	00	02	00	00	00
		147	173	74	80	73	93	00	02

mechanical depo

- 2.5 The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on All Mechanical depots under ADI division to be outsourced to Private Contractor
- 2.6 The exiting system of cleaning activities are as under:
- Exterior cleaning of Primary/Secondary Maintained coaches.
 - Intensive internal cleaning (A Schedule) & watering of Primary/Secondary Maintained Coaches.
 - Internal cleaning (Trip Schedule) & Watering of primary/Secondary Maintained coaches.
 - Yard & Depot premises cleaning (Area per day 34897 sqm).
- 2.6.1 The Mechanized Cleaning Contract is on trunking basis which covering the following aspects.
- (i) All fixed instalments.
 - (ii) Mechanised systems as per given specifications.
 - (iii) Hand implements, tools & tackles.
 - (iv) Consumables of machines
 - (v) Cleaning, disinfecting agents.
 - (vi) Operators/Labour & Supervisors
 - (vii) Complete maintenance of the machines employed for cleaning the rates.
 - (viii) Cleaning of depot premises including repair of water hydrants.
- 2.6.2 The contractor has to ensure the mechanised cleaning of coaches of primary & secondary trains is completed in three hours maximum or as per the occupied time of rake in the washing /pit line whichever is less.
- 2.6.3 The contractor shall deploy minimum 1.0 supervisor/rake/day i.e. minimum one supervisor/ rake to be cleaned within four hours. It means for a rake of 18 coaches 17 staff should be deployed by the contractor with one Supervisor for completing the work in four hours during the trip schedule of primary & secondary maintained trains.

- 2.6.4 For mechanized & Manual cleaning of depot premises contractor should deploy required numbers of staff (10 men per day as per specifications under terms & conditions of the contract with one Supervisor and these staff can be deployed in three shifts as per requirements.
- 2.6.5 As such, all these Safaiwala's activities have been outsourced and accordingly above Safaiwala's sanction cadre of 54 staff including 36 men on roll & 18 vacancies found surplus.
- 2.7 This work study is limited to the SSE Units – ADI-BG, ADI-MG, VG, GIM, NBVJ, PNU, SBI VTA, MSH & GNC.
- 2.8 The yard stick of Safaiwala & Cleaner is very old and there are vast changes in working pattern. ***Hence, this work study is conducted on the basis of need base requirement and outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractor.***
- 2.9 **Proposed system of working :-**

The work study team made a detailed study into all the aspects of working of Safaiwala's and Cleaner & concluded that :-

- (i) The cleanliness activity on all the Coach & Depot Premises of Mechanical under ADI division to be outsourced to Private Contractor which will ensure greater discipline and accountability for higher standard of cleanliness as also to tackle the problem of high absenteeism amongst Safaiwala & Cleaner.
- (ii) It should be ensured that the contractors deploy the full sanctioned strength of employees at each depot in order to achieve higher standards of cleanliness.
- (iii) The posts of Safaiwala's & Cleaner who have been deployed at Coach & Depot Premises where cleaning activities have been outsourced to private contractors, may be surrendered .

2.10 The details of outsource of Mechanical Department unit wise are as under.

2.10.1 The following activities of ADI- BG have been outsourced.

Sr. No.	Unit	Contractor Name	LOA No. & Date	Period of contract	Nature of Work
1.	ADI BG	Prehari Protection System Private Limited.	M/442/19/3/Bio-Toilet 2016-17 dated 03.04.2017	Two Years	Bio- Toilet
2.		Dynamic services	M/442/19/CTSS/2 016-17 dated 15.11.2017.	Three years	Contract for enroute cleaning of coaches at ADI.
3.		Eureka Forbes Limited	No.42/19/3/OBHS /ADI/ (BG) 2015 Re-tender dated 03.06.16.	Three years	Contract work for "On Board House Keeping Services" in scheduled trains.
4.		I S F Services	442/19/Watering/ 2016-17/(Re-Tender) dated 29.03.2017	Two years.	Contract work for en-route Watering of Coaches at ADI Station.
5.		Dynamic Enterprises.	442/19/3/MC- ADI/2017-18 dated 11.04.2018	Three Years	Mechanised cleaning of coaches and depot premises at Coaching complex ADI (BG)

2.10.2 The following activities of ADI- MG have been outsourced.

Sr. No.	Depot	Description	Unit	Quantity for two years.
1.	KKF Coaching Depot. (ADI-MG)	Primary Maintenance Schedule Attention (Every Trip) (706 days)	No. of Bio-Toilet	46596
2.		Monthly Schedule attention)16 times in a tenure of contract)	No. of Bio-Toilet	7296
3.		Quarterly Schedule attention (06 times in a tenure of contract)	No. of Bio-Toilet	2736
4.		Nine Monthly Schedule Attention (02 times in a tenure of contract)	No. of Bio-Toilet	912
5.		Trip Maintenance Schedule attention for secondary Trains (730 days).	No. of Bio-Toilet	1300
6.		Attention (Trip) for terminating trains (730 days) for ADI	No. of Bio-Toilet	1300
7.		Emergency en-route attention at nominated station of the Division (730 days).for ADI	Days	730
8.		Emergency attention at Coaching depots of Division.	No. of Bio-Toilet	09
9	ADI- BG &	Provision for Garbage collection bins in coaches		953

	ADI- MG Depot.	fitted with Bio Toilets of Primary Maintained trains including ADI- MG..	
10		Replacement of Bali Valve of Bio- Toilets system of primary Maintained coaches including dismounting and re3- mounting of Bio-Tanks, including ADI- MG..	19
11		Dismounting of Bio Tanks for any reason, including ADI- MG..	19
12		Mounting of Bio- Tanks for any reasons, including ADI- MG..	19

2.10.3 The following activities of GIM have been outsourced.

Sr. No	Contractor Name	LOA No. & Date	Period of contract	Nature of Work
1	M/s. Dynamic Enterprise	M-442/ 19/ 3/ MCC- IM/2017- 18 dated 01.03.18	Three (03) years	<p>Contract work for Mechanised Cleaning & watering of coaches of Primary/ Secondary/ terminating trains and cleaning of depot premises.</p> <p><u>Schedule of works includes:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Exterior Cleaning of primary/secondary Maintained Coaches. Intensive internal cleaning (A schedule) & Watering of Primary Maintained coaches. Internal Cleaning (Trip Schedule) of Primary/Secondary & Terminating Trains. Watering of Coaches at Station. Yard & Depot Premises cleaning (Area per day 124667 sqm)
2	M/s. Dynamic Enterprise	M 442/19/3/ ACCA/GI M/ 2016- 17 DATED 15.06.2017	Three (03) years	<p>Contract work for Provision of AC Coach Attendants.</p> <p><u>Schedule of works includes:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contract work for provision of AC Coach attendant in train No. 12937/38, 22952/51, 12993/94, 19453/54 and Holiday Special trains, New Budget announce trains, any other trains, FTR Special trains and additional Coaches originating from Gandhidham station of Ahmedabad Division.
3	HPC Corp.	M 442/19/3/ P&RC/NB VJ/17-18 dtd 29.11.17	3 years	<p>Contact work for pest & Rodent Control in Railway passenger coaches maintained at NVVJ and GIM coaching depot of Ahmedabad Division and rodent control in coaching depot yards and station premises.</p> <p><u>Schedule of works includes:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Pest control in Railway passenger coaches at NBVJ & GIM coaching depot.

				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Fogging in Railway passenger coaches at NBVJ & GIM coaching depot. Rodent Control in Railway passenger coaches at NBVJ & GIM coaching depot. Rodent Control in coaching depot yard and station yard at NBVJ & GIM.
4.	M/s Prehari protection system Pvt. Ltd.	M 442/19/3/ Bio Toilet/2016-17 dtd. 03.04.17	2 years	<p>Contract for work for annual maintenance and operation contract (AM/OC) for Biological toilets (DRDE) type fitted in BG coaches.</p> <p><u>Schedule of works includes:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Primary maintenance schedule attention (every trip) (706 days). Monthly schedule attention (16 times in tenure of contract). Quarterly schedule attention (6 times in tenure of contract) Nine monthly schedule attention (2 times in tenure of contract). Trip maintenance schedule attention for secondary trains (730 days). Attention (Trip) for terminating trains (730 days). Emergency attention at coaching depots of Division.
Sr. No	Contractor Name	LOA No. & Date	Period of contract	Nature of Work
1	M/s. Dynamic Enterprise	M-442/ 19/ 3/ MCC-IM/2017-18 dated 01.03.18	Three (03) years	<p>Contract work for Mechanised Cleaning & watering of coaches of Primary/ Secondary/ terminating trains and cleaning of depot premises.</p> <p><u>Schedule of works includes:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Exterior Cleaning of primary/secondary Maintained Coaches. Intensive internal cleaning (A schedule) & Watering of Primary Maintained coaches. Internal Cleaning (Trip Schedule) of Primary/Secondary & Terminating Trains. Watering of Coaches at Station. Yard & Depot Premises cleaning (Area per day 124667 sqm)
2	M/s. Dynamic Enterprise	M 442/19/3/ ACCA/GI M/ 2016-17 DATED 15.06.2017	Three (03) years	<p>Contract work for Provision of AC Coach Attendants.</p> <p><u>Schedule of works includes:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contract work for provision of AC Coach attendant in train No. 12937/38, 22952/51, 12993/94, 19453/54 and Holiday Special trains, New Budget announce trains, any other trains, FTR Special trains and additional Coaches originating from Gandhidham station of

				Ahmedabad Division.
3	HPC Corp.	M 442/19/3/ P&RC/NB VJ/17-18 dtd 29.11.17	3 years	<p>Contact work for pest & Rodent Control in Railway passenger coaches maintained at NVVJ and GIM coaching depot of Ahmedabad Division and rodent control in coaching depot yards and station premises.</p> <p><u>Schedule of works includes:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pest control in Railway passenger coaches at NBVJ & GIM coaching depot. • Fogging in Railway passenger coaches at NBVJ & GIM coaching depot. • Rodent Control in Railway passenger coaches at NBVJ & GIM coaching depot. • Rodent Control in coaching depot yard and station yard at NBVJ & GIM.
4.	M/s Prehari protection system Pvt. Ltd.	M 442/19/3/ Bio Toilet/201 6-17 dtd. 03.04.17	2 years	<p>Contract for work for annual maintenance and operation contract (AM/OC) for Biological toilets (DRDE) type fitted in BG coaches.</p> <p><u>Schedule of works includes:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Primary maintenance schedule attention (every trip) (706 days). • Monthly schedule attention (16 times in tenure of contract). • Quarterly schedule attention (6 times in tenure of contract) • Nine monthly schedule attention (2 times in tenure of contract). • Trip maintenance schedule attention for secondary trains (730 days). • Attention (Trip) for terminating trains (730 days). • Emergency attention at coaching depots of Division.

2.10.4 The following activities of New Bhuj have been outsourced.

Pest & Rodent Control NVBJ & GIM	M/s HPC Corporation, ADI	3 yrs	29.11.17 to 29.11.20
AC Coach Attendant, GIM	M/s Dynamic Enterprises, Ratlam	3 yrs	15.06.17 to 15.06.20
Wagon Repairing, GIM	M/s B Electroplating, Bilaspur	1 yrs	08.05.18 to 08.05.19
Mechanised Cleaning & Watering of Coaches	M/s Dynamic Enterprises	3 yrs	27.02.18 to 27.03.21
On Board House Keeping originating from New Bhuj	M/s. Prabhakar Enterprises	03 Years	14.07.16 to 14.7.19
Mechanised Cleaning, New Bhuj	M.s Oriental Agencies	03 Years	14.02.18 to 14.02.21.

- 2.11** On ADI Division, certain Cleaning activities of SSE Units – ADI-BG, ADI-MG, VG, GIM, NBVJ, PNU, SBI VTA, MSH & GNC. are done by Railway itself and partial outsourcing is done till date.
- 2.12** Work Study Team suggested that all Mechanical depots under ADI division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.

Thus, after outsourcing, the sweeping & cleaning activities of all Mechanical depots under ADI division, $320 - 166 = 154$ posts of Safaiwala & Cleaner remaining after the surrendering of 166 posts as specified in recommendation no. 1.

25.12.1 Recommendation No.1

The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on All Mechanical depots under ADI division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. Thus, 166 vacant posts of Safaiwala & Cleaner are recommended for surrendered immediately.

2.12.2 Recommendation No. 2.

Work Study Team suggested that all Mechanical depots under ADI division may be outsourced to professional housekeeping firms / private contractors for providing a greater level of sanitation/cleanliness.

Thus, after outsourcing, the sweeping & cleaning activities of all Mechanical depots under ADI division, $320 - 166 = 154$ posts of Safaiwala & Cleaner remaining after the surrendering of 166 posts as specified in recommendation no. 1.

CHAPTER – III

3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

- 3.1. The work study team proposed that the cleanliness activity on all the Coaches & Depot Premises over ADI division to be outsourced to Private Contractor and vacant posts are to be surrendered immediately. It is seen from the Cadre position that there are 154 Safaiwala & Cleaner are available against the sanctioned cadre of 320 posts and 166 posts of Safaiwala and Cleaner are vacant on ADI division. Hence, 166 vacant posts of Safaiwala are recommended for surrendered immediately.
- 3.3 After outsourcing, the sweeping & cleaning activities of all the Coaches & Depot Premises over ADI division $320 - 166 = 154$ posts of Safaiwala & Cleaner remaining after the surrendering of 166 posts of Safaiwala's & Cleaner specified in recommendation No. 1 above, may also be surrendered.
- 3.4 On implication of the study report and surrendering the 166 posts at Phase I And 154 posts at Phase II of Safaiwala & Cleaner of Mechanical Department on ADI Division, annual recurring saving will be achieved as tabulated below :-

Phase I

<i>Category</i>	<i>No. of Surplus posts</i>	<i>Average cost per Employee</i>	<i>Annual saving in Rs.</i>
Safaiwala & Cleaner	166	Rs. 6,45,968	Rs. 10,72,30,688

Phase II

<i>Category</i>	<i>No. of Surplus posts</i>	<i>Average cost per Employee</i>	<i>Annual saving in Rs.</i>
Safaiwala & Cleaner	154	Rs. 6,45,968	Rs. 9,94,79,072

- 3.3 On implementation of the recommendations brought out in the work study report, annual recurring saving, per annum can be achieved as follows :-
Phase I - Annual recurring saving of **Rs. 1072.30 Lakhs** per annum can be achieved.

Phase II - Annual recurring saving of **Rs. 994.79 Lakhs** per annum can be achieved.

...oOo...