

WORK STUDY

ON

REVIEW OF STAFF STRENGTH

COMMERCIAL DEPARTMENT

SAFAIWALA

OVER

VADODARA DIVISION

DUE TO OUTSOURCING OF CLEANING ACTIVITIES

(No.G.463/WR/WS-26/2018-19)

<u>Led by:</u>	<u>Study Conducted by:</u>	<u>Study discussed with Co-ordinating Officer</u>
Shri. Rakesh Kumar	Shri. Rishi Thakur	Shri. S. P. Chaubey
(Secy./PG-CCG)	WSI/ CCG	ACM - CHG
	Shri. Arun Sarfare	
<u>Guided By:</u>	CWSI/ CCG	
Shri. Sudhindra Sharma	Shri P.K. Bhowmick	
SWSO-CCG	EI/CCG	
	Shri. R S Warang	
	CWSI/CCG	

Central Planning Organization
Headquarter Office,
Churchgate,
Mumbai-20.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Serial No.	-	26
Study No.	-	WR/WS-26/2018-2019
Case No.	-	G.463/WR/WS-26/2018-2019
Subject	-	Review of staff strength – Commercial Dept. Safaiwalas over Vadodara Division due to Outsourcing of cleaning activities.
Area	-	Vadodara Division
Department	-	Commercial
Authority	-	AGM/CCG
Terms of Reference	-	Assessment of Man power requirement – Corresponding to existing staff strength.
No. of Recommendations	-	3 (Three)
Summary of Recommendations	-	Placed on Page No. (iii)
Projected Manpower	-	

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Gr. D	137	116	-	137	21	116
Total	137	116	-	137	21	116

Financial Implication	-	Recurring Savings of Rs. 884.98 Lakhs (approx)per annum.
-----------------------	---	---

INDEX

Chapter	Content	Reference Para	
		From	To
-	Acknowledgement and Terms of reference	04	
-	Methodology	05	
-	Summary of Recommendations	06	
I	Introduction	07	
II	Existing work load and Critical Analysis	08 to 13	
III	Financial Implication	14	

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The work study team wishes to acknowledge its gratitude to Dr. Zenia Gupta Sr. DCM-BRC, Shri. S P Chaubey ACM(CHG)-BRC and other staff of Commercial and Personnel department of Vadodara Division for the assistance given by them during the course of the study.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

As per Additional General Manager's directives, Secy./PG has instructed to conduct a work study to review the staff strength of Safaiwalas over Commercial department of Vadodara division. Accordingly, a study has been conducted with a view to assess the requirement of man power as a result of outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractors over Vadodara division.

METHODOLOGY

- | | | |
|----------------|---|--|
| Collection | - | of data required for conducting the Work Study. |
| Observation | - | of area wise and activity wise working system. |
| Scrutiny | - | of data collected, existing staff strength, deployment, Quantum of workload arising. |
| Discussion | - | with Co-ordination Commercial officer & Staff in regard to workload arising and actual requirements of staff. |
| Consideration | - | of suggestions and guidelines given by Co-ordination Officer. |
| Assessment | - | Critical examination of existing of working and comparison with cost of manpower provided by Railway vis-a-vis opting for out sourcing the activity. |
| Identification | - | of surplus posts available over and above the need based requirement and discussion with ACM (CHG) - BRC at the time of Study. |
| Finalization | - | of Work Study report with recommendations. |

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation No.

Refer Para

Recommendation No.1

2.9.1

As per Para 2.6.1, Safaiwala's have been deployed by Railway as well as cleaning contractors at 06 stations in Vadodara division. As cleanliness activities have been completely outsourced to private contractors on 06 stations, therefore 38 posts (34 Live + 04 Vacant) of Safaiwala's may be surrendered immediately.

Recommendation No.2

2.9.2

As per Para 2.6.2, There are 27 stations of Vadodara division for which Tenders have been opened and are under process and 17 stations for which tender is under proposal stage for cleaning activities. Total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for 33 stations is 70, out of which 13 vacant posts on these stations may be surrendered immediately and remaining 57 men on roll may be surrendered as soon as tender is finalized during this financial year.

Recommendation No.3

2.9.3

As per Para 2.6.3, total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for 15 stations is 29, wherein 25 men on roll and 04 vacant posts are available. These sanctioned 29 posts of Safaiwala's may also be surrendered gradually during this financial year on outsourcing the cleaning activities on above 15 stations at the earliest.

Summary of Recommendation:

Recommendation	Sanctioned cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Recommended to Surrender
1	38	34	04	38
2	70	57	13	70
3	29	25	04	29
Total	137	116	21	137

CHAPTER – I

INTRODUCTION

- 1.0 Indian Railway is rapidly proceeding towards modernization in all fields. The need of the day is to devote basically on the core activities relating to the transportation part. The age old system of manual cleaning has become obsolete. It not only requires a huge man power but also is time consuming and not effective upto satisfactory levels. The present trend is to provide mechanized cleaning equipments, which provide hygienic environment instilling high satisfaction levels to the users. Moreover it is also cost effective with less involvement of man power.
- 1.1 The Hon'ble Railway Minister announced during the Railway Budget 2014-2015 that a special drive is to be launched for improving passenger amenities and cleanliness with continued focus to enhance passenger comforts, facilities, ambience and aesthetics. A great emphasis has been given to improve the over-all status of sanitation/cleanliness of Railway Stations. Railway Board has issued guidelines for Mechanized cleaning of the different categories of Railway Stations for providing a greater importance to improve the overall levels of sanitation/cleanliness.
- 1.2 Presently, more than half of the total working expenses are expended towards staff costs in the Indian Railways. The administration should plan towards achieving a quantum reduction in man power costs, especially those relating to the non core activities, for sustaining the financial viability of the Indian Railways taking into account the impact of VII th Pay Commission recommendations.
- 1.3 The study has been undertaken with a view to analyze the feasibility of outsourcing the cleanliness activity on all the stations over Western Railway and to re-deploy those Safaiwalas as per requirement. The study has been undertaken as per the order of AGM/CCG.

CHAPTER – II

- 2.0 **EXISTING SYSTM OF WORKING & CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF WORKLOAD:**

2.1 **CADRE:**

2.2 Sanctioned cadre as on 23.07.2018.

Category	Scale of Pay	Cadre	Men on roll	Vacancy
Safaiwala	5200-20200 + 1800	137	116	21

2.3 Station wise distribution of cadre is as under:

Sr. No.	Station	Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy
1	AKV	6	6	0
2	ANND	7	7	0
3	BDE	1	1	0
4	BH	8	6	2
5	BJD	3	3	0
6	BJW	4	4	0
7	BRCP	8	7	1
8	BRCY	4	5	-1
9	CBY	2	2	0
10	CCP	1	1	0
11	CPN	2	1	1
12	CRND	1	0	1
13	CYI	1	1	0
14	DB	3	3	0
15	DK	3	3	0
16	DRL	2	1	1
17	GDA	4	3	1
18	GER	1	1	0
19	GTE	1	0	1
20	HAT	1	0	1
21	ITA	2	2	0
22	KANJ	1	1	0
23	KBRV	2	2	0
24	KIM	3	2	1
25	KRCA	1	1	0
26	KRSA	1	0	1
27	KSB	5	5	0
28	LKD	1	1	0
29	MHD	3	3	0
30	MPR	1	1	0
31	MYG	5	5	0
32	ND	5	5	0
33	NDSR	1	1	0
34	NEP	1	1	0
35	NIU	2	2	0
36	PAO	1	1	0
37	PLJ	4	2	2

38	PRTN	3	3	0
39	PTD	4	3	1
40	RAJ	1	0	1
41	RNO	2	2	0
42	SMLA	2	2	0
43	SVL	3	2	1
44	SYN	3	0	3
45	TBA	2	2	0
46	UMH	2	1	1
47	URN	2	1	1
48	UTD	2	2	0
49	VDA	3	2	1
50	VLYN	1	1	0
51	VRE	1	0	1
52	VSI	3	3	0
53	VXD	1	1	0
54	CTD	0	1	-1
	TOTAL	137	116	21

TOTAL: **Sanctioned Cadre** = **137**
 Men on Roll = **116**
 Vacancy = **21**
 Excess to the Cadre = **00**

2.4 **CLEANING CONTRACTOR POSITION OF BRC DIVISION.**

On Vadodara Division, cleaning activities have been outsourced on certain stations to private contractors and tenders for other stations is under process, the details of which are elaborated as under :

Sr. No	Station	Details of Contract	Remarks
1	GDA	Composite Mechanized Cleaning	Contract Awarded and on going from 15.05.2015 to 15.11.2018
Group of Stations			
2	AKV-ST Section (7) URN, KSE, GTX, SYN,KIM,KSB,PAO	Cleaning contract including Rag picking & Garbage disposal work. C331/CC/Group-1/2017	Financial Bid opened on 23.07.2018 & is under process
3	ND-GER Section (6) GER,BJD,KANJ, NEP, MHD,GTE	Cleaning contract including Rag picking & Garbage disposal work. C331/CC/Group-2/2017	Tender opened on 29.06.2018 & is under process
4	CYI-GDA Section (6) KRSA,DRL,BKRL, CPN,SMLA,PIO	Cleaning contract including Rag picking & Garbage disposal work. C331/CC/Group-4/2017	Under Finance Vetting
5	BRC-BH Section (11) CVJ,NIU,VRE,PLJ, LKD,MYG,KSPR,	Rag picking & Garbage disposal work. C331/CC/Group-5/2017	Under proposal stage

	ITA,VRM,MPR,VS		
6	PRTN-CTD Section (6) PRTN,DB,CCP, BDE,PAVI,CTD	Rag picking & Garbage disposal work. C331/CC/Group-6/2017	Under proposal stage
7	BRC-ND Section (8) BJW,RNO,NDSR, VDA,ADD,VXD, KBRV,UTD	Rag picking & Garbage disposal work. C331/CC/Group-2/2017	Under Finance Vetting
8	BRCP	Composite Mechanized Cleaning Contract valid From 03.05.2016 to 03.05.2019	Handed over by Commercial Department to EnHM wing of Mechanical department on 07.11.2016
9	BH	Composite Mechanized Cleaning Contract valid from 01.06.2015 to 28.02.2019	
10	AKV		
11	ANND	Composite Mechanized Cleaning Contract valid from 11.06.2015 to 10.03.2019	
12	ND		

2.5 From the above table, it can be seen that cleaning activities have been completely outsourced on 06 stations on Vadodara Division & out of these 6 stations, BRCP, BH, AKV, ANND & ND stations are handed over to EnHM wing of Mechanical department of Vadodara division and tender for 44 stations is under process.

2.6 **Staff Deployment and Tender details:**

2.6.1 There are 06 stations over Vadodara division, where cleaning activities are outsourced. Status of tender for cleaning activities and number of Safaiwalas deployed by Railways at these stations over BRC division are as shown under:-

Sr. No.	Station	No. of Rly. Safaiwalas deployed			Tender Status
		Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	
1	GDA	4	3	1	Contract Awarded and going on from 15.05.2015 to 15.11.2018
2	BRCP	8	7	1	Handed over by Commercial Department to EnHM wing of Mechanical department on 07.11.2016
3	BH	8	6	2	
4	AKV	6	6	0	
5	ANND	7	7	0	
6	ND	5	5	0	
	TOTAL	38	34	04	

As per the above table, total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for above 06 stations are 38 out of which 34 men on roll and 04 vacant posts. The cleanliness activity at BRCP, BH, AKV, ANND & ND stations is managed by EnHM wing of Mechanical department w.e.f 07.11.2016 and cleaning contract at GDA station is outsourced to private contractor. Therefore, these 38 posts (34 Live + 04 Vacant) of Safaiwala's may be surrendered immediately.

2.6.2 There are 27 stations of Vadodara division for which Tenders have been opened and are under process and 17 stations for which tender is under proposal stage for cleaning activities. The details are given are as under

Sr. No.	Station	No. of Railway Safaiwalas deployed by Railways			Tender Status
		Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	
1	BDE	1	1	0	Tender under proposal stage
2	BJD	3	3	0	Tender opened and under process
3	BJW	4	4	0	Tender opened and under process
4	CCP	1	1	0	Tender under proposal stage
5	CPN	2	1	1	Tender opened and under process
6	DB	3	3	0	Tender under proposal stage
7	DRL	2	1	1	Tender opened and under process
8	GER	1	1	0	Tender opened and under process
9	GTE	1	0	1	Tender opened and under process
10	ITA	2	2	0	Tender under proposal stage
11	KANJ	1	1	0	Tender opened and under process
12	KBRV	2	2	0	Tender opened and under process
13	KIM	3	2	1	Tender opened and under process
14	KRSA	1	0	1	Tender opened and under process
15	KSB	5	5	0	Tender opened and under process
16	LKD	1	1	0	Tender under proposal stage
17	MHD	3	3	0	Tender opened and under process
18	MPR	1	1	0	Tender under proposal stage
19	MYG	5	5	0	Tender under proposal stage
20	NDSR	1	1	0	Tender opened and under process
21	NEP	1	1	0	Tender opened and under process
22	NIU	2	2	0	Tender under proposal stage
23	PAO	1	1	0	Tender opened and under process
24	PLJ	4	2	2	Tender under proposal stage
25	PRTN	3	3	0	Tender under proposal stage
26	RNO	2	2	0	Tender opened and under process
27	SMLA	2	2	0	Tender opened and under process
28	SYN	3	0	3	Tender opened and under process
29	URN	2	1	1	Tender opened and under process
30	UTD	2	2	0	Tender opened and under process
31	VDA	3	2	1	Tender opened and under process
32	VRE	1	0	1	Tender under proposal stage
33	VXD	1	1	0	Tender opened and under process
	TOTAL	70	57	13	

As per the above table, total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for above 33 stations is 70 out of which 57 men on roll and 13 vacant posts. The 13 vacant posts may be surrendered immediately and remaining 57 men on roll may be surrendered as soon as tender process is finalized during this financial year.

- 2.6.3 There are 15 stations on Vadodara division where Safaiwalas have been deployed by Railway's and no contract is given for cleaning activities. The details are given as under.

Sr. No.	Station	No. of Safaiwala's deployed by Railways		
		Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy
1	BRCY	4	5	-1
2	CBY	2	2	0
3	CRND	1	0	1
4	CYI	1	1	0
5	DK	3	3	0
6	HAT	1	0	1
7	KRCA	1	1	0
8	PTD	4	3	1
9	RAJ	1	0	1
10	SVL	3	2	1
11	TBA	2	2	0
12	UMH	2	1	1
13	VLYN	1	1	0
14	VSI	3	3	0
15	CTD	0	1	-1
	TOTAL	29	25	04

As per the above table, total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for above 15 stations is 29, out of which 25 men on roll and 4 vacant posts. These sanctioned 29 posts of Safaiwala's may also be surrendered gradually during this financial year on outsourcing the cleaning activities on above stations at the earliest.

2.7 **Existing system of working**

- 2.7.1 **Sweeping of Platforms** : The major work of Safaiwalas comprises of sweeping of platforms and collection of refuse from tracks upto platform limits of stations, apart from cleanliness of service buildings, offices, retiring room, waiting rooms, platforms, toilets and circulation area in the station complex. They are also engaged in sweeping of FOBs, waiting halls, water vats, spittoons, retiring rooms and seating arrangements.

2.8 **Proposed system of working**

The work study team made a detailed study into all the aspects of working of Safaiwalas and have concluded that:

- The cleanliness activity on all the stations under Vadodara division to be outsourced to Private Contractor which will ensure greater discipline and accountability for higher standard of cleanliness as also to tackle the problem of high absenteeism amongst Safaiwalas.

- (ii) It should be ensured that the contractors deploy the full sanctioned strength of employees at each station in order to achieve higher standards of cleanliness.
- (iii) The posts of Safaiwalas, who have been deployed at stations where cleaning activities have been outsourced to private contractors, may be surrendered immediately.

2.9 **Recommendations:**

2.9.1 **Recommendation No.1**

As per Para 2.6.1, Safaiwala's have been deployed by Railway as well as cleaning contractors at 06 stations in Vadodara division. As cleanliness activities have been completely outsourced to private contractors on 06 stations, therefore 38 posts (34 Live + 04 Vacant) of Safaiwala's may be surrendered immediately.

2.9.2 **Recommendation No.2**

As per Para 2.6.2, There are 27 stations of Vadodara division for which Tenders have been opened and are under process and 17 stations for which tender is under proposal stage for cleaning activities. Total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for 33 stations is 70, out of which 13 vacant posts on these stations may be surrendered immediately and remaining 57 men on roll may be surrendered as soon as tender is finalized during this financial year.

2.9.3 **Recommendation No.3**

As per Para 2.6.3, total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for 15 stations is 29, wherein 25 men on roll and 04 vacant posts are available. These sanctioned 29 posts of Safaiwala's may also be surrendered gradually during this financial year on outsourcing the cleaning activities on above 15 stations at the earliest.

2.9.4 **Summary of Recommendation:**

Recommendation	Sanctioned cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Recommended to Surrender
1	38	34	04	38
2	70	57	13	70
3	29	25	04	29
Total	137	116	21	137

...ooo...

CHAPTER – III

FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

- 3.1 After carefully scrutinizing the current working scenario of Safaiwalas, the work study team has identified **a total of 137 posts as surplus**.
- 3.2 The work study team has identified **137 Group-D posts** as surplus for surrender, 21 vacant and 116 live posts.

Recommendations	Surplus Staff	Annual saving per person (In Rs.)	Total savings (In Rs.)
Recommendation No. 1	38	6,45,968/-	2,45,46,784/-
Recommendation No. 2	70		4,52,17,760/-
Recommendation No. 3	29		1,87,33,072/-
Total	137	Rs. 6,45,968/-	Rs. 8,84,97,616/-

- 3.3 On implementation of the recommendations brought out in the work study report annual recurring saving of **Rs. 884.98 Lakhs** per annum can be ac