

STUDY REPORT ON
REVIEW OF STAFF STRENGTH OF
COMMERCIAL DEPARTMENT
SAFAIWALAS
OVER
RAJKOT DIVISION
DUE TO OUTSOURCING OF CLEANING ACTIVITIES

Study No.G.463/WR/WS-13/2018-19

<u>Led by:</u>	<u>Study Conducted by:</u>	<u>Assistance from Division</u>
Shri. Rakesh Kumar	Shri. Arun Sarfare	Shri. Ravindra Shrivastav
(Secy./PG-CCG)	CWSI/ CCG	Sr. DCM-RJT
	Shri. Rishi Thakur	
<u>Guided By:</u>	WSI/ CCG	Ms.Neelam Chouhan
Shri. Sudhindra Sharma	Shri P.K. Bhowmick	ACM (Frt) - RJT
SWSO-CCG	EI/CCG	
	Shri. R S Warang	Shri. Ashutosh Kumar
	CWSI/CCG	APO - RJT

Central Planning Organization
Headquarter Office
Churchgate
Mumbai – 400 020

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Serial No.	-	13
Study No.	-	WR/WS-13/2018-2019
Case No.	-	G.463/WR/WS-13/2018-2019
Subject	-	Review of staff strength – Commercial Dept. Safaiwalas over Rajkot Division due to Outsourcing of cleaning activities.
Area	-	Rajkot Division
Department	-	Commercial
Authority	-	AGM/CCG
Terms of Reference	-	Assessment of Man power requirement – Corresponding to existing staff strength.
No. of Recommendations	-	3 (Three)
Summary of Recommendations	-	Placed on Page No. (iii)
Projected Manpower	-	

Category	Existing Cadre	Men on roll	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Gr. D	36	25	00	36	11	25
Total	36	25	00	36	11	25

Financial Implication	-	Recurring Savings of Rs. 232.55 Lakhs (approx)per annum.
-----------------------	---	---

...o0o...

INDEX

Chapter	Content	Reference Para	
		From	To
-	Acknowledgement and Terms of reference	04	
-	Methodology	05	
-	Summary of Recommendations	06	
I	Introduction	07	
II	Existing work load and Critical Analysis	08 to 13	
III	Financial Implication	14	

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The work study team wishes to acknowledge its gratitude to

Shri. Ravindra Shrivastav,	Sr. DCM- RJT
Ms. Neelam Chouhan	ACM (Frt)- RJT
Shri. Ashutosh kumar	APO- RJT

and their staff of Commercial and Personnel department of Rajkot Division for the assistance given by them during the course of the study.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

As per Additional General Manager's directives, Secy./PG has instructed to conduct a work study to review the staff strength of Safaiwala's over Commercial department of Rajkot division. Accordingly, a study has been conducted with a view to assess the requirement of man power as a result of outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractors over Rajkot division.

...ooo...

METHODOLOGY

Collection	-	of data required for conducting the Work Study.
Observation	-	of area wise and activity wise working system.
Scrutiny	-	of data collected, existing staff strength, deployment, Quantum of workload arising.
Discussion	-	with Co-ordination Personnel & Commercial officers & Staff in regard to workload arising and actual requirements of staff.
Consideration	-	of suggestions and guidelines given by Co-ordination Officer.
Assessment	-	Critical examination of existing of working and Comparison with cost of manpower provided by Railway vis-a-vis opting for out sourcing the activity.
Provision	-	of Leave Reserve and Rest Givers on the bare proposed manpower.
Identification	-	of surplus posts available over and above the need based requirement and discussion with Sr. DCM- RJT and ACM (Frt) - RJT at the time of Study.
Proposal	-	for adoption of change in existing working system.
Finalization	-	of Work Study report with recommendations.

...ooo...

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation No.

Refer Para

Recommendation No.1

2.9.1

As per Para 2.6 & 2.6.1 (b), Safaiwala's have been deployed by Railway as well as cleaning contractors at 11 stations in Rajkot division. As cleanliness activities have been completely outsourced to private contractors on 11 stations, therefore 11 posts (04 Live + 07 Vacant) of Safaiwala's may be surrendered immediately and 01 excess post to the cadre at JAM station may be redeployed.

Recommendation No.2

2.9.2

As per Para 2.6.2, there are 12 stations of Rajkot division for which Tender has been opened on 26.04.2018 and under process. Total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for 12 stations is 18, out of which 04 vacant posts on these stations may be surrendered immediately and remaining 14 men on roll may be surrendered as soon as tender is finalized during this financial year.

Recommendation No.3

2.9.3

As per Para 2.6.3, total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for 06 stations is 07, wherein 08 men on roll are available (including 01 excess post at WML station). These sanctioned 07 posts of Safaiwala's may also be surrendered gradually during this financial year on outsourcing the cleaning activities on above stations at the earliest and the 01 excess post to the cadre at WML station may be redeployed.

Summary of Recommendation:

Recommendation	Sanctioned cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Excess, if any	Recommended to Surrender
1	11	4	07	01	11
2	18	14	04	00	18
3	7	7	00	01	7
Total	36	25	11	02**	36*

* Recommended to surrender sanctioned 36 posts as per recommendations 1, 2 & 3.

** Two excess post other than sanctioned cadre may be redeployed.

...o0o...

CHAPTER – I

INTRODUCTION

- 1.0 Indian Railway is rapidly proceeding towards modernization in all fields. The need of the day is to devote basically on the core activities relating to the transportation part. The age old system of manual cleaning has become obsolete. It not only requires a huge man power but also is time consuming and not effective up to satisfactory levels. The present trend is to provide mechanized cleaning equipments, which provide hygienic environment instilling high satisfaction levels to the users. Moreover it is also cost effective with less involvement of man power.
- 1.1 The Hon'ble Railway Minister announced during the Railway Budget 2014-2015 that a special drive is to be launched for improving passenger amenities and cleanliness with continued focus to enhance passenger comforts, facilities, ambience and aesthetics. A great emphasis has been given to improve the over-all status of sanitation/cleanliness of Railway Stations. Railway Board has issued guidelines for Mechanized cleaning of the different categories of Railway Stations for providing a greater importance to improve the overall levels of sanitation/cleanliness.
- 1.2 Presently, more than half of the total working expenses are expended towards staff costs in the Indian Railways. The administration should plan towards achieving a quantum reduction in man power costs, especially those relating to the non core activities, for sustaining the financial viability of the Indian Railways taking into account the impact of VII th Pay Commission recommendations.
- 1.3 The study has been undertaken with a view to analyze the feasibility of outsourcing the cleanliness activity on all the stations over Western Railway and to re-deploy those Safaiwalas as per requirement. The study has been undertaken as per the order of AGM/CCG.

...o0o...

CHAPTER – II

2.0 EXISTING SYSTM OF WORKING & CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF WORKLOAD:

2.1 CADRE:

2.2 Sanctioned cadre as on 01.04.2018.

Category	Scale of Pay	Cadre	Men on roll	Vacancy
Safaiwala	5200-20200 + 1800	36	25	11 + (01) each excess Post at WML & JAM

2.3 Sr. DPO-RJT has surrendered the **10 vacant posts** of Safaiwala's of Commercial department under "Pool of Surrendered of Posts" and surrendered 02 Manned post vide memorandum no. EC/261/Pool of surrender of post dtd. 22.01.2018.

2.4 Station wise deployment of Safaiwala cadre provided by Sr. DPO-RJT is as under:

Sr. No.	Station	Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Excess
1	MTHP	1	1	0	0
2	BMRN	1	1	0	0
3	DWK	1	1	0	0
4	GRJA	1	1	0	0
5	BHTA	1	1	0	0
6	BPKA	1	0	1	0
7	BHTL	1	0	1	0
8	KMBL	2	2	0	0
9	KNLS	1	0	1	0
10	*WML	0	<u>1</u>	0	<u>1</u>
11	*JAM	0	<u>1</u>	0	<u>1</u>
12	HXP	2	2	0	0
13	ALB	1	0	1	0
14	WTJ	1	0	1	0
15	JALD	1	0	1	0
16	HM	1	0	1	0
17	PDH	1	1	0	0
18	BKNG	3	3	0	0
19	RJT	2	1	1	0
20	KNKT	1	0	1	0
21	WKR	1	0	1	0
22	DAC	1	1	0	0
23	MVI	2	2	0	0
24	LUN	1	1	0	0
25	THAN	3	2	1	0
26	VD	1	1	0	0
27	MOL	1	1	0	0
28	SUNR	1	1	0	0
29	SR	1	1	0	0
30	ATS RJT	1	1	0	0
	Total	36	25	11	02

TOTAL:	Sanctioned Cadre	= 36
	Men on Roll	= 25
	Vacancy	= 11
	*Excess	= 02

***As per Cadre position provided by division, no sanction cadre is available at JAM & WML stations. However, administration has deployed 02 staff at JAM & WML which are shown as excess apart from sanctioned cadre.**

2.4 **CLEANING CONTRACTOR POSITION OF RJT DIVN.**

On Rajkot Division cleaning activities have been outsourced on certain stations to private contractors. Tenders have been opened for 22 stations on 19.04.2018 & 26.04.2018 and are under process, the details of which are elaborated as under:

Sr. No	Type of Contract	Station	Name of Party	Date of Starting	Date of Completion	Man powers	Remarks
1	Mechanized Cleaning & Rag Picking	OKHA	M/s Trump & Jump Enterprise	10.12.17	09.12.20	8	Contract Awarded
		DWK	M/s Z. K. Enterprise	17.01.18	16.01.21	10	Contract Awarded
		JAM	M/s Oriental Agencies	12.02.15	11.05.18	16	Tender opened on 19.04.18 & is under process
		HAPA	M/s Z. K. Enterprise	01.06.17	31.05.20	9	Contract Awarded
		RJT	M/s Oriental Agencies	10.02.15	09.02.18		Handed over to EnHM on 21.11.2017
		WKR	M/s Krishna Sai Enterprise	06.06.17	05.06.20	9	Contract Awarded
		SUNR	M/s Oriental Agencies	09.06.17	08.06.20	14	Contract Awarded
2	Housekeeping and Rag picking work	Group no. 1 (MTHP-1, BHTA-3, BPKA-1, BHTL-1, KMBL-6, MDPR-1)				13	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
		Group No.2 (KNLS-3, LKBL-1, ALB-1, WTJ-1, JALD-1, HM-1, PDH-1, KHDI-1)	M/s Z. K. Enterprise	29.01.18	28.01.21	10	Contract Awarded
		Group no. 3 (BKNG-5, BLWR-1, KHC-1, KNKT-1, SDD-1, MU-1, NZG-1, MVI-3)	-	-	-	-	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
		Group No.4 (DL-1, Than-6, VD-1, RA-1, MOL-1, LTR-1, SR-1)	-	-	-	-	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process

- 2.5 From the above table, it can be seen that cleaning activities have been completely out sourced on 13 Stations on Rajkot Division & Rajkot station is handed over to EnHM department and tender for 23 stations is under process.
- 2.6 Status of tender for cleaning activities and number of Safaiwala's deployed by Railways as well as private contractor's at stations over RJT division are as shown under:-

Sr. No	Station	No. of Safaiwala's deployed by Railways			No. of Safaiwala's deployed by contractor & Tender status
		Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	
1	MTHP	1	1	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
2	BMRN	1	1	0	-
3	DWK	1	1	0	10
4	GRJA	1	1	0	-
5	BHTA	1	1	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
6	BPKA	1	0	1	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
7	BHTL	1	0	1	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
8	KMBL	2	2	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
9	KNLS	1	0	1	3
10	*WML	0	1	-1	-
11	*JAM	0	1	-1	16
12	HXP	2	2	0	-
13	ALB	1	0	1	1
14	WTJ	1	0	1	1
15	JALD	1	0	1	1
16	HM	1	0	1	1
17	PDH	1	1	0	1
18	BKNG	3	3	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
19	RJT	2	1	1	Under EnHM Dept.
20	KNKT	1	0	1	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
21	WKR	1	0	1	9
22	DAC	1	1	0	-
23	MVI	2	2	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
24	LUN	1	1	0	-
25	THAN	3	2	1	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
26	VD	1	1	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
27	MOL	1	1	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
28	SUNR	1	1	0	14
29	SR	1	1	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
30	ATS RJT	1	1	0	-
	Total	36	25	11 + (01) each excess Post at WML & JAM	

2.6.1 There are 11 stations on Rajkot division where Safaiwala's have been deployed by Railway as well as Cleaning contractors. The details are given as under.

Sr. No.	Station	No. of Safaiwala's deployed by Railways				No. of Safaiwala's deployed by contractor
		Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Excess to cadre	
1	DWK	1	1	0	0	10
2	KNLS	1	0	1	0	3
3	*JAM	0	1	0	1	16
4	ALB	1	0	1	0	1
5	WTJ	1	0	1	0	1
6	JALD	1	0	1	0	1
7	HM	1	0	1	0	1
8	PDH	1	1	0	0	1
9	RJT	2	1	1	0	Under EnHM Dept.
10	WKR	1	0	1	0	9
11	SUNR	1	1	0	0	14
	Total	11	5*	7	1	57

***5= 4 + 1 (excess post at JAM station)**

- a) As per the above table, total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for above 11 stations are 11 numbers of Safaiwala's out of which there are 04 men on roll, 07 vacant posts and 01 excess post to the cadre on above stations.
- b) The cleanliness activity at Rajkot station is managed by EnHM department w.e.f 21.11.2017 and cleaning contract for remaining 10 stations is outsourced by deploying 57 numbers of Safaiwala's as mentioned in above table. Therefore, these 11 posts (04 Live + 07 Vacant) of Safaiwala's may be surrendered immediately and 01 excess post to the cadre at JAM station may be redeployed.

2.6.2 There are 12 stations of Rajkot division for which Tenders have been opened for cleaning activities on 26.04.2018 and are under process. The details are given as under

Sr. No.	Station	No. of Safaiwala's deployed by Railways			Tender status
		Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	
1	MTHP	1	1	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
2	BHTA	1	1	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
3	BPKA	1	0	1	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
4	BHTL	1	0	1	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
5	KMBL	2	2	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
6	BKNG	3	3	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
7	KNKT	1	0	1	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
8	MVI	2	2	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
9	THAN	3	2	1	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
10	VD	1	1	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
11	MOL	1	1	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
12	SR	1	1	0	Tender opened on 26.04.18 & is under process
	Total	18	14	4	

As per the above table, total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for above 12 stations is 18, out of which 14 men on roll and 04 vacant posts. The 04 vacant posts may be surrendered immediately and remaining 14 men on roll may be surrendered as soon as tender is finalized during this financial year.

- 2.6.3 There are 07 stations on Rajkot division where Safaiwala's have been deployed by Railway. The details are given are as under.

Sr. No.	Station	No. of Safaiwala's deployed by Railways			
		Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Excess to Cadre
1	BMRN	1	1	0	0
2	GRJA	1	1	0	0
3	*WML	0	*1	0	*1
4	HXP	2	2	0	0
5	DAC	1	1	0	0
6	LUN	1	1	0	0
7	ATS RJT	1	1	0	0
	Total	7	8*	0	1

*8= 7+1 (excess post at WML station)

As per the above table, total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for above 06 stations is 07, wherein 08 men on roll are available (including 01 excess post at WML station). These sanctioned 07 posts of Safaiwala's may also be surrendered gradually during this financial year on outsourcing the cleaning activities on above stations at the earliest and the 01 excess post to the cadre at WML station may be redeployed.

2.7 Existing system of working

- 2.7.1 **Sweeping of Platforms** : The major work of Safaiwala's comprises of sweeping of platforms and collection of refuse from tracks up to platform limits of stations, apart from cleanliness of service buildings, offices, retiring room, waiting rooms, platforms, toilets and circulation area in the station complex. They are also engaged in sweeping of FOBs, waiting halls, water vats, spittoons, retiring rooms and seating arrangements.

2.8 Proposed system of working

The work study team made a detailed study into all the aspects of working of Safaiwala's and have concluded that:

- The cleanliness activity on all the stations under Rajkot division to be outsourced to Private Contractor which will ensure greater discipline and accountability for higher standard of cleanliness as also to tackle the problem of high absenteeism amongst Safaiwala's.
- It should be ensured that the contractors deploy the full sanctioned strength of employees at each station in order to achieve higher standards of cleanliness.

- (iii) The posts of Safaiwala's, which have been deployed at stations where cleaning activities have been outsourced to private contractors, may be surrendered immediately.

2.9 **Recommendations:**

2.9.1 **Recommendation No.1**

As per Para 2.6 & 2.6.1 (b), Safaiwala's have been deployed by Railway as well as cleaning contractors at 11 stations in Rajkot division. As cleanliness activities have been completely outsourced to private contractors on 11 stations, therefore 11 posts (04 Live + 07 Vacant) of Safaiwala's may be surrendered immediately and 01 excess post to the cadre at JAM station may be redeployed.

2.9.2 **Recommendation No.2**

As per Para 2.6.2, there are 12 stations of Rajkot division for which Tender has been opened on 26.04.2018 and under process. Total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for 12 stations is 18, out of which 04 vacant posts on these stations may be surrendered immediately and remaining 14 men on roll may be surrendered as soon as tender is finalized during this financial year.

2.9.3 **Recommendation No.3**

As per Para 2.6.3, total sanctioned cadre of Safaiwala's for 06 stations is 07, wherein 08 men on roll are available (including 01 excess post at WML station). These sanctioned 07 posts of Safaiwala's may also be surrendered gradually during this financial year on outsourcing the cleaning activities on above stations at the earliest and the 01 excess post to the cadre at WML station may be redeployed.

2.9.4 **Summary of Recommendation:**

Recommendation	Sanctioned cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	Excess, if any	Recommended to Surrender
1	11	4	07	01	11
2	18	14	04	00	18
3	7	7	00	01	7
Total	36	25	11	02**	36*

* Recommended to surrender sanctioned 36 posts as per recommendations 1, 2 & 3.

** Two excess post other than sanctioned cadre may be redeployed.

...o0o...

CHAPTER – III

FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

- 3.1 After carefully scrutinizing the current working scenario of Safaiwalas, the work study team has identified **a total of 36 posts as surplus.**
- 3.2 The work study team has identified **36 Group-D posts** as surplus for surrender, 11 vacant and 25 live posts.

Recommendations	Surplus Staff	Annual saving per person (In Rs.)	Total savings (In Rs.)
Recommendation No. 1	11	6,45,968/-	71,05,648/-
Recommendation No. 2	18		1,16,27,424/-
Recommendation No. 3	7		45,21,776/-
Total	36	Rs. 6,45,968/-	Rs. 2,32,54,848

- 3.3 On implementation of the recommendations brought out in the work study report annual recurring saving of **Rs. 232.55 Lakhs** per annum can be achieved.

...END...