

WORK STUDY
ON
REVIEW OF STAFF STRENGTH
COMMERCIAL DEPARTMENT
SAFAIWALAS
OVER
MUMBAI DIVISION
DUE TO OUTSOURCING OF CLEANING ACTIVITIES

(No.G.463/WR/WS-12/2018-19)

Led by :

Shri. Rakesh Kumar,
Secy(PG)-CCG

Guided by:

Shri. Sudhindra Sharma,
SWSO-CCG

Study conducted by :

Shri. P K Bhowmick, EI- CCG
Shri. R.S.Warang, CWSI-CCG
Shri. Rishi Thakur, WSI-CCG

Central Planning Organization
Headquarter Office,
Churchgate,
Mumbai-20.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Serial No.	-	12
Study No.	-	WR/WS-12/2018-2019
Case No.	-	G.463/WR/WS-12/2018-2019
Subject	-	Review of staff strength – Commercial Dept. Safaiwalas over Mumbai Division due to Outsourcing of cleaning activities.
Area	-	Mumbai Division
Department	-	Commercial
Authority	-	AGM/CCG
Terms of Reference	-	Assessment of Man power requirement – Corresponding to existing staff strength.
No. of Recommendations	-	3 (Three)
Summary of Recommendations	-	Placed on Page No. (iii)
Projected Manpower	-	

Category	Existing Cadre	Man on roll	Proposed Cadre	Proposed for surrender	Vacant post	Live post
Gr. C	--	--	--	--	--	--
Gr. D	40	50	1	39	-	39
Total	40	50	1	39	-	39

Financial Implication	-	Recurring Savings of Rs 251.92 Lakhs (approx)per annum.
-----------------------	---	--

INDEX

Chapter	Content	Reference Para	
		From	To
-	Acknowledgement and Terms of reference	(i)	--
-	Methodology	(ii)	--
-	Summary of Recommendations	(iii)	--
I	Introduction	1	--
II	Existing work load and Critical Analysis	2	7
III	Financial Implication	8	--

(i)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The work study team wishes to acknowledge its gratitude to Shri. Ashok Meena ACM(G) –BCT, Smt. Bharati Salunke CCMI-BCT and other staff of Commercial and Personnel department of Mumbai Division for the assistance given by them during the course of the study.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

As per Additional General Manager's directives, Secy./PG has instructed to conduct a work study to review the staff strength of Safaiwalas over Commercial department of Mumbai division. Accordingly, a study has been conducted with a view to assess the requirement of man power as a result of outsourcing of cleaning activities to private contractors over Mumbai division.

(ii)

METHODOLOGY

Collection	-	of data required for conducting the Work Study.
Observation	-	of area wise and activity wise working system.
Scrutiny	-	of data collected, existing staff strength, deployment, Quantum of workload arising.
Discussion	-	with Co-ordination Officer / Station Supdt. and Dy.SS in regard to workload arising and actual requirements of staff.
Consideration	-	of suggestions and guidelines given by Co-ordination Officer and Station Supdt.
Assessment	-	Critical examination of existing of working and comparison with cost of manpower provided by Railway vis-a-vis opting for out sourcing the activity.
Provision	-	of Leave Reserve and Rest Givers on the bare proposed manpower.
Identification	-	of surplus posts available over and above the need based requirement and discussion with Dy.SS(Comml.) at the time of Study.
Finalization	-	of Work Study report with recommendations.

(iii)

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation No.

Refer Para

Recommendation No.1

2.10

39 posts of Safaiwalas deployed at present at stations where cleanliness activities have been outsourced to private contractors may be surrendered immediately.

Recommendation No.2

2.11

10 posts of Safaiwalas are Excess to the cadre, may be redeployed, wherever required.

Recommendation No.3

2.12

The cleanliness activity of all the stations on Mumbai Division may be outsourced to private contractors, and the 01 post of Safaiwala at JOS/AT remaining after the surrender of 39 posts as specified in Recommendation No. 1, may also be surrendered.

On outsourcing the cleaning activities the cadre of Safaiwala may be surrender gradually.

CHAPTER – I

INTRODUCTION

- 1.0 Indian Railway is rapidly proceeding towards modernization in all fields. The need of the day is to devote basically on the core activities relating to the transportation part. The age old system of manual cleaning has become obsolete. It not only requires a huge man power but also is time consuming and not effective upto satisfactory levels. The present trend is to provide mechanized cleaning equipments, which provide hygienic environment instilling high satisfaction levels to the users. Moreover it is also cost effective with less involvement of man power.
- 1.1 The Hon'ble Railway Minister announced during the Railway Budget 2014-2015 that a special drive is to be launched for improving passenger amenities and cleanliness with continued focus to enhance passenger comforts, facilities, ambience and aesthetics. A great emphasis has been given to improve the over-all status of sanitation/cleanliness of Railway Stations. Railway Board has issued guidelines for Mechanized cleaning of the different categories of Railway Stations for providing a greater importance to improve the overall levels of sanitation/cleanliness.
- 1.2 Presently, more than half of the total working expenses are expended towards staff costs in the Indian Railways. The administration should plan towards achieving a quantum reduction in man power costs, especially those relating to the non core activities, for sustaining the financial viability of the Indian Railways taking into account the impact of VIIth Pay Commission recommendations.
- 1.3 The study has been undertaken with a view to analyze the feasibility of outsourcing the cleanliness activity on all the stations over Western Railway and to re-deploy those Safaiwalas as per requirement. The study has been undertaken as per the order of AGM/CCG.

CHAPTER – II

2.0 EXISTING SYSTM OF WORKING & CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF WORKLOAD:

2.1 CADRE:

2.2 Sanctioned cadre as on 09.05.2018.

Category	Scale of Pay	Cadre	Men on roll	Vacancy
Safaiwala	5200-20200 + 1800	40	50	-10

2.3 Station wise distribution of cadre is as under:

Sr. No.	Station	Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy
1	CCG	0	1	-1
2	MEL	4	6	-2
3	CYR	5	5	0
4	GTR	10	10	0
5	MX	4	4	0
6	PL	4	4	0
7	EPR	4	3	1
8	MRU	4	4	0
9	MM	3	2	1
10	JOS/AT	1	1	0
11	PLG	0	1	-1
12	DRD	0	1	-1
13	SJN	0	1	-1
14	VAPI	1	1	0
15	PAD	0	1	-1
16	BL	0	2	-2
17	BIM	0	2	-2
18	SCH	0	1	-1
	Total	40	50	-10

TOTAL:	Sanctioned Cadre	= 40
	Men on Roll	= 50
	Vacancy	= 00
	Excess to the Cadre	= -10

2.4 CLEANING CONTRACTOR POSITION OF BCT DIVISION.

On Mumbai Division cleaning activities have been outsourced on certain stations to private contractors, the details of which are elaborated as under :

Sr. No	Station	Name of Contractor	Type	Period		Labour Per Day
				From	To	
1	Churchgate	M/s. KHFM Hospitality & Facility Management Services Pvt. Ltd.	Mech.	01.12.15	30.11.18	31
2	Marine Lines	M/s. KHFM Hospitality & Facility Management Services Pvt. Ltd.	Manual	10.10.17	09.10.19	15
3	Charni Road					13
4	Grant Road					18
5	Mahalaxmi					11
6	Lower Parel					17
7	Elphinston Road					12
8	Matunga Road					9
9	Mahim Jn.					24
10	Ram Mandir Road					17
11	Mumbai Central Main	M/s ALL Services Global Pvt. Ltd.	Integrated and Mech.	16.08.16	15.08.19	152
12	Mumbai Central Local					
13	Dadar	M/s Ashirwad Constructions	Manual	11.09.16	10.09.19	65
14	Bandra		Manual			45
15	Bandra Terminus	M/s ALL Services Global Pvt. Ltd.	Integrated and Mech.	03.09.16	02.09.19	190
16	Khar Road	M/s P.S.Chandock & Co.	Manual	22.02.17	21.02.19	14
17	Santacruz		Manual			16
18	Malad		Manual			21
19	Dahisar		Manual			14
20	Andheri	M/s Principle securities & Allied services Pvt. Ltd.	Mech.	23.12.15	22.12.18	64
21	Vile Parle		Manual			16
22	Jogeshwari	M/s. KHFM Hospitality & Facility Management	Manual	14.03.17	13.03.19	19
23	Goregaon		Manual			29

24	Kandivali	Services Pvt. Ltd.	Manual			26
25	Borivali		Mech.			81
26	Mira Road	M/s P.S.Chandock & Co	Manual	01.03.17	28.02.19	18
27	Bhayandar & RC		Manual			30
28	Naigaon & RC		Manual			12
29	Vasai Road		Manual			38
30	Nallasopara & RC		Manual			22
31	Virar	M/s Eagle Security Services and labour Supplier	Manual	18.02.16	17.02.19	56
32	Palghar		Mech.			23
33	Vaitarna	M/s M S Enterprises	Manual	14.05.17	13.05.19	2
34	Saphale		Manual			6
35	Kelve Road		Manual			3
36	Boisar		Manual			19
37	Vangaon		Manual			3
38	Dahanu Road		Manual			23
39	Gholvad		Manual			3
40	Umbergaon Road		Manual			7
41	Sanjan		Manual			8
42	Bhilad		Manual			8
43	Karambeli		Manual			3
44	Vapi		Mech.			31
45	Valsad	M/s P. S. Chandock & Co.	Manual	01.03.18	15.05.18	26
46	Navsari	M/s P. S. Chandock & Co.	Manual	08.03.18	22.05.18	23
47	Udhana	M/s M S Enterprises	Mech.	27.10.15	26.10.18	18
48	Bilimora Jn		Manual			18
49	Bilimora(NG)		Manual			11
50	Udvada		Mech.			11
51	Surat	M/s Prabhakar Enterprises	Mech.	01.05.18	30.04.20	115
52	Vyara	M/s P S Chandock & Co.	Manual	17.11.15	16.05.18	19
53	Bardoli		Manual			23
54	Nandurbar	M/s Oriental Agencies	Manual	18.12.16	17.12.18	18
55	Dondaicha (incl colony)		Manual			11
56	Amalner		Manual			11
57	Chalthan	M/s Oriental Agencies	Manual	15.09.17	14.09.19	12
58	Gangadhra		Manual			5

59	Timbarva		Manual			5
60	Madhi		Manual			5
61	Lotarva		Manual			3
62	Kaher		Manual			3
63	Kikakui Road		Manual			5
64	Ukai Songhad		Manual			10
65	Lokkadkot		Manual			5
66	Bhadbunja		Manual			6
67	Navapur		Manual			15
68	Kolde		Manual			3
69	Chinchpada		Manual			5
70	Khatgaon		Manual			6
71	Khandbara		Manual			7
72	Bhadwad		Manual			6
73	Dhekvad		Manual			5
74	Chaupale	M/s Oriental Agencies	Manual	10.10.17	09.10.19	5
75	Tisi		Manual			5
76	Ranala		Manual			5
77	Vikhran Road		Manual			5
78	Sindkheda		Manual			8
79	Hol		Manual			3
80	Nardana		Manual			9
81	Padse		Manual			6
82	Bhortex		Manual			6
83	Takarkhede		Manual			3
84	Dharangaon		Manual			9
85	Chavalkhede		Manual			6
86	Paldhi	Manual	6			
Total						1,709

2.5 From the above table, it can be seen that cleaning activities have been completely out sourced on 86 Stations between CCG and PLD Stations on Mumbai Division.

2.6 However, on 16 of these 86 stations railway as well as private contractor's Safaiwalas have also been deployed as shown below:-

Sr. No.	Station	No. of Rly. Safaiwalas deployed			No. of Safaiwalas deployed by contractor
		Sanction Cadre	Men on Roll	Vacancy	
1	CCG	0	1	-1	31
2	MEL	4	6	-2	15
3	CYR	5	5	0	13
4	GTR	10	10	0	18
5	MX	4	4	0	11
6	PL	4	4	0	17
7	EPR	4	3	1	12

8	MRU	4	4	0	9
9	MM	3	2	1	24
10	JOS/AT	1	1	0	0
11	PLG	0	1	-1	23
12	DRD	0	1	-1	23
13	SJN	0	1	-1	8
14	VAPI	1	1	0	31
15	PAD	0	1	-1	6
16	BL	0	2	-2	26
17	BIM	0	2	-2	18
18	SCH	0	1	-1	0
	Total	40	50	-10	285

2.7 **Existing system of working**

2.7.1 **Sweeping of Platforms** : The major work of Safaiwalas comprises of sweeping of platforms and collection of refuse from tracks upto platform limits of stations, apart from cleanliness of service buildings, offices, retiring room, waiting rooms, platforms, toilets and circulation area in the station complex. They are also engaged in sweeping of FOBs, waiting halls, water vats, spittoons, retiring rooms and seating arrangements.

2.8 **Proposed system of working**

The work study team made a detailed study into all the aspects of working of Safaiwalas and have concluded that:

- (i) The cleanliness activity on all the stations under Mumbai division to be outsourced to Private Contractor which will ensure greater discipline and accountability for higher standard of cleanliness as also to tackle the problem of high absenteeism amongst Safaiwalas.
- (ii) It should be ensured that the contractors deploy the full sanctioned strength of employees at each station in order to achieve higher standards of cleanliness.
- (iii) The posts of Safaiwalas, who have been deployed at stations where cleaning activities have been outsourced to private contractors, may be surrendered immediately.

2.9 As mentioned in para 2.6, 86 stations were outsourced to private contractors and 1709 safaiwalas were deployed. At the same time, there are 50 safaiwalas were available against the sanctioned cadre of 40 posts. Out of these, 39 posts may be surrendered immediately and 01 post of safaiwala at JOS/AT may also be surrendered after outsourcing the cleaning activity to private contractor at JOS/AT.

2.10 **Recommendation No.1**

39 posts of Safaiwalas deployed at present at stations where cleanliness activities have been outsourced to private contractors may be surrendered immediately.

2.11 **Recommendation No.2**

10 posts of Safaiwalas are Excess to the cadre, may be redeployed, wherever required.

2.12 **Recommendation No.3**

The cleanliness activity at JOS/AT on Mumbai Division may be outsourced to private contractor, and the 01 post of Safaiwala at JOS/AT remaining after the surrendering of 39 posts as specified in Recommendation No. 1, may also be surrendered.

CHAPTER – III

FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

- 3.1 After carefully scrutinizing the current working scenario of Safaiwalas, the work study team has identified **a total of 39 posts as surplus**.
- 3.2 The work study team has identified **39 *Group-D posts*** as surplus for surrender, all these posts are live posts.

Category	Surplus	Annual saving per person	Total savings
Group-D	39	Rs. 6,45,968/-	Rs. 2,51,92,752/-
Total	39	Rs. 6,45,968/-	Rs. 2,51,92,752/-

- 3.3 On implementation of the recommendations brought out in the work study report annual recurring saving of ***Rs. 251.92 Lakhs*** per annum can be achieved.