



**REVIEW OF STAFF STRENGTH  
OF  
CANTEEN STAFF  
OF  
CARRIAGE WORKSHOP, AJMER**

**(G/HQ/WS/463/20/Mech./Canteen/AII(C)/2018-19)**

**GUIDED BY**

**P. K. MALIK**

**Sr. ADGM & AWSO/NWR/JP**

**STUDIED BY**

**1 KAMLESH KUMAR MEENA CWSI-JP**

**2 PRAKASH GURNANI WSI-JP**

**3 RAJENDRA SINGH KHIRIA WSI-JP**



**WORK STUDY ORGANIZATION  
NORTH WESTERN RAILWAY  
JAIPUR**

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

Sr. No.	20
Study No.	G/HQ/WS/463/20/Canteen Staff/AII(C)/2018-19
Subject	Review of staff strength of Canteen Staff of Carriage Workshop, Ajmer.
Area	Carriage Workshop, Ajmer
Department	General Administration
Terms of Reference	Assessment of Man Power requirement
Present Cadre	Sanctioned cadre = 35 On Roll Staff = 35 Vacancies = 0
Proposed Cadre	0
Projected Surplus Man Power	35
Total No. of Recommendations	1
Financial Implication	Approx. Rs. 176.17 Lac per annum
Month of Circulation	Dec.' 2018

## INDEX

<b>Chapter No.</b>	<b>Contents</b>	<b>Page No.</b>
1	Introduction	4
2	Acknowledgement	5
3	Infrastructure and T&P items	6-7
4	Cadre, duties and deployment of canteen staff	8-9
5	Observation & critical analysis.	10-12
6	Meeting at Officer's level	13
7	Summary of Recommendation	14
8	Financial Implication	15

Indian Railway is the biggest transport organization in India and playing an important role in the development and economy of the country. Along with the Commercial activities, the Railways have to fulfill the social obligations also, especially in the time of natural calamity and towards the weaker sections of the society. For the healthy existence of such an important organization it is necessary to be financially viable, which can be achieved by ensuring optimum utilization of the resources i.e. Man, Material and Machinery.

With the implementation of 7<sup>th</sup> pay commission, **the establishment charges have gone up drastically and hence manpower has become an important factor in bringing economy in the system.** In order to check the cost of manpower, the Railway administration issues guidelines from time to time, in the form of **yardsticks, circulars etc.** **Now-a-days, benchmarking is being utilized to ensure best utilization of manpower. Benchmarking is a continuous process of comparing different units and identifying which one is the best in the business, followed by learning how this excellence was achieved** and then setting out to improve the efficiency of those units, which were left behind. The optimum utilization may further be ensured by **multi skilled use of man power.** With the introduction of **computers in the offices, paper activities has been reduced considerably** resulting in further **possibilities of diminution in manpower has become mandatory** due to lesser manual exercise in all the offices over entire railways.

Productivity has acquired a new and broader meaning in the light of highly competitive economic environment, increasing educational levels, degradation of physical environment and increasing population, creating pressure on the limited available resources.

All efforts should be made to ensure that the revenue is spent carefully over assets, infrastructure and manpower. In other words, Railway administration should curtail wasteful expenditure in operational and maintenance costs so as to bring down the operating ratio which is the prime indicator of Railway's financial efficiency.

Keeping in view of the above mentioned factors, SDGM/NWR has approved the Work Study on review of staff strength of canteen staff of Carriage Workshop, Ajmer.

\*\*\*

**2.1 Coordinating Officials of the department:**

The Study Team expresses its sincere thanks and gratitude to Sh.-Nemi Chand Sivasiya, WPO/Loco Workshop, Ajmer, and Co-coordinator Sh.Raghuveer Singh, APO and Sh.Vikram Singh, Ch.OS(E-1),Loco workshop, Ajmer and also thankful to other staff for their co-operation during the course of study.

**2.2 Terms of Reference:**

This study has been conducted under the following terms of reference:-

- i) Review of staff strength vis-a-vis workload on existing working condition.
- ii) Review of staff strength as per out sourcing basis.

**2.3 Methodology Adopted:**

The following techniques of method study as well as work measurement have been applied to conduct the study:-

- i) Data collection and its critical analysis to arrive on factual status of present working.
- ii) Discussion with officers & subordinates at various levels with a view to produce fruitful results.
- iii) Sample checks and on spot observations.
- iv) Applied out sourcing.

**2.4 Field units visited:**

During the course of work study of canteen staff, the work study team visited at Carriage workshop and Carriage Workshop canteen, Ajmer.

<b>CHAPTER 3</b>	<b>INFRASTRUCTURE &amp; T&amp;P ITEMS</b>
------------------	---

### 3.1 Infrastructure:

Canteen in Loco Workshop is comprise of two big dining halls, one big kitchen, Store, cash counter, distribution counter and office of Manager etc.

### 3.2 List of T&P:

<b>Sr. No.</b>	<b>Name of item</b>	<b>No. of Item</b>
1.	Steel Spoon (small)	34
2.	Table Large(Iron & Steel)	03
3.	Almirah Iron	01
4.	Karahi of Iron	01
5.	Steel Thali Round with 05 part	70
6.	Balan Wooden	09
7.	Bhagone Aluminum ( small & big) with lid	09
8.	Bhagone steel small	03
9.	Tray Aluminum	06
10.	Breakfast Box steel	15
11.	Steel glass (Small & Big)	61
12.	Steel spoon (Big)	08
13.	Steel Thali (collerwali)	18
14.	Iron Knife	02
15.	Wooden Table	01
16.	Fire Bucket	04
17.	Iron pad lock	04
18.	Wooden Takht	01
19.	Steel thermal 05 liter	04
20.	Small gas burner	01
21.	Iron Bhatti with burner	05
22.	Steel Thali	398
23.	Electric weighing machine	03
24.	Chapatti plant	01
25.	Steel bucket	01
26.	Aluminum Parat	08
27.	Gas cylinder big 19 Kgs.	10

28.	Refrigerator	01
29.	Chair	06
30.	LCD	01
31.	Dining table steel	39
32.	Bucket aluminum	02
33.	Iron Tagari	03
34.	Iron Palta	01
35.	Visitor Chair	05
36.	Pressure Cooker 20 ltrs.	01
37.	Iron kadai	03
38.	Tanki Steel	06
39.	Wooden table	03
40.	Crockery –cup	30
41.	Crockery full plate	24
42.	Iron Dustbin	02
43.	Iron Jhari small	01
44.	Plastic Bucket	02
45.	Steel order tray	02
46.	Box Iron	01

\*\*\*

<b>CHAPTER 4</b>	<b>CADRE, DUTIES AND DEPLOYMENT OF CANTEEN STAFF</b>
------------------	--

#### 4.1 Cadre position of staff working at Staff Canteen of Carriage Workshop, Ajmer:

The cadre position of canteen staff working in Staff Canteen of Carriage Workshop, Ajmer provided by Personnel branch on 01.04.2018 is as follows:

Sr. No.	Category	Pay Matrix	Level	SS	OR	Vac.
1.	Manager	25500-81100	L-4	01	01	0
2.	Astt. Manager	19900-63200	L-2	02	02	0
3.	Cook-I / Astt. Cook	21700-69100	L-3	02	0	2
4.	Coupon Clerk	19900-63200	L-2	01	01	0
5.	Tea Boy	18000-56900	L-1	29	29	0
<b>Total</b>				<b>35</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>2</b>

#### 4.2 Duties of staff working at Staff Canteen of Carriage workshop, Ajmer:

##### 4.2.1 Canteen Manager:

Canteen Manager works under supervision of General Administration and is fully responsible to smooth management of Staff Canteen at Carriage Workshop, Ajmer. He is responsible to supervise the canteen staff, to ensure cleaning & sweeping of canteen, maintaining T&P register etc. He provides raw material to canteen workers and keep vigil eyes on their day to day work. He maintains record of daily expenditure and earnings.

##### 4.2.2 Assistant Manager:

He is responsible to ensure in time preparation of tea and breakfast and also ensure in time supply to same at shop floor booth in Carriage Workshop, Ajmer. He maintains sell register and he collects material as per requirement.

##### 4.2.3 Cook-I & Cook-II and Astt. Cook:

They receive raw material and prepare Namkeens, tea, breakfast and lunch (02 type of vegetables, rice & puri/chapatti) as directed by Canteen Manager.

##### 4.2.4 Coupon Clerk:

He issue coupons and collects cash to customer and maintains its record

##### 4.2.5 Tea vendors:

They are responsible for supply of breakfast and tea at shop floor booth in workshop and collect cash & deposit it to manager and other allied works as instructed by Canteen Manager.

They also assist to Cook for cooking foods other works and preparing tea/coffee and serving it to the customers.



### 3.3 Deployment of staff working at Staff canteen of Carriage Workshop, Ajmer:

At present there are 33 staff are deployed to perform work at staff canteen of Carriage Workshop, Ajmer. Description of their deployment is as under:

S. No.	Designation	Number of Staff Deployed	Deployed in Shift (Monday to Saturday)
1.	Canteen Manager	01	07.00 to 16.00
2.	Assistant Canteen Manager	02	06.00 to 15.00
3.	Cook-I and Asst. Cook	0	06.00 to 15.00
4.	Coupon Clerk	01	06.00 to 15.00
5.	Tea Vendors	29	06.00 to 15.00

\*\*\*

**5.0 Expenditure and Earning of Staff Canteen of Carriage Workshop, Ajmer:****5.1 Detail of Earning & Expenditure of Canteen:**

Sr. No.	Month	Income	Expenditure	Loss
1	April'2018	108165	149624	41459
2	May'2018	125636	153168	27532
3	June'2018	121205	165196	43991
4	July'2018	123626	166639	43013
5	Augt.'2018	109851	162752	52901
6	Sept.'2018	106043	153799	47756
<b>Total</b>		<b>694526</b>	<b>951178</b>	<b>256652</b>
<b>Average Per Month</b>			<b>158529.66</b>	<b>42775.33</b>

**5.2 Average Earning per day of Staff Canteen:**

Sr. No.	Item Name	Rate (Rs.)	Average Number of Items Being Sold/ day	Total Earning/ day
1.	Tea (100 ml)	3	45	135
2.	Namkeen (50-70 gram)	3	775	2325
3.	Sakhe	80/Kg	6 Kg	480
4.	Mathari	80/Kg	Nil	0
5.	Petha	80/Kg	2 Kg	160
6.	Besan Barfi	100/Kg	2.250 Kgs	225
7.	Puri	5/	80	400
8.	Puri	2/	40	80
9.	Sabji	2/	20	40
10.	Special Thali	12/	40	480
<b>Total</b>				<b>4325</b>

**5.3 Expenditure on Staff Canteen:**

Sr. No.	Description	Expenditure per day
1.	Presently expenditure on establishment of Canteen staff comes to:	<b>1468083/30</b> <b>=Rs. 48936</b>
2.	Per day average expenditure on consumable raw material :	<b>Rs. 158529.66/25</b>

		<b>=6341.18</b>
3.	Other miscellaneous expenditure like maintenance of Canteen Building, Electric Bill, Staff facilities etc.:	<b>Not include</b>

#### 5.4 Observation:

Under section 46 of the Factories Act-1948, it is essential to provide a statutory canteen for factory staff where more than 250 workers are ordinarily employed and maintained by the employer. Food, snacks, drinks and other items served in a canteen shall be sold on a non-profit basis and the prices being charged shall be subjected to the approval of a canteen managing committee which shall be appointed by the manager and shall consist of an equal number of persons nominated by the employer and elected by the workers. The number of elected workers shall be in the proportion of 1 for every 1000 workers employed in the factory provided that in no case shall there be more than 5 or less than 2 workers on the committee. The committee shall consult from time to time about the quality and quantity of food stuffs to be served in a canteen, the arrangements of the menu etc. In the light of above, canteen in Carriage Workshop, Ajmer is also being run by the Carriage Workshop Administration, Ajmer.

**During the course of work study, it was observed by the Work Study Team that:**

- i) The existing sanctioned strength to operate staff canteen at Carriage Workshop, Ajmer is 35.
- ii) Establishment cost on canteen staff comes to Rupees **48936** per day.
- iii) Average expenditure cost of other materials is Rs. **6341.18** per day.
- iv) Therefore, total expenditure of Staff Canteen at Carriage Workshop, Ajmer is 55277.18 (**48936+6341.18**) plus maintenance cost of the Staff canteen building, cost of electricity being consumed and Staff facilities etc.
- v) Average earning of staff canteen per day is Rs.4325.
- vi) Thus, there is huge gap between expenditure and earning and canteen is being run on the losses.
- vii) In this scenario there is urgent need for looking the alternative mode of operation to run the canteen.
- viii) In the existing model to run the staff canteen at HQ office of NWR at Jaipur there is no need of Railway Staff.

#### 5.5 Critical Analysis:

The work study team has gone through the workload vis-à-vis staff strength of Canteen at Carriage Workshop, Ajmer and discussed the same in detail with Coordinator and Canteen Manager. After thorough analysis, the assessment of the work study team about Staff Canteen at Carriage Workshop, Ajmer is that the major expenditure cost to run the staff canteen is establishment expenditure.

At present staff canteen of HQ office, NWR and staff canteen at all other DRM offices of North Western Railways except for DRM office, Jodhpur are being run by the Staff Benefit Fund committee through outsourcing. The Railway provides building and utensils to the contractor in lieu of which he sells the products on rates approved by the SBF committee.

This is resulting into saving of establishment expenditure, which is major cost to run a staff canteen.

Therefore, it is being advised that the operation of Staff Canteen at Carriage Workshop, Ajmer should be revised and it should be run on the alternative model as Staff canteen as being run at HQ office, NWR/JP and other DRM offices of NWR, so that large amount of expenditure on the establishment can be save.

Under section 46 of the Factories Act-1948, it is essential to provide a statutory canteen for the staff of Railway workshops. **After thorough analysis of Canteen staff by work study team, the team is observed that the establishment cost of the canteen staff is very high. Therefore reduced the establishment cost to explore another mode for running the staff canteen.**

On adopting revised model of operation for staff canteen, where activities will be operated through outsourcing, 35 posts of Manager, Astt. Manager, Cook and Vendors have been considered surplus and advised to surrender forthwith.


### **5.6 Recommendation:**



Looking to the huge expenditure on establishment of Staff Canteen at Carriage Workshop, Ajmer as discussed in Para no.4.1 & 4.4, the work study team is of the opinion that alternative mean of running the staff canteen should be adopted. The Administration should engage the contractor to run the staff canteen. This will save huge establishment cost.

Thus, 35 posts of Manger, Assistant Manager, Cooks and Vendors for staff canteen of Carriage Workshop, Ajmer have been considered surplus and advised to surrender forthwith.


**Minutes of meeting with work study team and officers of Ajmer Workshop on 16.11.2018**

1. The Work Study Team has briefed the recommendation of study to Dy.CME (C) and WPO/AII.
2. CWM/AII and WPO/AII agreed with the recommendation of Work Study Report.
3. CWM/AII and WPO/AII has shown their concern for the success of alternative model of operating staff canteen.
4. This has been agreed that first this alternative model of operating staff canteen will be adopted at Staff canteen of Carriage workshop and on seeing the success this model, it will be implemented at Loco workshop as well.
5. Thus, 35 posts of Canteen staff will be surrendered on outsourcing and successful running of staff canteen activity at Carriage workshop, Ajmer.

WPO/AII   
 Work Study Team

- (1)  WST/AII/13/18  
 (2)  WST/AII/13/18



  
 Dy.CME (C)/AH

<b>CHAPTER 7</b>	<b>SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATION</b>
------------------	----------------------------------

<b>Sr. No.</b>	<b>RECOMMENDATION</b>	<b>Para no.</b>	<b>Accepting/ Implementing Authority</b>
<b>1</b>	<p><b>Recommendation no.-1:</b></p> <p>Looking to the huge expenditure on establishment of Staff Canteen at Carriage Workshop, Ajmer as discussed in Para no.4.1 &amp; 4.4, the work study team is of the opinion that alternative mean of running the staff canteen should be adopted. The Administration should engage the contractor to run the staff canteen. This will save huge establishment cost.</p> <p>Thus, 35 posts of Manger, Astd. Manager, Cook and Vendors for staff canteen of Carriage Workshop, Ajmer have been considered surplus and advised to surrender forthwith.</p>	4.6	<b>CWM/AII</b>

<b>CHAPTER 8</b>	<b>FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS</b>
------------------	-------------------------------

The proposal for surrender of **35 posts of canteen staff** will lead to the recurring savings INR **176.17 Lac** per annum. The bifurcation of the money value is as under:-

Sr. No.	Category	Pay Band	Level	Mean Pay	DA 9%	Total Pay	No. of posts	Total Saving per month (Rs.)	Total Saving per year (Rs.)
1	Canteen Manager	25500-81100	L-4	53300	4797	58097	1	58097	697164
2	Cook-I	21700-69100	L-3	45400	4086	49486	1	49486	593832
3	Astt. Manager Coupon Clerk	19900-63200	L-2	41550	3740	45290	3	135870	1630440
4	Canteen Vendor, Astt. Cook	18000-56900	L-1	37450	3371	40821	30	1224630	14695560
Total							35	1468083	17616996