

Comparative Work Study of Activity Centres of Personnel Department of BB & FZR Division.

Officers

Shri. Rajesh Sahani

Secretary (PG)

Shri. R. Subramaniam

Dy. Secy & APIO

Inspectors

Santosh Handore

WSI/BB

Shiv Shankar Raut

WSI/HQ

Pradip Kalal

WSI/BB

Synopsis Of The Study

Study Number	: WSCR/BM/PERS/BB-FZR/03/18-19
Name of Study	: Comparative Work Study of Benchmarking MPR of Personnel Department of BB & FZR Division.
Proposed by	: E&R Directorate, Rly Board
Department	: Personnel
Division	: Mumbai & Firozpur
Date of Commencement	: 06.06.2018
Date of Completion	: 25.06.2018
Date of Submission	: 18.07.2018
No. of Recommendations	: 2
Sanctioned Strength	: BB – 485 FZR - 148
No. of Men studied	: BB – 393 FZR - 119
No. of vacancies	: BB – 92 FZR - 29

INDEX

No.	Contents	Page No.
1	Terms Of Reference, Base of Study and Methodology	4
2	Summary of Observations and Suggestions	5
3	Calculation of MPR of Mumbai and Firozpur Division	6
4	Critical Analysis of variation in MPR of Mumbai and Firozpur Division	11
5	Observations and Suggestions to improve MPR	12

Terms of Reference

A Comparative Work Study of Activity Centers having highest and lowest benchmark MPR is proposed by Railway Board vide letter number

2017/E&R/2(1)/1 dated 22.05.2018. Work Study Cell of Central Railway has been advised to conduct the comparative work study of Two Activity Centers of Personnel Department of Mumbai Division/CR and Firozpur Division/NR (for Divisions > 18000 Staff).

The Work Study is included in Work Study Program for the Year 2018-19 under reference number WSCR/BM/PERS/BB-FZR/03/18-19.

Base for Study

Comparative Work Study for Staff of Personnel Department of Mumbai Division/CR and Firozpur Division/NR is proposed on the basis of these activity centers having highest and lowest benchmark MPR.

As per Benchmarking Statistics issued by the Railway Board in February'2018, Benchmark MPR of Mumbai Division/CR for personnel Department is 12.71 men/'000 staff and Benchmark MPR of Firozpur Division/NR is 5.51 men/'000 staff.

Methodology

1. Collection of data with reference to the calculation of Man Power Ratio of Personnel Departments of respective Divisions.
2. Collection of factors affecting the MPR of Mumbai Division as well as Firozpur Division.
3. Calculation of MPR of Mumbai and Firozpur Division.
4. Critical Analysis of variation in MPR of Mumbai and Firozpur Division.
5. Observations and Suggestions to improve MPR.

Summary of observations

Following observations are made for the variation in Benchmark MPR in Personnel Department of Mumbai Division and Firozpur Division,

Firozpur Division:

1. Most of the activities required to be carried out by Personnel Department like pay sheet preparation, SR maintenance, Mileage, OT, NDA, NHA verification, issue of Pass/PTO etc. are being done by Non Personnel staff in various depots except for three major departments, viz. Traffic, Commercial and Personnel of Firozpur Division.
2. Computerisations of some important sections like Pass, General, PNM, Single Window, Quarter, Selection Cell and Welfare, etc.

Mumbai Division:

1. There is a wide difference in the work practices being followed by Mumbai division vis-a-vis Firozpur division. This can be attributed to various factors like geographical and topographical reasons, work culture, density of traffic and the overall dynamics governing the operations and working of Railways at Mumbai. It is needless to mention that Personnel department of Mumbai caters to more than 100 stations including suburban stations.
2. The Personnel branch of Mumbai division also caters to the requirement of five major Electric and Loco Sheds at Kalyan, Kurla, Sanpada, Kalwa, Kurla and Kalyan Diesel shed.
3. All Establishment activities are being carried out by the staff of Personnel department unlike the staff of Firozpur Division.
4. Duplication of work being carried out by the staff working in the depots as well as in the Divisional office in core activities like pay sheet preparation, maintenance of leave account, pay fixation etc.
5. Lack of Computerisation in some of the sections like Pass and Single window system, etc.

Summary of Suggestions

Following steps are suggested for achieving better MPR in Personnel department of Mumbai Division,

1. Decentralisation of tasks which can be locally carried out at depots by exploring the feasibility of providing IPASS connectivity so as to avoid duplication of work and ensuring optimum utilisation of manpower.
2. Multi skilling of Clerical work may be adopted to achieve optimum utilisation of Personnel Staff as adopted by Ratlam Division of Western Railway.
3. Computerisation of entire establishment activities in Personnel department of Mumbai division may be considered.

Chapter 1

Calculation of MPR of Mumbai and Firozpur Division

1.0 Benchmark MPR for Personnel: As per the benchmarking norms issued by E&R Directorate, Railway Board in Feb' 2018, Man Power Ratio of Personnel Department in Mumbai Division/CR and Firozpur Division/NR is given in following table, (for Divisions > 18000 Staff)

Division	MPR of Personnel Dept
Mumbai Division	12.71 men/'000 staff
Firozpur Division	5.51 men/'000 staff

It can be seen that lowest MPR is in Personnel Department of Firozpur Division that is 5.51 men per 1000 staff, while the same in Mumbai Division Central Railway is 12.71 men per 1000 staff.

1.1 Formulae for MPR: Above benchmarking MPR is derived by obtaining the ratio of 'Total Men on Roll' and 'Divisional Staff Strength' by applying the following formula.

$$\text{MPR} = \frac{\text{Total Men on Roll}}{\text{Divisional Staff Strength}}$$

Where, 'Total man on roll in Personnel department' includes all officers, Group C & D staff of Personnel Department except staff engaged in Hindi Organisation.

1.2 Proforma: The Proforma for calculation of Man Power Ratio (MPR) for Personnel Department for Divisions having $\geq 18,000$ staff is as under,

Sr. No.	Name of Division	Total Men on Roll	Divisional Staff Strength	MPR (Pers. On Roll per '000 staff)
1	Mumbai Division	393	36748	10.69
2	Firozpur Division	119	24712	4.81

Above Proforma is utilised for calculation of MPR i.e. Staff on Roll in Personnel Department against Divisional Staff Strength.

1.3 Methodology: For assessments of the reason for such wide variation in benchmark Man power Ratio, Work Study team collected data from the concerned Divisions in regard to Sanctioned Strength and Men on roll of Personnel department including all officers, Group C & D staff except staff engaged in Hindi Organisation along with Re-engaged Retired Railways staff & Contractual staff.

The Divisional Staff strength of various department and Units of a Division, forms the workload for staff of Personnel department. Therefore, the details of Divisional staff strength of Officers, Group 'C' staff & Group 'D' staff that is being catered by Personnel Department are collected for assessment of MPR ratio.

In addition to this, the data related to activities carried out in-house and number of staff deployed, activities out sourced, best practices of the centre, practices need to be improved, practices/activities which may be further outsourced were also collected for assessment of such variation in MPR of said Divisions.

1.4 Man Power Ratio Calculation: Man power ratio for Personnel Department of Mumbai Division and Firozpur Division is calculated in following paragraphs.

1.4.1 **Mumbai Division:** Scale Check of Personnel department and Divisional Staff strength of Mumbai Division is as under,

Scale Check of Personnel Department:

Sr.	Cadre	Sanctioned Strength	Man On Roll	Vacancies
1	Officers	8	8	0
2	Group 'C' Staff	427	326	101
3	Group 'D' Staff	50	59	+9
Total		485	393	92

Divisional Staff strength of Mumbai Division is as under

Department	Sanctioned Strength	Men On Roll	Vacancies	Pay Sheet preparation/Service Record maintained by
Commercial	4649	4197	452	Personnel Department
Electrical	7133	5700	1433	Personnel Department
Engineering (Supervisory staff)	430	338	92	Personnel Department
Engineering (Artisan staff)	505	281	224	Only promotion issues
Engineering (Others)	6465	4992	1473	Not maintained by Personnel Department
General Admin	455	341	114	Personnel Department
Mechanical	4277	3500	777	Personnel Department
Medical	1595	1281	314	Personnel Department
Operating	8634	7484	1150	Personnel Department
Personnel	485	393	92	Personnel Department
S&T	2120	1657	463	Personnel Department
Total	36748	30164	6584	

Total Men on Roll of Personnel Staff is 393 and Divisional Staff Strength being catered by Personnel Department is 36748. Thus, the Benchmarking MPR of Personnel Department of Mumbai Division is 10.69 personnel per 1000 staff.

1.4.2 **Firozpur Division:** Scale check of Personnel department and Divisional Staff strength is as under,

Scale Check of Personnel Department:

Sr.	Cadre	Sanctioned Strength	Man On Roll	Vacancies
1	Officers	6	5	1
2	Group 'C' Staff	141	114	27
3	Group 'D' Staff	01	0	1
Total		148	119	29

Divisional Staff strength of Firozpur Division is as under

Department	Sanctioned Strength	Men On Roll	Vacancies	Pay Sheet preparation/Service Record maintained by
Accounts	123	101	22	No
Commercial	1883	1491	392	Yes
Electrical	2652	2092	560	Pay sheet prepared by Non-Personnel Staff. SR maintained by Personnel Staff
Engineering (Supervisory staff)	295	253	42	Pay sheet prepared by Non-Personnel Staff. SR & Leave account maintained by Personnel Staff
Engineering (Artisan staff)	7485	6434	1051	Pay sheet prepared by Non-Personnel Staff. SR maintained by Non Personnel Staff
General Admin	124	108	16	Yes
Mechanical	5899	5139	760	Pay sheet prepared & Leave Account Maintained by Non-Personnel Staff. SR maintained by Personnel Staff
Medical	541	488	53	Pay sheet prepared & Leave Account maintained by Non-Personnel Staff (Except CHI Staff).SR & Leave Account maintained by Non Personnel Staff
Operating	2807	2474	333	Pay sheet prepared & SR maintained by Personnel Staff. Leave account maintained by Non-Personnel Staff
Personnel	148	119	29	Pay sheet prepared, leave Account & SR maintained by Personnel Staff
S&T	1061	986	75	Pay sheet prepared by Non-Personnel Staff. SR maintained by Personnel Staff
Security	1667	1433	234	No
Stores	27	11	16	Pay sheet prepared by Non-Personnel Staff. SR maintained by Personnel Staff
Total	24712	21129	3583	

Total Men on Roll of Personnel Staff is 119 and Divisional Staff Strength being catered by Personnel Department is 24712. Thus, the Benchmarking MPR of Personnel Department of Firozpur Division is 04.81 personnel per 1000 staff.

1.5 Summary: On the basis of the data provided in above para 1.4 and the Proforma as per para 1.2 the calculation of MPR for Personnel Department of Mumbai Division and Firozpur Division are given in the table below,

Sr. No.	Name of Division	Total Men on Roll	Divisional Staff Strength	MPR (Pers. On Roll per '000 staff)
1	Mumbai Division	393	36748	10.69
2	Firozpur Division	119	24712	04.81

It is observed from the statistics provided that the establishment related activities of departments like Accounts, Engineering and Security of FZR Division are carried out by their own department. Similarly in Mumbai division establishment related activities like pay sheet preparation, maintenance of Service Record of 6465 staff including Track Maintainer, Mali, RHA, Safaiwala & Helper staff is done by Engineering Department itself by their Non Personnel staff. Hence the sanctioned strength of these departments may not be considered as a work load of Personnel department of Mumbai & Firozpur Divisions. Therefore, the sanctioned strength of these departments will be further reduced resulting in further variation in benchmark ratios presently indicated.

- Revised Divisional Staff strength of Mumbai Division is as under,

Department	Sanctioned Strength	Men On Roll	Vacancies	Pay Sheet preparation/ Service Record maintained by
Commercial	4649	4197	452	Personnel Department
Electrical	7133	5700	1433	Personnel Department
Engineering (Supervisory staff)	430	338	92	Personnel Department
Engineering (Artisan staff)	505	281	224	Only promotion cases
General Admin	455	341	114	Personnel Department
Mechanical	4277	3500	777	Personnel Department
Medical	1595	1281	314	Personnel Department
Operating	8634	7484	1150	Personnel Department
Personnel	485	393	92	Personnel Department
S&T	2120	1657	463	Personnel Department
Total	30283	25172	5111	

Total Men on Roll of Personnel Staff is 393 and revised Divisional Staff Strength being catered by Personnel Department is 30283. Thus, the Benchmarking MPR of Personnel Department of Mumbai Division is 12.97 Personnel per 1000 staff.

- Revised Divisional Staff strength of Firozpur Division is as under,

Department	Sanctioned Strength	Men On Roll	Vacancies	Pay Sheet preparation/Service Record maintained by
Commercial	1883	1491	392	Pay sheet prepared, leave Account & SR maintained by Personnel Staff
Electrical	2652	2092	560	Pay sheet prepared by Non-Personnel Staff. SR maintained by Personnel Staff
Engineering (Supervisory staff)	295	253	42	Pay sheet prepared by Non-Personnel Staff. SR & Leave account maintained by Personnel Staff
General Admin	124	108	16	Pay sheet prepared, leave Account & SR maintained by Personnel Staff
Mechanical	5899	5139	760	Pay sheet prepared & Leave Account Maintained by Non-Personnel Staff. SR maintained by Personnel Staff
Operating	2807	2474	333	Pay sheet prepared & SR maintained by Personnel Staff. Leave account maintained by Non-Personnel Staff
Personnel	148	119	29	Pay sheet prepared, leave Account & SR maintained by Personnel Staff
S&T	1061	986	75	Pay sheet prepared by Non-Personnel Staff. SR maintained by Personnel Staff
Stores	27	11	16	Pay sheet prepared by Non-Personnel Staff. SR maintained by Personnel Staff
Total	14896	12673	2223	

Total Men on Roll of Personnel Staff is 119 and revised Divisional Staff Strength being catered by Personnel Department is 14896. Thus, the Benchmarking MPR of Personnel Department, Firozpur Division is 7.98 Personnel per 1000 staff.

1.6 On the basis of revision of sanctioned strength, the MPR ratio for Personnel Department of Mumbai Division and Firozpur Division can be summarised as below:

MPR Ratio as Per para 1.5				
Sr. No.	Name of Division	Total Men on Roll	Divisional Staff Strength	MPR (Pers. On Roll per '000 staff)
1	Mumbai Division	393	36748	10.69
2	Firozpur Division	119	24712	04.81
Revised MPR Ratio*				
Sr. No.	Name of Division	Total Men on Roll	Divisional Staff Strength	MPR (Pers. On Roll per '000 staff)
1	Mumbai Division	393	30283	12.97
2	Firozpur Division	119	14896	7.98

- *Revised MPR Ratio is arrived at, excluding the Sanctioned Strength of Engineering, Accounts & Security department of FZR Division and excluding Sanctioned Strength of Engineering (other) department of Mumbai Division.

Chapter 2

Critical Analysis of variation in MPR of Mumbai and Firozpur Division

- 1.1 Based on the Calculation in para 1.6 the MPR of Firozpur Division is 7.98 whereas the MPR of Mumbai Division is 12.97 Personnel per 1000 staff. For assessment and critical analysis of the variation in this MPR between Firozpur and Mumbai Division, work study team has gone through the procedure of working and other conditions affecting the workload of Personnel department.

1.2 Factors affecting the MPR of Firozpur Division

Following points are noted by work study team for comparative less MPR in Firozpur.

1. Most of the activities carried out by Personnel Department like pay sheet preparation, SR maintenance, Mileage, OT, NDA,NHA verification, issue of Pass/PTO etc. are done by Non Personnel staff in various depots except of Traffic, Commercial and Personnel Branch staff of Firozpur Division.
2. Fully Computerisation in pass section, General section, PNM section, Single Window section, Quarter Section, Selection Section & Welfare Section.

2.2 Factors affecting the MPR of Mumbai Division

In comparison to above, Mumbai Division has higher MPR than that of Firozpur, due to following reasons,

1. All Establishment activities are carried out by Personnel department Staff of Mumbai Division.
2. Duplication of work by both Staff deployed at Depots as well as Staff deployed at Divisional office in establishment activities like preparation of pay sheet, Making entries in Service Register, leave account maintenance, pay fixation in promotion & MACP which is done at depot clerk and verification of the same done at Divisional office.
3. Less or No use of Computer in some sections like Pass section and Single window system section.

From the above comparison between Mumbai and Firozpur Division, it can be seen that due to optimum utilisation of staff in regards to available workload and better utilisation of computerisation, MPR ratio of Firozpur Division is relatively lower than that of Mumbai Division.

Chapter 3

Observation and Suggestions to improve MPR

- 3.0 On the basis of critical analysis of the variation in MPR of Personnel departments of Firozpur and Mumbai Division following observation and recommendations are made by Work study team.

1.1. Observation:

It is observed that, the difference in MPRs of Mumbai Division and Firozpur Division is due to following reasons,

Firozpur Division:

3. Most of the activities required to be carried out by Personnel Department like pay sheet preparation, SR maintenance, Mileage, OT, NDA, NHA verification, issue of Pass/PTO etc. are being done by Non Personnel staff in various depots except for three major departments, viz. Traffic, Commercial and Personnel of Firozpur Division.
4. Computerisations of some important sections like Pass, General, PNM, Single Window, Quarter, Selection Cell and Welfare, etc.

Mumbai Division:

6. There is a wide difference in the work practices being followed by Mumbai division vis-a-vis Firozpur division. This can be attributed to various factors like geographical and topographical reasons, work culture, density of traffic and the overall dynamics governing the operations and working of Railways at Mumbai. It is needless to mention that Personnel department of Mumbai caters to more than 100 stations including suburban stations.
7. The Personnel branch of Mumbai division also caters to the requirement of five major Electric and Loco Sheds at Kalyan, Kurla, Sanpada, Kalwa, Kurla and Kalyan Diesel shed.
8. All Establishment activities are being carried out by the staff of Personnel department unlike the staff of Firozpur Division.
9. Duplication of work being carried out by the staff working in the depots as well as in the Divisional office in core activities like pay sheet preparation, maintenance of leave account, pay fixation etc.
10. Lack of Computerisation in some of the sections like Pass and Single window system, etc.

1.2. Suggestions:

Following steps are suggested for achieving better MPR in Personnel department of Mumbai Division,

4. Decentralisation of tasks which can be locally carried out at depots by exploring the feasibility of providing IPASS connectivity so as to avoid duplication of work and ensuring optimum utilisation of manpower.
5. Multi skilling of Clerical work may be adopted to achieve optimum utilisation of Personnel Staff as adopted by Ratlam Division of Western Railway.
6. Computerisation of entire establishment activities in Personnel department of Mumbai division may be considered.

----- End of Report -----